ความสามารถและข้อความที่ปรากฏในวารสารฉบับนี้เป็นของผู้เขียนไม่ใช่ของคณะรัฐศาสตร์ จุฬาลงกรณ์มหาวิทยาลัย

บทความทุกเรื่องที่ตีพิมพ์ในวารสารจะผ่านการประเมินจากผู้ทรงคุณวุฒิ (peer review) ในสาขาที่เกี่ยวข้อง จำนวน 2 - 3 คน ตามกระบวนการที่กองบรรณาธิการกำหนด
Southeast Asia is a region in rapid economic, social, political and cultural transition. In this region diverse forms of community-level cooperation over land and natural resources such as fisheries and forests can be easily seen. They appear to be common practices among local communities. As such, they have moved beyond the dichotomy of state-led development versus liberalized market economy: ordinary people should be central actors when it comes to decision-making on matters that affect their lives.

At the state level, Southeast Asian governments, with a deepening commitment to regional collaboration, have been attempting to cooperate with one another through the 2015 ASEAN Economic Community’s blueprint, which involves issues of regional economic integration, shared skilled labor resources, comprehensive regional security, shared norms and values on the protection and promotion of human rights, good governance and environment sustainability. At the same time, civil society in the region has often challenged or engaged with the ASEAN governments, pushing for stronger regional norms, such as on political and civil rights and addressing the social and environmental costs of economic growth.

In this volume of *Journal of Social Sciences*, scholars and practitioners who are interested in and concerned about the commons in ASEAN and beyond share their insights and experiences. Each article offers innovative and transformative perspectives on development, international relations and human rights. As a whole, these nine articles provide greater focus on local, national and regional issues that will help enlarge our understanding of ASEAN and beyond, promote deeper public participation in decision-making, strengthen political accountability and ensure social and environmental justice. Thematically, they can be divided into articles that deal with political, economic, social and environmental issues.

Beginning with the political theme is Associate Professor Sida Sornsri’s book review of Amitav Acharya’s *The Making of Southeast Asia* in which she critically examines the concepts of regionalism and regional identity as well as the international politics of Southeast Asia and its efforts to create a common identity. Comparison between European Union and ASEAN regionalism is also broached in this review essay.

Second in this theme is “Revisiting democratization in Myanmar and Indonesia from a comparative perspective” by Nguyen Thi Anh Thu. This article assesses the transition from authoritarian rule to democracy in the region by using Myanmar and Indonesia as case studies. It provides a comparative and historical study of the dynamism of democratization in contemporary Southeast Asia, which further enriches our knowledge of authoritarian regimes in Southeast Asia.
The third and fourth articles deal with energy security in the economic sphere. Yeji Yoo’s “Renewable energy development and environmental justice in Thailand: A case of biomass power plant in Roi-Et” assesses the policies and practices of renewable energy development and biomass power projects in Northeast Thailand from the perspective of environmental justice. In comparison, Thita Orn-in’s “The emergence of Public-Private-Social Partnership (PPSP) in Very Small Power Producer (VSPP) industry: A case study of Mae Jo Micro-Hydro Power project: The implication for Environmental Governance” explores a micro-hydro power project and its implication for environmental governance at the community level. She examines the challenges caused by government policy that excludes local participation and civil society’s engagement with energy policy.

The fifth article tackles human-trafficking and migration. Fatimana Agustinanto’s “Social enterprise and promotion of safe migration among returned migrants: Case study of a credit union in Bone district of South Sulawesi province” analyzes the involvement of civil society groups in promoting safe migration and the role of a credit union in providing better economic security. This article proposes that four important factors, namely economic security, marital status, age and gender, deeply impact returned migrants’ decision on whether they will continue to migrate in the future or reintegrate back into their respective community.

The sixth article by Yee Kai Ling (Phoebe) is on social movements, civil society and the public sphere. It is entitled “Christian faith-based development: A case study of World Vision Foundation of Thailand in Karen hill tribe communities.” It examines faith-based development organizations, how their religious identity, values and beliefs impact development practice, and how transformational development’s concept influences development programs, organizational culture as well as social and cultural contexts.

The remaining three articles are related to education. In “Thailand’s move from a pity to a rights-based understanding of disability” Michelle Proyer observes the role disability plays in Thailand’s recent educational policy development. She looks at how it affects children in elementary school settings, conditions for legislation changes, general perception and social attitudes in relation to policy changes from a pity-based understanding to a rights-based approach in educational policy. In ‘Transformative pedagogy: An evaluation of the use of the Learning to Live Together (LTLT) principles in higher secondary schools in Thailand” Maura Cusack evaluates the implementation of UNESCO’s concept of Learning to Live Together in the social studies classroom. She does this by examining the curriculum texts as well as the teacher’s style of pedagogy.

Lastly is Claudine Claridad Tanvir’s “Education for disaster risk reduction toward change: The case of the ‘Climate Change Academy’ in Albay province, Philippines.” She examines the contribution of the government-led education program on climate change adaptation and
disaster risk reduction and management training for community resilience building. Relying on a socio-ecological model of change and organizational behavior concepts, this article evaluates the factors that contribute to people’s behavioral changes. It also examines how the concept of Education for Disaster Risk Reduction (EDRR) was carried out, especially in relation to the process of building capacities and skills in reducing disaster risks in the community resilience building effort.

Naruemon Thabchumpon

Soravis Jayanama

Editors
# Contents

## Academic Articles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Revisiting democratization in Myanmar and Indonesia from a comparative perspective</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nguyen Thi Anh Thu</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Renewable energy development and environmental justice in Thailand: A case of biomass power plant in Roi-Et province</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yeji Yoo</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The emergence of Public-Private-Social Partnership (PPSP) in Very Small Power Producer (VSPP) industry: A case study of Mae Jo Micro-Hydro Power project: The implication for environmental governance</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thita Orn-in</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social enterprise and promotion of safe migration among returned migrants: Case studies of a credit union in Bone district of South Sulawesi province Indonesia</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatimana Agustinanto</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christian faith-based development: A case study of World Vision Foundation of Thailand in Karen hill tribe communities</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yee Kai Ling, Phoebe</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand’s move from a pity to a rights-based understanding of disability</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michelle Proyer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transformative pedagogy: An evaluation of the use of the Learning to Live Together (LTLT) principles in higher secondary schools in Thailand</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muara Cusack</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Claudine Claridad Tanvir</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Education for disaster risk reduction toward change:  
The case of the ‘Climate Change Academy’ in Albay province, Philippines  
Claudine Claridad Tanvir

Book Review Essay

Sida Sornsri
Revisiting democratization in Myanmar and Indonesia from a comparative perspective*

Thu Thi Anh Nguyen**
nguyenthianhthu270189@gmail.com

Abstract

Southeast Asia is one of the most interesting spots for democratization in the world today. The regional diversity is made up by: Indonesia, the world’s third largest democratic nation, the Philippines, Asia’s oldest democracy, and the consolidated democracies of Malaysia, Thailand, and other types of authoritarian rule. Besides this diversity, the transition from authoritarian rule to democracy in the region also attracts academic attention. Myanmar and Indonesia are good examples of the political transformation from the authoritarianism under the military government to democratic forms of government. However, after the resignation of Ne-Win in 1988, Burma still remained a military dictatorship, while Indonesia, after 21 years (1967-1998) under the authoritarian Suharto-led New Order government, successfully transitioned to a democratic society. The aim of this paper is to explore the different patterns of political transitions under two military dictatorships in Southeast Asia. This qualitative paper draws on documentary review, historical narratives and the critical analysis of theories in authoritarianism, democratization from different perspectives, including political culture, economic growth and crisis, political elites, class conflict, civil society and globalization. The paper found that the military junta, civilian leadership, economic development, social class, and political leaders are key factors that led to the different paths in democratic transition in the two countries. This comparative study seeks to understand the dynamics of contemporary democratization in this rapidly changing region, and contributes to improving the knowledge of authoritarian regimes in Southeast Asia.

Keywords: democratization, transition, Southeast Asia, Myanmar, Indonesia

* This article is developed from a paper presented in the 3rd International Conference on International Relations and Development (ICIRD 2013) on “Beyond the Borders: Building a Regional Commons” at Chulalongkorn University, 22-23 August 2013.
** Lecturer at the College of Foreign Languages, Department of International Studies, Hue University, Vietnam
Introduction

Southeast Asia is one of the most interesting regions for democratization in the world today. The regional diversity is made up by the world’s third largest democratic nation - Indonesia; Asia’s oldest democracy - the Philippines; the consolidated democracy of Malaysia, as well as Thailand, and many authoritarian governments. Besides this diversity, the transition from authoritarian rule to democracy in the region also attracts academic attention. Myanmar and Indonesia are good examples of the political transformation from authoritarianism under the military government to a more democratic form of government.

However, after the resignation of Ne-Win in 1988, Burma remained a military dictatorship. While Indonesia on the other hand, successfully made a transition to a democratic society after 21 years (1967-1998) under the authoritarian Suharto-led New Order Government. The aim of this paper is to explore the different patterns of political transitions under two military dictatorships in Southeast Asia. This paper draws on documentary review, historical narratives and critical analysis of theories in authoritarianism, democratization from different perspectives, including political and economic culture.

According to Samuel Huntington (1991), the world has experienced three waves of democratization. Firstly, the American Revolution in the 19th century swept across the world and ended at the conclusion of the First World War. The second wave of democratization was marked by the victory of the Allies in the Second World War in 1945. Lastly, the third wave of democratization saw the end of dictatorships in Spain, Greece, and Portugal from 1974 to 1976. Interestingly, the three waves of democratization had a complicated impact on different countries and regions (Linz and Stepan 1996, 5-14). In 1979, military regimes were present in fourteen Sub-Saharan African, nine Latin American, five Arabian, three Southeast Asian, one East Asian, and two South Asian countries. Fortunately, in the past three decades, there has been a global trend of democratic transition which is indicated by the decline of military government and military democratization (Alagappa 2001). How is the picture of democratization when it comes to Southeast Asia?

In the post-Cold War period, the political agenda in Indonesia bears striking similarities to Myanmar. The two countries in the region underwent the most extreme level of authoritarian government – military regime which has dominated in the political system after the parliament democracy collapsed in the 1950s in both countries. Practically, General Ne Win was in power in Myanmar for over two decades (1962-88) and General Suharto was the president in Indonesia for over three decades (1967-98). Following the resignation of the leaders, Indonesia transitioned to a democratic country, while Myanmar’s politics are still under the domination of the military government until now (Carnegie 2010). There are several factors to explain the different pattern of political transitions and the success level of democratization efforts.
The observation democratization motivates one to investigate the following research questions:

1. Why did Burma not become a democratic country after the resignation of Ne Win in 1988, unlike Indonesia which became a democratic country after the resignation of Suharto in 1998?

2. Why similar dictatorial regimes led to contrasting patterns of political transition?

With these questions in mind, this study immediately aims to compare democratization politics in Myanmar and Indonesia by exploring the different patterns of political transitions under two military dictatorships. To answer these questions, the first part elaborates a conceptual framework of democratization. It also views democratization from major schools of thoughts. Based on theoretical backgrounds, part Two sheds light on the democratic evolution in two countries and justifies why the democratization in Myanmar following the resignation of Ne Win in 1988 did not lead to the democratic government like what happened in Indonesia after the downfall of Suharto in 1998. Part Three concludes by drawing lessons learnt on the current democratic movement in Myanmar from the experience of Indonesia.

Conceptual Framework

- These following are the conceptual definitions which being used to give better understanding on the issue:

- **Authoritarianism:** Authoritarian ideology is adopted to analyze the militarism in Myanmar and Indonesia. Authoritarianism refers to the form of government in which the elites hold power with or without popular recognition of their legitimacy (Heywood 2002). In authoritarian government, the power is distributed among political, economic, military and clerical elites while citizen’s voice is rarely heard. Among the different forms of authoritarian regime, military junta is categorized as the most extreme level. One typical characteristic of military rule is that civilian politicians are replaced by the members of the armed forces, which ultimately results in militarism. Due to monopoly of weapon usage and coercive power, military junta can directly intervene into political affairs and military force is predominantly and aggressively used to serve national policy (Heywood 2002). This coincides with Alagappa (2001)’s observation of the militarism development in Southeast Asia. Whenever conflicts come up and go beyond the control of civilian government, the armed forces will be used to keep national unity.

- **Democratization Theory:** From this perspective, the role of civil society is a prerequisite for successful democratic movements. Dahl, R. (2005) emphasizes that democracy not only requires the civilian control of the armed force but also the participation of civil society in representative government (Letki, N. 2004). In this way, successful democratization results from the activities of different groups in civil society. Among these groups, the recognition of opposition parties counts. The question is that whether that leaders and bureaucrats in civilian government should be clever at communicating with the public (Ricci and Fitch 1990).
Modernization Theory: The modernization theory argues that there is a strong link between structural factor such as economic development and political change. Modernization, as Gasiorowski (1995: 882) points out, refers to “level of per capita income, the extent of literacy and education, the degree of urbanization, and the quality and extent of communications media”. Out of these factors, economic growth level is influential on the regime change. To make it clear, when an economic crisis happens, there is a likelihood that a political change will follow to eliminate the current government that was not capable of managing the country (Carnegie 2010) (Huntington 1991b). The impacts of economic crisis will be studied in later parts.

Strategic Choice Theory: While the structural factors such as the strength of opposition party and civil society, economic growth can lead to democratic change as they have been discussed in the democratization theory and modernization theory, Strategy Choice Theory holds actor-oriented approaches to recognize the importance of political choices made by political leaders in democratic transitions. Democracy can evolve when political leaders are willing to make a reform.

Model of Social Origins of Dictatorship and Democracy: In his theory, Moore (1966) insists on the relations between landowners and bourgeoisie in agriculture, among whom the middle class plays the key role in democratization process, especially the nation-building. He suggests that a society where middle class are the majority of the population is more likely to be democratic while a regime with a domination of landlords and bourgeoisie appears to be a dictatorship. This traditional view of class relational model emphasizes the role and competence of the middle class in regime formation.

Democratization is not equivalent to democracy. Democracy should be understood as the most expected institution that is only established by the process of democratization. Generally, this process involves two stages as follows:

Democratic Transition: Democratic transition starts when the authoritarian government collapses and lasts until democratic institutions are established (Linz and Stepan 1978). At this point, the dynamics of democratic transitions depend on not only structural factors but also strategic choice or negotiation made by politicians (O’Donnell et al. 1986). This justifies why democratic transitions are actor-oriented. Secondly, the outcome of process also depends on the modes of transition, ranging from the unilateral manner to violence to a multilateral compromise or negotiation (Karl and Schmitter 1991). In this process, the attitudes of authoritarian elites, the dynamics of dominant actors and the opposition party significantly affects the result (Mainwaring, O’Donnell and Valenzuela 1992).

Democratic Consolidation: The fundamental idea of this stage is establishing institutional arrangements and sustaining them. According to Przeworski (1991), democratic consolidation truly occurs when all political groups recognize the legitimacy of its political institutions and totally trust their leadership.
in maximizing citizen’s interests. Schedler, A. (1998) notes nine remarkable characteristics of an effective democratic consolidation: widespread recognition of political institutions; fixed electoral rules; radical judicial reform; popular democratic values; marginalized anti-system actors; strong civilian rule over the military; removed authoritarian ruling; party system development, and stabilized economy.

On the other hand, Huntington points out that the dynamics of democratic consolidation is determined by the fact that whether the newly established social and political structures are able to contribute to maintain its legitimacy. In this sense, Ethier, D. (1990)) identifies the facilitating factors in the democratic consolidation, namely transition mode, economic growth, civil society dynamics, and institutional arrangements. All these factors are reflected in the following theories to study democratization in Indonesia and Myanmar.

Based on the theoretical background, the author tends to adopt a conceptual framework to illustrate the hypothesis of the paper as follows:

**Figure 1** Conceptual Framework of Influential Factors in Democratization
in Myanmar in 1988 and Indonesia in 1998

---

**Findings by Comparison**

Both Indonesia and Myanmar have many similarities in undergoing democratization process with a different time period in which Indonesia started the reform process towards democratization since 1998 until this time and considered success, while Myanmar has started ten years earlier since 1988 until now but still facing a tough phases since that time due to Intervention of Military Junta in the democratization process. This part will
highlights those similarities and compare what kind of aspects that we can learn from both countries.

**Role of Military Junta**

It is undeniable that military junta plays a key role as national unifier from conflicts and guardian from political and economic crisis (Callahan 2001; Dittmer 2010). In 1958, the civilian government was weakened and the country underwent a parliament crisis because of the separation of the ruling Anti-Fascist People’s Freedom League (AFPFL) (Taylor 1985). At that time, Prime Minister U Nu had to resort to military. A new agenda for country reconciliation and development was issued by the military government. Taking advantage of the disintegration of AFPFL, in March 1962, Army Chief Gen. Ne Win led a coup in which the military claimed to play a role of unifying the country. Obviously shown, when the role of the civilian government is diminished, military tends to.

Similarly, Indonesian military is also effective in preventing ethnic conflicts and separatism movement. Its legitimacy is recognized when Indonesian military played a key role in leading coup d’état to overthrow the civilian government. Indonesian militarism is authoritarian in its centralized control and personal rule by Suharto who imposed a control over the armed force (ABRI). Executing “dual function” or “dwifungsi” (Freedman 2006, 85), ABRI played a key role both in national defense and building civilian government. As a result, there were a large number of military members working as bureaucrats.

What is interesting is that in spite of authoritarian military rule, the level of government control differs case by case. What distinguishes Burmese and Indonesian military government is the level of government control that the military execute (Jabine 2011). On the one hand, Burmese military junta is an extremely authoritarian regime with strict control of all aspects of public life. This is shown by the fact that all governmental officers in Myanmar must have working experiences in military. On the other hand, in spite of connection with the military, Indonesia is neither a perfect democratic form of government nor a complete authoritarian military regime. This is one advantage in government apparatus to facilitate the democratization in Indonesia.

**Role of Civil Society**

Firstly, what distinguishes the dynamics of civilian government in Myanmar and Indonesia is that the latter played a significant role in the society. Suharto-led New Order recognized the presence of all political parties (Freedman 2006). Suharto’s government also allowed three parties to participate in elections and provided them funding for operation.

---

1 This involves restoring the rule of law, consolidating democracy, and transforming Myanmar into a socialist country (Silverstein, J. 1977).

2 Parties participating in the election include: Islamic Unity Development Party (PPP), non-Islamic parties such as Indonesian Democratic Party (PDI), and joint Secretary of Functional Groups (Golkar). Among these, Golkar is the controlling party approved by the state (Freedman, A. L. 2006).
In Myanmar, uncompetitive political system gives room for a repressive regime. In Myanmar, there is neither acceptance of civil society nor opposition party. Oppositionists find it virtually impossible to get their voices in Myanmar (Zin and Joseph 2012). The lack of effective opposition parties and civil society poses a barrier for democratic consolidation in Myanmar (Howard 2002). Initially, the military junta established the Revolution Council (RC). Subsequently, with the introduction of “Burmese Way to Socialism”, Burma Socialist Program Party (BSPP) was created in order to win public support. Following the incident in the mid of 1980s, RC and BSPP came in new names of State Law and Order Restoration (SLORC) and National Unity Party (NUP). Burmese military junta never recognized any other political parties (Charney 2009). Opposition party and civic participation were considered as a threat for the military junta.

To summarize, the main difference between the form of government in Myanmar and Indonesia is that the former enjoys a monopoly of power while the latter, though affiliated with the military, is mainly controlled by civilian government. This has a profound implication on the role of civil society and different patterns of political change in Myanmar and Indonesia.

Another reason for the weak civil society is a lack of consensus and unity in civil society. Some veteran politicians still expected that a multi-party election and a power transfer from the military junta to the civilian government would be executed as the military had promised (Charney 2009). Moreover, although students protest against the military government involves the participation of other civil societies and unions including actors, artists, lawyers, housewives, no groups were ready to form an interim government to replace BSPP and to lead the country. While different plans were disagreed upon, the military took advantage of the weak civil society to stage a coup on 18th September 1998 and the country came under the control of the military again (Charney 2009).

The point is that when BSPP government went wrong, instead of taking its leadership in mass mobilization and establishment of an interim government in place of military junta, Burmese civil society was weakened by disagreement and disintegration. In reality, no civil society or union was taking advantage of a power hole and leading the country. This is explicable when bureaucratic structuring in Myanmar and Indonesia is considered. Unlike Ne Win-led BSPP government, skillful bureaucrats and acknowledged elites were appreciated in Suharto-led New Order (Carnegie 2010).

Role of Economic Development

The most significant failure of BSPP government lies in its economic misdirection. With the terrible legacy by Tin Pe, Burmese economy was more deteriorated by the
transformation from Aung Gyi’s import-substitution industrialization to Tin Pe’s Marxist-oriented economy to serve Burmese Way to Socialism (Charney 2009). The latter focuses on agricultural loans, land reclamation, and nationalization to the local level. The centralized control of the economy on the means of production and distribution restrained the dynamics of the middle class.

This policy fails in two senses. First, the state-controlled economy discouraged productivity of nationalized industries as well as limited people participation in decision-making. Myanmar, which had been a rice-exporter, ran out of rice and was filled with a burden of national debt owing to decreasing export (Charney 2009). On 5th September 1987, demonetization of 25, 35 and 75-kyat currency notes was introduced. Consequently, the financial circulation went wrong when 60% to 80% of currency could not be used. Inflation went on when rice price increased by 700 per cent than the governmental rate. In addition, despite the shortage of goods, there was an unfair distribution among the elites and the mass. As a result, Myanmar was listed to be a “Least Developed Country” in 1987 (Charney 2009).

In Indonesia, Sukarno’s socialist-led strategy was followed by Suharto’s liberal policy which has positive impacts on Indonesian economy. The government gave support for private sector, developed semi-processed and manufacturing industries. In an open economy, foreign investment was facilitated with several incentive programs. Additionally, Indonesian economic development is attributed to Repelita, an economic program led by a group of foreign-educated

September 1998. The politicians were asked to set aside their disagreement to facilitate the establishment of an interim government within 2 days. At that time, even though former Prime Minister U Nu stood up for his own appointment and asked for support for his own government, not many people took belief in his leadership any more.

The policy contributes to open up the economy through support for private sector and foreign investment Practically United Nations announcement aimed at the acceptance of low-interest loan from foreign countries for Myanmar in this difficult condition. technocrats and the increase price of world oil (Freedman 2006). Consequently, the fruit was an annual economic growth rate of 5.4% in the 1970s, Indonesia being the highest in ASEAN countries and nearly reaching the standard of newly-industrialized countries. Supported by the military, Suharto-led New Order managed the economy very well until Asian Financial Crisis.

The incident of financial Crisis counts because the literature on modernization theory points out that during economic stagnation, people lose confidence in the authoritarian regime and are willing to form a new government that is able to lead the country out of the turmoil. Following the the IMF consultation, the government closed 16 banks,

---

4 Repelita was executed under the guidance of IGGI Inter Governmental Group on Indonesia, sometimes called Berkeley mafias.
increased interest rate up to 50% to save rupiah currency. This resulted in the closing down of small banks, unavoidable inflation of 80%, and the falling of rupiah currency from 24,000 to the lowest point of 17,000 to a dollar. Being blamed for their better wealth accumulation than Indonesian, Chinese were attacked throughout the country. Being accused of unable to control the riot, Suharto was under the pressure of students’ protest to resign. Suharto was also abandoned by key ministers and the military (Freedman 2006). Facing a national turmoil, Suharto resigned on 21st May 1998. Apparently, economic crisis paved a way for a new regime in power. In addition to this, to understand the role of political leaders, it is crucial to discuss the behavior of Indonesian government in the Financial Crisis 1997 in the perspectives of the Strategic Choice Theory.

**Role of Leader’s Policy**

In Myanmar, it is required that all civilian members in Myanmar need to have military background. Hence, the voice of civilian societies in Myanmar was so weak that the military controlled the result of the election in 1990. Alternatively, following Suharto’s resignation, the military leader decided to develop civilian leadership by strengthening its bureaucracy. To elaborate on this point, after Suharto resigned, Angkatan Bersenjata Republic Indonesia (ABRI) was renamed as Tentara National Indonesia (TNI) in October 1998 to limit its involvement in the government. The new government continued to deprive TNI of its responsibility of security defense and assigned it to the national police force in April 1999. This decision aimed at limiting the expansion of the military and avoiding their political alliance (Carnegie 2010). In January 1999, TNI only won 38 seats in the DPR (Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat – Lower House of Parliament of Indonesia) and eventually played out of the DPR. At the local level, there was a decline in the representation of TNI from 20% to only 10%. Moreover, in the 1999 general election, TNI stayed neutral and did not recognize Golkar as its political party. The authority of Indonesian military was gradually weakened.

Suharto’s policy to protect his economic interest also leads to his resignation. Facing the currency crisis due to the devaluation of rupiah, Suharto asked for IMF assistance on the condition of limiting governmental support for his companies, reducing expenditure, closing insolvent banks, and stop providing support for food and energy (Freedman 2006). These two rescue packages were not effectively implemented because Suharto focused on protecting the companies controlled by his families and his allies. One example is that 16 insolvent banks had been closed as IMF required and then were allowed to re-open under new names. At that time, increasing energy price triggered mass riots. The mass were angry because while they suffered the consequences of the subsidy removal, Suharto’s family and allies benefited from corruption. The demonstration starting in January 1998 soon escalated and became a pressure to ask for Suharto’s resignation in April and May.

The argument here is that economic crisis leads to the separation in political leaders. First, receiving IMF assistance, Suharto’s government lost its unity because of
disagreement on whether to accept IMF’s conditions, and how to execute the policies. The escalation of the riots and Suharto’s inability to manage it made his allies lose confidence in his leadership. All key officers⁵ resigned and abandoned Suharto. The House Speaker Harmoko insisted on carrying out the impeachment of Suharto. General Wiranto gave up his responsibility of security defense in Jakarta. Eventually, under the pressure of the public and political elites, Suharto decided to resign on 21st May 1998 after 32 years in power (Freedman 2006). The collapse of Suharto’s regime served as a condition for public election in subsequent years.

No Bourgeoisie, No Democracy

In regards of democratic transition from authoritarian rule and by quoting Moore’s ‘No Bourgeoisie, No Democracy’ (Moore 1966), the middle class tend to come together in interest groups or associations to promote their interests. In doing so, they are asking for an open, accountable, responsive, and democratic government.

The nationalization policy to serve Burmese Way to Socialism prevented the wealth accumulation for middle class. Moreover, the law did not allow the gathering of more than 3 people and posed a barrier for civil society to disseminate information to mobilize the mass (Howard 2002). The isolated economy in Myanmar minimized the competence of civil society and prevented their participation in decision-making towards democratic regime.

Unlike Myanmar, Suharto’s liberal economic strategy and corporatist authoritarianism benefited the middle class to some extents (Dick 1985). Besides, the middle class of an oil exporting country reaped big revenues from the high price of oil in the 1970s (MacIntyre 1991). Therefore, middle class were gaining their voices and bargaining power with the political elites (Carnegie 2010). With the help of free press and media, these interest groups could raise their growing demands to the state (Carnegie 2010). It was Suharto’s insensible “Strategic Choice” to conform to IMF’s conditions that brought unexpected changes into the economic situation and gave them a reason to go against his government which no longer the safeguard of their interests. After Suharto’s resignation, Indonesian middle class raised a bigger voice in the establishment of a new government by participating in the decision-making process. Under the supervision of this literate middle class who are the majority of the population, political representatives apparently need to be more competent in their performances. In a participatory system in which the middle class can have a voice in their polls and play a role in governmental scrutiny, Indonesian democratization should be consolidated.

⁵ To make it worse, following leading economist ministers Akbar Tanjung and Ginandjar Kartasamita, all 14 economic ministers resigned (Freedman, 2006). At the same time, the House Speaker Harmoko insisted on carrying out the impeachment of Suharto. General Wiranto gave up his responsibility of security defense in Jakarta.
Conclusion

Myanmar and Indonesia have been among states under military control in the Southeast Asia. Following the resignation of its leaders, while Burmese military still remains dominant, Indonesia became the world’s third largest democratic nation. The paper examines the democratization in two countries and pinpoints the reason why authoritarian regime survived in Myanmar until now, while it collapsed in Indonesia in 1998. This paper tries to justify different outcomes of democratization process, and the implications for future democracy in Myanmar. To answer the questions, the paper draws upon different theories, including Authoritarianism theory, Democratization theory, Modernization theory, Strategic Choice theory, and Social Class theory. In this way, the paper explores five main factors influencing the results of democratization, including the role of military, the strength of civil society, economic development level, leaders’ policy, and the role of social class. The paper comes up with the arguments as follows:

Firstly, while Myanmar military junta is completely monopoly of power, the military in Indonesia only holds a certain degree of authority within the government. Secondly, a lack of a unified civilian society in Myanmar neither led the regime change nor brought the military down. There was no organization to replace the authoritarian government when there was a power vacuum. In Indonesia, strong civil society is a condition for its successful democratization. The military in Indonesia chose to encourage the emergence of a civilian government by recognizing the existence of opposition party, and strengthening bureaucracies. Thirdly, economic deterioration in Myanmar triggered political instability and paved an end to democracy. When the Asian Financial Crisis 1997 struck Indonesia, the disapproval of Suharto’ government from strong civil society and his key officers brought a pressure on his resignation. Fourthly, in terms of the role of leaders’ policy, it is shown that in the Asian Financial Crisis 1997, his wrong “Strategic Choice” made the majority of population go against him and go for a new government that support their economic interest. Lastly, when it comes to the role of social class, the declining economy in Myanmar repressed the development of the middle class who should be the main players in democratization. Whereas, Indonesian middle class appeared to be beneficiaries of Suharto-led New Order and played a key role in the supervision of an accountable of a new government.

As Huntington (1991) states that many achievements are necessary for a democracy. In the case of Indonesia, two consecutive free and several fair elections and a transfer of power from incumbent opposition are fruits in Indonesian democratic consolidation. Therefore, it is still a long way until all the substances of democracy for Myanmar are all collected. Learning from the experiences of the world and regional countries, Myanmar people are struggling for their democratic country. The history of democratization in Myanmar continues to be in focus for future academic research.
Revisiting democratization in Myanmar and Indonesia from a comparative perspective

References


Jabine, M.C. 2011. *Comparative analysis on military and politics in Burma and Indonesia*. Cebu City: Political Science Department, University of the Philippines Cebu College.


Bibliography


Renewable energy development and environmental justice in Thailand:
A case of biomass power plant in Roi-Et province*

Yeji Yoo**
yjnyj@naver.com

Abstract

This paper reviews the policies and practices of renewable energy development and biomass power projects in Thailand. Thailand has allowed private power producers to generate energy from biomass, as an important source of renewable energy, in order to increase energy security and to reduce CO2 emissions. However, some biomass projects in Thailand have resulted in negative environmental effects and social problems, such as air pollution and health problems for villagers near the projects, which thus create environmental injustices. Applying the concept of environmental justice, the research examines impacts and benefits of the biomass project on the environment through a case study in the Roi-Et Province of Thailand. This research also covers how communities, wider societies and the project developers have been affected. A qualitative methodology was adopted to collect various data based on the case study. Project costs and benefits, policy-making processes of the project, and the relations among relevant parties including project beneficiaries, affected villagers and government officers were thoroughly analyzed. This paper argues that renewable energy is not always clean, and that renewable energy using biomass as a fuel will result in environmental injustice problems without proper regulations and good governance by diverse stakeholders.

Keywords: Environmental Justice, Renewable Energy, Biomass Power Plant, Thailand

* This article is developed from a paper presented in the 3rd International Conference on International Relations and Development (ICIRD 2013) on “Beyond the Borders: Building a Regional Commons” at Chulalongkorn University, 22-23 August 2013 and based on the author’s Master’s thesis titled “Renewable Energy Development and Environmental Justice in Thailand: Case Studies of Biomass Energy Projects in Roi-Et and Suphanburi Provinces” (2013, Chulalongkorn University).

** Research Assistant, Institute for East Asian Studies, Sogang University (SIEAS), Seoul, Korea
Renewable energy development and environmental justice in Thailand: A case of biomass power plant in Roi-Et province

Introduction

In facing the dual global crises of climate change and energy insecurity, renewable energy has emerged as an alternative source of power around the world. Thailand is not an exception. Thailand, one of the biggest rice export countries in the world, has promoted private power producers to generate energy from rice husk, one important sources of renewable energy, by providing political and financial support to the biomass energy projects (Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations 2015, 18; Papong, Yuvaniyama, Lohsomboon and Malakul 2004).

Previous researches regarding renewable energy have focused on economic benefits of biomass energy development and potential of using biomass to generate electricity in Thailand. However, existing researches have not much considered that biomass energy development and Very Small Power Producer (VSPP) programs – under 10 MW power plant projects – have possibilities to create environmental problems and health problems of villagers near the under 10 MW biomass power plants. (Papong, Yuvaniyama, Lohsomboon and Malakul 2004; Juntarawijit and Juntarawijit 2012; Sukkumnoed, Sabrum and Nuntavorakarn, 2008; Barz and Delivand 2011). This paper points out that renewable energy is not always clean, and that renewable energy using biomass as a fuel will result in environmental injustice problems without proper regulations and good governance by diverse stakeholders.

In Roi-Et, Thailand, there are three biomass power plants located within a single plot of land of 300 meters square. First biomass power plant, which has 9.95 MW in capacity, has been operated by EGCO (Electricity Generating Public Co.) since 2002. The second, a 6.4 MW biomass power plant and the third, a 9.9 MW biomass power plant, started operation in 2004 and in 2009 respectively under the control of Buasommai Company. Among three biomass power plants, two biomass power plants of the Buasommai Company have caused serious environmental problems such as air pollution and water pollution, which is directly related to health problems such as skin allergy and asthma in the adjacent communities (Focus on the Global South 2012; Sarnsamak 2012). This situation constitutes an environmental injustice.

The concept of environmental justice is “the fair treatment and meaningful involvement of all people regardless of race, color, national origin, or income with respect to the development, implementation, and enforcement of environmental laws, regulations, and policies.” (“What is environmental justice?” 2015) Three key concepts of environmental justice are: ‘distributive justice’ that refers to distribution of environmental benefits, harms and risk; ‘procedural justice’ which refers to access to information and participation in decision-making processes; and ‘justice as recognition’ which means equal recognition of different social groups. Applying the concepts of environmental justice, the research aims to examine the impacts and benefits of the biomass project on environment, affected communities, project developers, and wider society through a case study in Roi-Et.
Qualitative data was collected during 8 days of fieldwork in Roi-Et. Observation near the power plants and villages, interviews with key informants and affected villagers and one focus group discussion with leaders from three villages (Moo 10, 12 and 13) were conducted to collect data with a Thai-English translator in the field.

This paper begins with a brief explanation of environmental justice in the context of Thailand, followed by an overview of biomass energy development in Thailand. Then, the paper moves on to environmental injustice problems of biomass power plants by analyzing distributive justice, procedural justice and justice as recognition in each section based on the case study in Roi-Et. In conclusion, this paper argues that renewable energy using biomass as a fuel will result in environmental injustice problems when proper regulations and good governance are not instituted.

The Concept of Environmental Justice

The concept of environmental justice can be a relevant framework with which to analyze Thailand’s biomass energy projects’ social and environmental impacts during the preparation and implementation processes. Since the concept consists of distributive justice, procedural justice and justice as recognition, development projects’ multidimensional impacts can be identified in a systematic way (Walker 2012) see Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Environmental Justice</th>
<th>Distributive Justice</th>
<th>Procedural Justice</th>
<th>Justice as Recognition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Equal distribution of environmental harms, risks and benefits</td>
<td>Access to information, public participation and access to justice</td>
<td>Equal recognition of people, groups or places</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The environmental justice movement in the United States (US) in the late 1970s introduced the term environmental justice. African-Americans protested against dumping of toxic wastes in a landfill in Warren County, North Carolina in 1982 (Schroeder, Martin, Wilson and Sen 2008, 547). Furthermore, explosions in the Union Carbide chemical plant in Bophal, India and a gas plant in Mexico City injured and killed a number of residents living near the plants (Schroeder, Martin, Wilson and Sen 2008, 547-548). Due to these accidents and following protests of villagers, environmentalists realized that environmental problems and risks are not distributed equally between race, class, gender or countries. In this context, the concept of environmental justice emerged as a framework to explain the inequality of environmental impacts.
As the concept of environmental justice has been globalized beyond the US and applied to environmental inequality problems around the world, its focus has become more inclusive. While environmental justice used to emphasize primarily race or ethnicity in the past, it becomes more aware of differences among gender, income and age as well as the rights of future generations (Buckingham-Hatfield, Reeves and Batchelor 2005; Dobson 1998, Walker and Bulkeley 2006, 655). In other words, ‘justice to whom’ became more inclusive of other environmental issues experienced by vulnerable social groups beyond the racially marginalized.

The framework of environmental justice, firstly used in the US, has been transferred to other parts of the world such as the UK, South Africa, and South America, but the application of the frame in Asia is still rare (Walker 2012). Even though there is not a great deal of existing research applying the concept of environmental justice in Thailand, it does not mean that Thai scholars and civil society organizations (CSOs) have not studied and worked on issues related to environmental injustice problems in the country. They have focused on conflicts caused by large-scale development projects and pointed out the lack of public policy processes by applying other terms such as environmental equity or inequality (Sukkumnoed, Sabrum and Nuntavorakarn 2008; Sajor and Ongsakul 2007).

Recently, Middleton (2012) has applied the concept in the Mekong region in order to address regional energy trade projects, which have created environmental and social inequalities across the borders among Thailand, Laos and Myanmar. Nevertheless, the concept of environmental justice is still new in Thailand and Southeast Asia. Therefore, this paper provides a new insight how the environmental injustices occur in Thailand by analyzing a case of biomass energy development in Roi-Et. This approach is helpful to systematically analyze the problems and impacts of the renewable development projects in Thailand. Next section briefly explains the policies and status of renewable energy as well as biomass energy development in Thailand.

**Overview of Renewable Energy and Biomass Energy Development in Thailand**

Main objectives of Thailand’s energy policies are to reduce energy dependency on imports, to promote renewable energy and to reduce CO₂ emissions under the Energy Industry Act 2007, which is the key law governing energy sector in Thailand (Energy Policy and Planning Office 2012b). Renewable Energy Development Plan (REDP 2008-2022) was enforced to realize the policy objectives under the Act. The main goal of the plan was to increase the share of renewable energy to 20% within 15 years. However, in 2011, the plan was revised to the Alternative Energy Development Plan (AEDP 2012-2022) and it aims to increase the share of renewable energy to 25% of Thailand’s energy demand (Energy Policy and Planning Office 2012b; Greacen and Greacen 2012, 8).
In addition, Thailand has carried out several practical policies to promote grid-connected renewable energy development. Thailand started the Small Power Producer (SPP) and Very Small Power Producer (VSPP) programs to support Thailand’s distributed electricity structure. SPP program was initiated in 1992 for private companies to generate electricity (up to 90 MW) through fossil fuel cogeneration and renewable sources. However, because of high bureaucratic barriers, power plants with planned capacities of around 10 MW were unable to apply for the SPP program (Greacen 2013). Therefore, in 2002 Thailand initiated the VSPP program for only renewable energy sources up to 1 MW only to be exported into the power grid. In 2006, this program was revised to include not only renewable energy but also fossil fuel cogeneration energy projects up to 10 MW (Greacen 2013).

In this context, Thailand has provided access to grid and instruments such as Feed-in Tariffs (FiTs), low-cost financing, and tax incentives so that SPPs and VSPPs can promote renewable energy development. Especially, biomass has been used as the major renewable energy source in Thailand. This is because Thailand, as one of the top producers of agricultural products including rice, sugar, oil palm and coconut, has a great potential to develop the biomass energy projects in the country. In fact, biomass accounts for 69.7% (851.685 MW out of 1221.871 MW) and 82.8% (614 MW out of 741.11 MW) under the VSPP and SPP renewable energy program respectively (Energy Policy and Planning Office 2012a; 2012b).

As biomass is one of the most important renewable energy sources, under the SPP and VSPP Program, 88 biomass power plants are currently operating, and 284 biomass power plants are planned for operation in Thailand. Out of the 88 operating power plants, 22 biomass power plants (25% of the total) have installed capacity greater than 10 MW up to 90 MW under the SPP Program, and 66 biomass power plants (75% of the total) are operating under the VSPP Program (Energy Policy and Planning Office 2012a; 2012b).

Even though the idea of renewable energy and biomass energy to use agricultural waste such as rice husk, bagasse or wood waste is fundamentally good for environment as well as energy security, it does not mean that practices of such concept are always good. Moreover, since different biomass projects require different technologies, they have potential to result in different types of environmental issues. In fact, in case of biomass power plants, which use rice husk as a fuel, pollution and villagers’ health problems are emerging as new social issues and concerns in Thailand (Tangwisutiju 2009). In the next section, problems of biomass power plants are addressed through the conceptual framework of environmental justice of the case of Roi-Et.
Environmental Injustice of Biomass Power Plant in Roi-Et Province

Overview of Biomass Energy Development in Roi-Et

In Nuamuang sub-district, Muang district, Roi-Et province, one rice mill and three biomass power plants, located in a single plot of land within 300 square meters, use rice husk as a main fuel. The rice mill, owned by Buasommai Company, and the company has two biomass power plants – 6.4 MW and 9.9 MW – inside the rice mill under control of the Buasommai Electricity Generation Company Limited. The other biomass power plant, named Roi-Et Green Biomass Power Plant, is operated by EGCO, one of the biggest Independent Power Producers (IPPs) in Thailand, which has capacity of 9.9 MW.

The rice mill was very small when it was first built in 1980. Then it was expanded twice, in 1992 and 1994, into a large rice mill, which can process 1,650 tons of paddy per day (Buasommai I Biomass Power Plant 2006, 37). In 2003, the first biomass power plant in the province, Roi-Et Green Biomass Power Plant operated by EGCO, started operating by buying rice husk from the Buasommai rice-milling company. Through this business with EGCO, Buasommai Company realized that rice husk is a valuable energy source for generating electricity. Buasommai Company decided to construct its own biomass power plants. As a result, 6.4 MW and 9.9 MW Buasommai biomass power plants have been operating since 2006 and since 2009 respectively.

The rice mill and three biomass power plants are located in a residential area. Within 3 km from the biomass power plant complex, there is one elementary school and three villages, Moo 10, Moo 12 and Moo 13, where 988, 691 and 1098 people live respectively. During the winter season from October to January when wind blows from the biomass power plants to these villages, residents suffer from smoke and dust of biomass power plants, especially from the two Buasommai biomass power plants. Until the first Buasommai biomass power plant started to operate, villagers did not experience serious health problems even with the first EGCO-operated plant around. Therefore, in 2006, the leadership of village headmen organized a network to monitor the impacts of biomass power plants in the Nuamuang sub-district (former Moo 13 village headman, personal communication, June 29, 2013). In following sections, the Buasommai 9.9 MW power plant is analyzed from the perspective of distributive justice, procedural justice and justice as recognition.1 Aspects of the plant operation are constructed with the Roi-Et Green biomass power plant operated by EGCO.

---

1Since no information about the 6.4 MW was provided by Buasommai Company and both biomass power plants are established and operated by the same company, the following sections focus on the 9.9 MW power plant and assume that both power plants follow similar procedures.
Distributive Justice

Among the benefits of biomass energy development, the most obvious one is the extra income that biomass power plant companies receive through selling electricity to the Provincial Electricity Authority (PEA) or Metropolitan Electricity Authority (MEA), state-owned distribution systems. The 9.9 MW Buasommai biomass power plant sells 8 MW, and the Roi-Et Green biomass power plant sells 8.8 MW to PEA. Also, since the biomass energy is classified as renewable energy, when power producers sell electricity to power utilities, they receive an additional payment called an “adder” on top of normal prices, which adds US $0.01 per kWh for biomass power plants with installed capacities higher than 1 MW (Tongsopit and Greacen 2013, 439, 442). This means that biomass power plants can sell electricity at a higher price by using rice husk, which is an agricultural by-product from the rice mill, without extra costs.

Prior to the construction of the Buasommai 9.9 MW biomass power plant, Buasommai Electricity Generating Company applied for Clean Development Mechanism (CDM) and claimed to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) that the biomass power plants would bring environmental, social, and economic benefits to nearby area. The reasons were the following: First, biomass power plants would solve the environmental problems caused by decaying rice husk from the rice mill. Secondly, poor households could generate extra income by selling rice husk or other biomass to the company. Thirdly, job opportunities would be provided to the villagers in the local area. And lastly, the biomass power plants would create cash flows for the local economy (Buasommai I Biomass Power Plant 2006).

However, residents of Moo 10, 12, and 13 totally disagree with the company’s claims by stating that households have not earned extra income because they have only small rice paddies, around 4 or 5 rai (1 rai = 0.16 hectare), for their family. In fact, Buasommai biomass power plants buy rice husk for 600 Thai Baht per ton, and Roi-Et Green power plant pays 900 Baht per ton. The additional income from selling rice husk is therefore comparatively small. In terms of the job opportunities in the biomass power plants, people do not want to work there because they believe that working inside the biomass power plant is dangerous. Villagers said that workers come from other nearby provinces such as Si Saket, Buriram, and Surin provinces. Regarding the local economy, village headmen said that the cash flow is just for the biomass power plants, not for local economy and villagers. They strongly stated that there were “no benefits, just costs from the biomass power plants”.

What are the costs villagers have to pay? The most serious problems caused by the Buasommai biomass power plants are smoke from the two stacks as well as dust from the rice husk warehouse and transportation which carries rice husk to the plants. This smoke and dust creates air pollution in the villages during winter season (See Photograph 1). Most households in Moo 10, 12, and 13 and the
elementary school have experienced black ash problems from the smoke, which covers everything including the roofs of the houses, grounds of the school, rice paddies, and trees.

Cleaning the school is a new burden for the teachers and students. President and vice president of the elementary school said that the first thing to do at school during the winter season is to clean the school and classrooms. However, 15-20 minutes later, everywhere becomes dirty again with the dust and ashes blowing from the biomass power plant. Furthermore, they mentioned they cover the windows with plastic wraps and let students wear mask to protect their health in winter. Even in mid-June when the fieldwork was conducted, ash on the school water system was observed. It is easily predicted that more ash from smoke will blow to school and villages during winter season.

The situation is similar with the residents in this area. The villagers responded that their houses are covered by black ash from the stacks of Buasommai biomass power plant in winter. In addition, villagers are suffering from health problems. They said they could not sleep well at night because of the noise from the biomass power plants and the smoke. They added that the noise was louder at night because the surroundings are very quiet compared to the daytime, which make them wake up frequently during sleep. They also felt that they could not breathe well because of the smoke while they sleep at night. Villagers as well as students have skin allergies, which make their skin itchy, as well. Even worse, the ashes and rice husks on the road sometimes go into people’s eyes. One woman said she was not aware of the impact so she rubbed her left eye when with the ash in it. This, she said, made her lose vision of her left eye.

**Figure 1** Black smoke from the stack of the 9.9MW Buasommai biomass power plant on June 28, 2013
In addition, the ashes affect villagers’ drinking water. In rural areas, villagers still use rainwater for everyday use, such as drinking, cooking, washing, bathing and so on. However, after the operations of the first biomass power plant in the area, they could not use rainwater anymore because ash from the biomass power plants would cover the roof and contaminate the rainwater. Therefore, they have no choice but to buy drinking water and use the public water system.

In terms of economic harm, smoke and ash have affected productivity of fruit trees and rice paddies of villagers. Some villagers experience the fruits of the mango and papaya trees cannot grow well. Worse, some villagers gave up harvesting rice of 3-rai paddy. Since harvest season in winter season in Roi-Et, which is when the most severe smoke blew from the biomass power plant, they felt that they might die from the black smoke.

In summary, while the biomass power plant developers receive benefits by selling electricity and receiving as an adder from the Thai government, villagers living near the biomass power plants experience negative impacts, including environmental harms, health problems, and economic burdens. In other words, the Buasommai biomass power plant created distributive injustice problems within Roi-Et. So, how did this problematic biomass power plant start its operation in this area? Next section points out that there was a lack of procedural justice in the project planning and practice.

Procedural Justice

Buasommai Company did not provide the villagers with any information or opportunities for public hearings before constructing both biomass power plants. Villagers and school staffs said no one came to the villages and school to explain their plans and ask for villagers’ permission to build biomass power plant in this area. On the other hand, when the other biomass power plant operated by EGCO, Roi-Et Green biomass power plant, was planned to be constructed and operate in Roi-Et in 2002, the company invited villagers for the field trip to observe a situation in other provinces where the EGCO had operated power plants, and showed that there was no serious problems with villagers or environmental impacts. This field trip with villagers was conducted prior to construction, and villagers agreed to construct Roi-Et Green power plant in the area after the field trip. President and vice president of the school also mentioned that EGCO staffs visited school to explain their plan to build biomass power plant near the school and they were invited the field trip. After coming back from the field trip, school staffs who attended the trip shared their observation and opinion and then they gave the permission to build the biomass power plant. However, villagers and school staffs pointed out that in the case of Buasommai biomass power plant, there was no chance to listen to the company’s plan, and company just started constructing the 6.4MW biomass power plant in 2003.
Renewable energy development and environmental justice in Thailand: A case of biomass power plant in Roi-Et province

The second biomass power plant of Buasommai, which is 9.9MW in capacity, also started to be constructed without villagers’ permission. Two households, one right next to the main gate and one immediately next to a rice husk warehouse of the Buasommai biomass power plants, said none of the company staffs or managers has ever visited the houses.

According to a report about the Buasommai 9.9 MW biomass power plant submitted by the company to the CDM Executive Board, there were no public hearings to explain the development project and listen to villagers’ opinions before signing the construction contract. Instead, the company held a stakeholder’s meeting while the 9.9 MW biomass power plant was under construction. However, a village headman criticized that the objective of the meeting was not to ask villagers’ permission to construct or operate the biomass power plant, but to inform and explain the company’s plan to villagers. In summary, the residents have neither received sufficient information to understand what was going on near their homes, nor given proper opportunities to express their concerns and opinions.

Table 2 Major events related to the operation of Buasommai 9.9MW biomass power plant

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Event/action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>September 2007</td>
<td>Signing of construction contract</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 26, 2007</td>
<td>Finalization and signing of Bank Loan Agreement based on the consideration of revenue from CDM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 2007</td>
<td>Start of construction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 2008</td>
<td>Stakeholders’ meeting at Petcharat Garden Hotel, Roi-Et</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>November 2008</td>
<td>Stakeholder feedback consultation at the project site, Roi-Et</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December 2008</td>
<td>Construction completed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February 2009</td>
<td>Going into full operation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In terms of access to justice, villagers of Roi-Et filed a lawsuit to the Regional Administrative Court in Ubon Ratchathani province. When the villagers sent a letter to the court the first time, the court rejected the claim because the letter was not written in proper legal terminology. After revising it, they re-sent the letter and argued that the provincial government of Roi-Et had paid little attention to the people’s problems with the biomass power plants and did not take responsibility to solve the problems. After the second claim was accepted, the court asked for the provincial government officers to check and review the Buasommai biomass power plants. Two months later, villagers went to the court to hear the result, but the decision...
was to first give enough time to the company to solve the problem by itself and to observe any improvements. Villagers were very disappointed with the result because they felt even the court is not on their side. Although there was an opportunity for villagers to claim their rights to the court in Thailand and they attempted to do so, their access to justice was not genuinely realized in this case.

**Justice as Recognition**

Justice as recognition emerged as another main concept of environmental justice to supplement distributional justice and procedural justice. Justice as recognition deals with the misrecognition of some people, groups and places in comparison to others, for example those divided along lines of gender, race, religion, ethnicity and so on (Walker 2012, 50). Therefore, the concept of justice as recognition focuses on the “cultural and institutional processes of disrespect, denigration, insult and stigmatization which devalue particular people or places” (Walker 2012, 35). Justice as recognition is a crucial concept of environmental justice in a way that lack of recognition causes not only inequitable distribution but also further distributive injustices (Schlosberg 2007, 14).

In context of biomass power projects in Thailand, this article focuses on institutional processes such as the regulation of the VSPP program, the Energy Regulatory Commission (ERC)’s recognition of the VSPP program and biomass power plants and biomass power plant developers’ recognition of the impacts on villagers living near the power plants.

According to the Enhancement and Conservation of the National Environmental Quality Act (NEQA) of 1992, any kind of thermal power plants, which include biomass power plants, exceeding 10 MW in capacity should submit the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) report to the Office of Natural Resources and Environment Policy and Planning (ONEP) while applying for a permission of project construction and operation. It means that VSPPs who plan to build power plants under 10 MW in capacity have no duty to carry out EIA process. In this sense, developers prefer to construct biomass power plants under 10 MW to be exempt from such requirement and therefore minimize the permitting process works.

In addition, according to the “Regulation for the Purchase of Power from VSPPs (for the Generation Using Renewable Energy),” only technical regulations are mentioned to govern the synchronization of VSPPs to the system of Distribution Utility, which is a power purchaser. There are no environmental regulations to prevent environmental impacts of the VSPPs, which might occur in the future. People think that small-sized power plants using renewable energy sources are less harmful than mega-sized projects using fossil fuel. One of the main objectives of power purchasing from VSPPs is to “lessen the environmental impact.” (EPPO Unknown)

The Buasommai Company argues that its biomass power plants will help conserve fossil fuel because the projects use biomass as one of the main sources for renewable energy (Buasommai I Biomass Power Plant 2006). The company also emphasizes that the projects can
reduce the amount of rice husk as one of the agricultural wastes, and thus prevents problems of decaying biomass at local level. However, the problem is that both the company and the EGAT have just focused only on what energy source power plants use as fuel while neglecting the negative impacts of biomass power plants on the environment and villages in the process of generating electricity.

In particular, direct-fired technology, which is used in the Buasommai biomass power plant, risks the release of harmful pollution, though the technology is simple to install. However, since technical standards for pollution control systems do not exist in the environmental regulatory system in Thailand, what kind pollution control system is installed depends on project developers (Juntarawijit and Juntarawijit 2012).

Consequently, policy makers’ perception that renewable energy and very small power projects are good for the environment has an influence on the creation of insufficient regulations to prevent the negative impacts of biomass power plants on the environment and surrounding communities.

**Conclusion**

Renewable energy is not free from the impacts on the environment and nearby communities. As shown in the Roi-Et cases, biomass power plants, producing less than 10 MW using rice husk combustion systems, can have potential to create environmental damages, health problems, and economic harms to villagers, resulting in environmental injustice.

In terms of the distributive justice, while the biomass power plants receive benefits by selling electricity to government at higher price, villagers have been suffered from environmental, economic, and health problems. Worse, villagers are worried about risk, which can happen to their future generations. Benefits, harms and risks are not distributed equally between project developers and villagers. In terms of procedural justice, villagers were not properly informed with the plan of constructing biomass power plants as well as their benefits and risks. Public participation was not sufficient, either. A Stakeholders’ meeting was held once, only when construction of the plant was almost finished. Villagers tried to use legal system to solve the problems but the national court did not recognize their claim.

This whole environmental injustice problem of biomass power plants is caused by lack of justice as recognition. Since Thailand policy makers, especially in the energy sector, did not recognize negative impacts of renewable energy including biomass power plant, there were no proper regulations on operating biomass power plants. It is not mandatory for power plants projects producing less than 10 MW to submit EIA report as a minimum requirement in Thailand. Therefore, we should remember that renewable energy could be harmful for the environment and people without proper regulations and management. Current regulations on renewable energy development projects are still insufficient to prevent and protect the environment and villagers’ rights in Thailand.
Villagers living near the biomass power plants in Roi-Et have started their own movement in earnest to ask for the provincial government to take its responsibility for people and force the company to solve the problem since last year. As a result, a committee, composed of provincial officers, TAO officers and affected villagers, was formed to discuss biomass power plant issue with the biomass power plants developers. Since January of 2013, monthly meetings have been held in the biomass power plants so far, and some problems have been solved. For example, a rice husk warehouse was constructed to prevent dust even though the main problem, the smoke from the smokestack, is still there.

Therefore, with the proper implementation of regulations and policies, as well as the recognition of the negative impacts of renewable energy projects, especially of biomass power plants less than 10 MW, coupled with greater accountability from the business sector and government, both the central and provincial are required in order to ensure environmental justice in Thailand.

References


Renewable energy development and environmental justice in Thailand: 
A case of biomass power plant in Roi-Et province


The emergence of Public-Private-Social Partnership (PPSP) in Very Small Power Producer (VSPP) industry: A case study of Mae Jo micro-hydro power project: The implication for environmental governance*

Thita Orn-in**
thita.on@gmail.com

Abstract

Electricity from renewable sources produced by Very Small Power Producer (VSPP) is a promising scheme that not only strengthens energy security, but also provides solutions to the problem of sustainability and environmental governance. In the future, community’s VSPPs will be an important contributing factor for Thailand’s 25 percent Renewable Energy production to be met, but currently this issue received inadequate attention. A study at Mae Kam Pong’s Micro Hydro power project was conducted in order to illustrate that multi-partner governance. This community’s VSPP project marks a new paradigm of decentralized, inclusive and green energy production. Success, challenges as well as the opportunity for the project to be replicated, could be explored to show the feasibility for such schemes to be replicated.

To conduct this research, in-depth interviews with key informants from the community, their partners from firms and civil societies as well as other governmental authorities were made. This paper argues that the formation of hybrid environmental contributes to the establishment of community VSPP projects as it introduces new model of energy security towards the local income distribution in terms of human security. Although communities become more empowered by partnering with firms and civil society, the state is still a dominating actor that restricts community actors to participate in VSPP. As project faced challenges caused by policy and government norms, other community projects are less likely to be able to replicate in mass scale unless government regulations are changed so that it supports such formation. Although the project is doubted with financial sustainability, the project brought up a platform of inclusive governance regime within the community.

Keywords: Hybrid Environmental Governance, Community VSPPs, Energy Security, Inclusive Environmental Scheme, Renewable Energy, Local Electrification, Micro Hydro Power Plant

* This article is developed from a paper presented in the 3rd MSSRC International Conference on “Mekong Region and ASEAN in Transition: People and Transborder Issues” 11 -12 September 2014 at U-Place, Ubon Ratchathani University, Thailand
* Center for Social Development Studies, Faculty of Political Science, Chulalongkorn University.
Introduction

Thailand is improving the electricity supply capacity to fulfill its increasing consumption. Renewable sources produced by Very Small Power Producer (VSPP) are a promising scheme that not only strengthen local energy security but also addresses sustainability issues. VSPP is a scheme that supports policy’s green energy production where small investors can sell electricity for less than 10 Mega Watts to Provincial Electricity Authority’s (PEA) distribution grid using the required renewable energy. Hence, in the future of community’s electricity, VSPPs will be one contributing factor for Thailand’s Renewable Energy target. However, this issue currently receives inadequate attention. Mae Jo’s VSPP is one of the pioneering community-energy-for-sale projects in Thailand. The study illustrates how its emerging partnership formation between the Public, Private, and Social sectors can contribute within communities’ VSPP business. Moreover, opportunities as well as challenges in order for the project to be replicated could be explored to reflect the possibility in national-scale community VSPP program in the future.

VSPP scheme is an essential approach for Thailand’s Renewable Energy generation target of 25% to be met according to Renewable Energy Development Plan (REDP 2009) (Greacen, Tongsopit 2012). The literature points out the importance of the new paradigm of electricity production from small scale RE sources: local and decentralized areas for effective green electricity generation as opposed to large scale centralized generation of conventional sources. Though, there are many communities supported by the Ministry of Energy (MoE) to generate off-grid electricity in Thailand, there is a few that initiate the idea of generating electricity for sale, as a VSPP for extra income to their communities (EforE 2011). These communities in Thailand, including Mae Jo, are struggling to produce and sell electricity to the grid, whereas these models have been successful, effectively implemented and replicated in other countries (Center for Clean Air Policy 2012). A few local-based tourism communities in the North of Thailand are pioneering community’s VSPP projects, which posts a new phenomenon in the area of environmental governance according to Young’s (2009) hybrid-governance (See diagram 1). In contrast to conventional state-centric system, this makes a good case study for hybrid forms of environmental governance, and post as a model for Thailand’s future study on community VSPP projects.

Today’s government affairs projects are familiar with the hybrid regime, known as Public-Private Partnerships (PPP), Social-Private Partnership (SPP), Public-Social Partnership (PSP) or co-management and, Public-Private Social Partnership (PPSP) are an environmental governance concept that explained the cooperation among the three most influencing actors; the state, the market and the community. The cooperation among those actors emerged due to the declining power of the state to deal with resources management by itself in the current world of globalization, decentralization and marketization. The cooperation occurs for one actor to enhance and bear the problem of others and mutually benefit one another: the state possesses authority and assertiveness, the market owns financial capital and efficiency in the operation and the community owns local knowledge and acceptance (Delmas and Young 2009).
This study perceives that Mae Jo’s Micro-Hydro VSPP project consists of other partners, which are local government agencies: the CSR program from Thaioil Group and the foundation of Energy for Environment (EforE, the energy NGOs). Unlike the off-grid electricity project, where the processes of the application for contract and synchronization to the grid’s distribution system and generation approvals are not needed. The three partners had previously cooperated in Mae Jo’s On-grid project in the process of VSPP contractual and approval arrangement in order for Mae Jo’s VSPP to be able to sell to PEA’s grid distribution system. The emergence of Mae Jo Micro-Hydro power project, as a hybrid environmental government regime, marked a new paradigm in community power projects in Thailand.

The purpose of this study was to seek understandings towards the incentives of the formation, to see what extent the hybrid governance within the project facilitates the process of establishment, as well as power relations within this governance system, and to explore the success, challenges and opportunities for future replication on the national scale based on Mae Jo community case study.

---

Figure 1 PSPP governance, reproduced from environmental governance, 2009

---

1 Off-grid electricity projects are the electricity production projects usually at community level in remote area beyond PEA’s distribution line. Most projects typically are funded by the Department of Alternative Energy Development and Efficiency (DEDE) under MoE for the generating turbine for Micro-Hydro station. Off-grid production for community’s internal consumption is not complicated in terms of legal approvals as it was an affair between the community and MoE.
This research asked the following questions:

1. What are the incentives of each actor that act within the study cases VSPPs in economic, social and environmental viewpoints?

2. What are the successes and challenges for the community VSPPs to successfully obtain approvals and contracts, and successfully operate?

3. Building up from the findings, what opportunities are there for this pioneering step to replicate to national-scale community VSPPs?

As part of the methodology of the research, in-depth interviews with key informants were conducted between July-August 2014. Interviews included Mae Jo community’s key informants, some local and central governmental agencies, as well as NGOs and corporate partners. Interviews with these informants were recorded in Thai and were transcribed into English. The data was organized using the content analysis method.

The Emergence of Community Spin
Mae Jo community

“Water is essential for our life and the forest is the origin of water. If we don’t look after the forest, there would be no water and life. People wouldn’t be able to grow crops anymore and eventually have to leave our homeland. Life wouldn’t be this easy.” (Tongbai 2014)

Tongbai’s statement, leader of Mae Jo Ban Din, well reflected the communities’ core philosophy on sustainable livelihood that is mainly tied to agriculture. Keeping this doctrine in mind, the Micro Hydro power station was initiated for the purpose of their local resource management. The project was expanded from the Mae Lerm local dike that was located upstream from the community. The dike was surrounded by rainforest, which was claimed important for the dikes’ water conservation.

“...The dike was from H.M. King Bhumibol’s grace, to our village. I don’t want the energy from the running water to be wasteful. When I visited Mae Kam Pong village, and I see that Micro-Hydro power station could be installed in villages similar to ours and it worked. I was inspired by them because I hope we would make some money to look after our forest...” (Tongbai 2014)

Although the local community’s main income is from agriculture, the extra income from the tourism industry can support other expenses needed. Similarly, the Micro-Hydro power plan was expected to generate income to run community activities related to resource management, which mainly is reforestation and building forest fire buffer zone. Principally, their project is, therefore, a management of their natural resources and local labor to benefit local’s sustainable environment and livelihood.

After the idea had been crystalized, Ms. Tongbai, project leader who own Mae Jo Ban Din, a community-concept homestay business, got in touch with the foundation of Energy for Environment (EforE) through a connection with the famous Pun Pun community².
The foundation’s mandate is to promote energy efficiency, especially to enhance the foundation of Renewable Energy production, as well as advocate for the state-led Renewable Energy policy in Thailand. They are equipped with engineering experts, policy experts, as well as connections with the funding sources. A working team had been formed and the process began.

**Figure 2** The diagram shows process of approvals’ applications for Mae Jo’s Micro-Hydro project

Firstly, the community members registered themselves as a community enterprise group to attain juristic person status. EforE facilitated funding proposal procedure and got the community in touch with Thai Oil Corporation through the foundation’s CSR program. The project was granted 2.5 million baht from Thai Oil, and another 1.7 million from a loan that had been allocated from the DEDE. The working team was formed consisting of the EforE, Thai Oil CSR program officer and the community. The approval processes began from a local public hearing, followed by a submission for the long-term purchasing contract with PEA, and submissions for four approvals from four different authorities includes construction approval from Tambon Administrative Organization (TAO), electricity generation approval from the Energy Regulatory Commission (ERC); factory approval from the Department of Industrial Work (DIW) and an approval for controlled energy production from the Department of Alternative

---

2 Pun Pun community is a model for sustainable living and learning center established by Mr. Jone Jandai http://www.punpunthailand.org
Energy Development and Efficiency (DEDE). The procedure took almost four years before they started selling to PEA’s grid in February 2014. Along the process, hardships were confronted. Challenges will be discussed, in detail, in a later session.

**Success of the Project**

Mae Jo’s Micro-Hydro project has been operating since February 2014. Currently, there were not enough surpluses to invest in other activities as planned, but the project had anticipated that they would generate more electricity. However, what the project had achieved along the way was the establishment of a platform for governance in their community for further issues.

“This project is a common ground for people’s participation and community spirit. Everyone has the sense of ownership for the power station. The project can support our forestation activity and hold future hope for more projects such as a community compose center from the profit of it” (Prasarn, enterprise chairman 2014)

Mae Jo is now receiving around THB13,000 of income per month. Currently, they are hiring two technicians who operate the water gate with a monthly salary of THB5,000 each. Initially, they planned that around 30 percent of the amount of money will cover the operating expense for two technicians and some engine oil. Some 20 percent would be saved for their annual forestation activity, and forest ceremony. The other half will be paid for debt. But currently, 77 percent of the income is used for technician’s salaries. It was clearly not enough for their future community project, which includes the compose center, welfare for members and increased benefits for the enterprise members unless they can manage to gain more from careful water management.

The economic benefits have not reached the high level of expectations, but enough for sustaining the operation without external support. Yet, the project has set up a systematic platform for community governance. For example, “Wai Jo” the juvenile group, was the product of systematic step towards sustainability, in terms of the continuity through generations. The formation tightens the bonds between generations and keeps young, educated personal in the village for future operation. The juvenile group are the main activists for implementing forest reservation related activities, as younger generation can easily be empowered and persuaded. Prior to the project, the forest reservation activities were completed by personal finance or donations and casual volunteers. The project thus created a platform for systematic natural resources management in their locality.

In brief, the Mae Jo case study highlights that partnerships between different stakeholders, with different incentives, can help to overcome challenges that another, exclusively can not, while still mutually benefiting all partners. The project exists because of the combination of the community’s firm leadership in negotiating with local state agencies, preparedness and willing to participate, coupled with technical and expertise support from EforE, and the funding from Thaioil group. Mae Jo’s Micro-Hydro project isn’t a sole income generation project; it posts as a local development project that brought a
systematic resource management platform to Mae Jo community, although there are concerns regarding the breakeven point.

However, to replicate this project, on a national scale, a whole new paradigm of strategy must be considered because this process for community-scale electricity projects, such as in Mae Jo, was too unsystematic to follow. Before a pattern for dissemination of practice could be concluded to replicate, challenges should be firstly identified. The following part will elaborate the challenges the community electricity projects must confront.

**Challenges faced**

Although the biggest challenge based on this case study is the fact that the community’s lack of funding, technical and legal experts prompted for their VSPP operation. Those, as internal challenges, have been settled by the cooperation with the private partner. However, external challenges are identified as the uncertainties in policy support. Challenges at the official level in the administration process were identified. Nevertheless, controversial issues involving state procedures for approval not only hamper the community’s VSPP scheme, but it also undermines the national Renewable Energy generation target.

**Lack of Policy Support**

There are currently five different energy plans in Thailand that were separately written by different departments with little coordination during the process. The plans can be viewed as competing, more than complementing to each other (Greacen and Tongsopit 2012). The 2010 Power Development Plan specified low deployment of Renewable Energy and it still emphasizes conventional generation while the Renewable Energy Development Plan targeted to bring for 20 percent for the final renewable energy consumption by 2020. The fact that the Renewable Energy Development Plan (REDP) wasn’t a central part in Thailand’s long term PDP makes Renewable Energy actions consistent, such as in subsidies program. In addition, inadequate amount of public awareness-raising and technical adoption in other local communities are the result of unfocused in REDP

As most VSPPs in Thailand are private companies with full financial capacity, VSPPs, set up by communities, are not common. In the case of Mae Jo, fundraising was a big issue. First, 2.5 million Baht of ESCO fund from Ministry of Energy was granted to the community project. The Mae Jo community had consulted with the Mae Kam Pong community, a failed Community VSPP project in Chiang Mai³. They learned that if they took the state’s financial grant aid, the facilities would be under state’s possession and would be inconvenient for the community to operate. This way, MoE would transfer the possession to local state authority such as the Tambon Administrative Office (TAO) according to state’s regulation and the income generated from the operation must go

---

³ Mae Kam Pong is situated at Mae Ai District, Chiang Mai. The community owned three Micro-Hydro power plants which one of them is grid-connected (VSPP). The selling last for 1 year until there was a conflict of interest between local governments concerning the issue of legitimacy of property; so the operation was suspended until now.
The emergence of Public-Private-Social Partnership (PPSP) in Very Small Power Producer (VSPP) industry: A case study of Mae Jo micro-hydro power project: The implication for environmental governance

to TAO. The Mae Kam Pong community has been in dispute with their local TAO and must hold their operation until the share of benefit is settled; whereas, the facilities would be under the community’s possession if they borrow the money as a loan. The project committee decided to take 2.5 million Baht in the form of a loan, which means that the amount of money must be paid back.

In brief, policies in the regards of RE productions are unparalleled, resulting in weak advocacy towards RE production especially at the local level. Although Mae Jo has a successful community VSPP project, as a result of appropriate findings, but it was a lesson learnt from another failed community that couldn’t operate due to uncertain funding policy that affect the assets ownership.

**Rigid Land Regulations**

Land was one of the most troublesome issues for Mae Jo Micro Hydro project due to a rigid legal process. Regarding the requirements for the Factory Operation Approval (RN.4), land type is an issue that one must be mindful about. In other words, the land needs to have a private land title deed. Prior to the filing of the application to Department of Industrial Works (DIW), the factory’s house building was built in an area which was claimed to be a public land (belongs to Royal Forest Department). DIW explained that under its restrictions, factories could not be situated in forest areas, unless the land has the title deed. Consequently, a new machine’s house was built out of adobe clay (the area’s signature building material), in an area with private land title deed rented from a community member.

“...The project was almost called off many times due to this land issue. We were lucky that Ms. Ta (land lord) was generous enough to let us use her land even she can’t grow crops. I didn’t know that dealing with state’s regulation was this complicated and tiresome, but problems were there to be solved...” (Tongbai 2014)

Land issue was identified as the biggest barrier in state’s regulation. On top of that, DIW explained to the community that the factory operations are generally not allowed in registered forest area to avoid pollutions that can damage the forest and community downstream. However, the community didn’t agree because they claimed that they were actually preserving the forest and experts had proven that the project had no environmental impact. EforE experts argued that it is very likely that Micro-Hydro project that generally involved dikes in remote villages to be situated in registered forest area. The State should be flexible if they want these model projects to be replicable. From the interviews with the community and the Energy Regulatory Commission (ERC), it could be observed that the state applies the same standard for every applicant. ERC claimed that it could grant approvals to anyone as long as legal process was correctly done. (ERC 2014) However, to foster green, decentralized and inclusive energy business, special regulation must be taken into account.

It is arguable that this obligation is too rigid for community VSPP to attain approval because the state applied the same requirement for every VSPP applicants. This approach makes community VSPP developers more inferior than
private developers; and thus, community VSPPs still remains a rare establishment in Thailand.

**Challenges in the Approval Process**

When investors walked into the business, they must obtain the following documents; a long-term purchasing contract from PEA to apply for the adder program\(^4\); electricity generation approval from the ERC; construction approval from the local TAO; factory approval from the Department of Industrial Work and Controlled Energy and from DED. In order to operate, every VSPP must apply for these approval documents from the step guided by ERC. According to an interview with the ERC’s director of approval department, they claimed that the challenges for every approval process for VSPP especially for community projects are; the community’s lack of funding, some conditions that don’t comply with the regulation, and bribery within the approval process. Although the director seems hesitant to point out the last point, the community could confirm it. The community did not only find that the procedures were complicated, they confronted complications during the approval stage caused by unfaithful operation.

Whilst the community approached a couple of offices, they experienced ignorance from many of the officers. In addition to the poor services, they were tricked to pay extra fees on top of the application fee in order to pursue the application process. DIW officer explained that the project may cause an environmental impact and the community was left with an impression that bribery can accelerate the procedures, yet they didn’t fall victim to the bribe even though they were eager to proceed. For the ERC, it was almost a custom for VSPPs developer to pay bribery to proceed. An EforE expert observed that most VSPP developers were private companies, which capital prepared them for the uncontrollable extra cost (bribery) during the approval process. He further explained that this has become a standard norm for VSPPs to get approval without their application being held up and for state’s officers to make money.

“…Private developers with big capital can make millions of baht of income a month, to pay only THB50,000 in exchange to the convenience is tiny in proportion to the income. Besides, the cost was a well-known norm and expected beforehand…”

Mae Jo was convinced to pay around THB 50,000 under the table to proceed to the approval process. Dr. Piassavas Amranand, EforE founder, realized how important the community could be as a model for future community VSPP projects. EforE had helped by using their network to negotiate to avoid the ‘extra’ payment.

Bribery has become a norm in the approval granting process. Most privately owned VSPPs chose to pay the bribes because their production capacity is much larger than the community’s. In proportion to their expected income, the bribery was a tiny sum of money for both. This signified politics within the process.

---

\(^4\) Adder program is a Renewable Energy production subsidized by Thai government to mainly incentivize Small Power Producer and Very Small Power Producer developers. The rates for subsidize are different due to the type of energy, whereas today’s most expensive rate is from solar power.
In general, the aforementioned challenges indicate significant hardships for a community enterprise to develop VSPP projects. The array of challenges, were from both internal factors (which were funding, technical/legal expertise) and external factors (which were from state’s regulation and corruptions). It was difficult for other communities to develop VSPP project for their enterprise unless the state addressed the problems and eased some regulations especially transparent approval procedure to foster inclusive green energy development.

Incentives and Power Relation between Each Actors and the Community

Significant success factors includes well-arranged relationship within the locality with clear and influential leadership, relationships between the community and the local state authorities, the facilitation of advocacy NGOs and funding support from cooperate CSR programs. It is impossible to point out which is the more essential factor, the community’s readiness and potential or the external support. Therefore, it is not an overstatement to conclude that the cooperation from all actors is contributing to its success as illustrated within the hybrid governance concept: one actor bears the cost of another and mutually benefits one another.

Relationship within Local Community

Upon receiving public approval of the micro-hydro power plant in the public hearing session, Mae Jo locals contributed their labor as shares to the group. There was also a formation and founding of the Wai Jo juvenile group. The Wai Jo group consisted of young community members who previously worked within the town, earning daily wages and had to comeback to support their parents’ initiated project. The group is a result of advocacy based on the local patriotism. The ultimate intention the formation of Wai Jo was to pass on work from the one generation to another.

Negotiation with Local State authority

In the operation, co-management of the water facilities around the Mae Lerm dike could be identified. Frist, permission was requested for additional construction of the water way for the project as the physical dike belongs to RID. However, within its vicinities, which were documented as public area belong to the Department of Treasury, a piece of land that was dug into the water canal that led water from the dike to the plant was rented from the Department of Treasury with an annual payment. Prior the project, the water user group (consisting of community members) coordinated with an RID stakeholder for the water release schedule. Since the power station had been in operation, the water user group is now coordinating with the VSPP technicians instead of RID officers. Additionally, the project area constructed under TAO’s responsible land is scheduled for TAO’s annual inspection. This signified that some state’s authority over local resources is transferred to the community to take part in the management.

The relationship between the Mae Jo community and state authority is a formation of
local co-management of water resources. Mae Jo can be described as a “modern community” where the community approached the state for development projects (Sangkhamaanee 2013). An argument opposing conventional community development discourse said that the state was described as “ruling” and locality as “resisting.” Rather than a local community being destroyed and penetrated by the state, modern communities have participated in the initiation of governance projects that serve their aspiration in the way that fit the aim of the state (Walker 2012; Sangkhamaanee 2013). When the community had asked the state to transfer the authority to look after their respective local resources, the top-down power relation was dissolved, and co-management was then formed. However, the state could only grant permission only when conditions had been met to the official procedure and they hold full authority to abort the proposal. The community, therefore, manages to negate both official and unofficial bureaucracy that fit the State’s requirements for the purpose of improving their livelihood and community development.

In short, communities, such as Mae Jo, approach the state for the sake of their own development project using their overlapped vested interests between the state and civilians to foster national and community owned decision-making. After successful negotiations, legitimacy transferred from the state in the form of a local co-management governance regime.

**NGO Fostering Approvals from Central Authorities**

The existence of EforE was helpful because, this foundation has a very strong relationship with the energy related authorities as it was founded by one of the most respectable civil servants in the area of energy, Dr. Piyasawas Amaranand. The fact that foundation acts as a catalyst supporting MoE policy, transferring national policy into actual practice in the ground makes the negotiation between the community and central agencies’ offices much easier.

“...Without EforE, the project wouldn’t have successfully happen. We are normal people. We are not familiar with official procedure and we have no connection to the official at all. The foundation can do wonders in dealing with central offices. We simply couldn’t do it by ourselves.” (Prasarn, enterprise chairman 2014)

Mr. Prasarn, the enterprise leader pointed out the importance of role of the foundation that is equipped with knowledge of official procedures and connection, which makes this actor an essential ingredient for this project to happen.

In the eye of EforE, the Mae Jo community’s power project could be an influential model that is useful for further advocacy efforts for similar projects.

“...This project has significance because it can represent community power project for other project to replicate. The replication of material and legal aspect of it is however, not as important as the community empowerment and preparedness for the project …”

This case, the Mae Jo community and EforE had mutual interest to collaborate, as the community needed the NGO’s knowledge and

ปีที่ 45 ฉบับที่ 1 มกราคม-มิถุนายน 2558 47
social capitals for the negotiation, while the NGO needed a successful model project for future advocacy efforts.

**Corporate CSR Supported Funding**

The Thai Oil Corporation is the most prominent reflection on globalizations impact onto the village’s project. With the name listed on the stock exchange of Thailand, it requires a good profile on company’s responsibility for the society. Consequently, a sum of CSR money funding was provided for the project. Thai Oil Company is a famous crude Oil processing companies in Thailand, receiving the 2013 CSR award. The Corporation stated on their position statement that:

“We are a part of the lifecycle of the extractive business... We take all measures to ensure that we minimize our impacts... in ensuring operational excellence though the promotion of efficient operational activities minimizing our waste streams and optimizing the use of natural resources.” (Thaioil 2011)

The Mae Jo’s Micro-Hydro project achieved one of their objectives regarding the supports for renewable energy projects. It is understandable that Corporations easily grant RE project as compensation for the climate change affected pollution it creates. However, cooperating actors are less likely to address environmental issue unless they are proven more costly: branding image, customer preference, etc. (Delmas and Young 2009). In other word, CSR is tied to their customers’ preference. An observation from the interview with Thaioil Group CSR team suggested that although they truly care about the environment and society, there is also the aspect about producing good reports for the yearly review and the stock exchange requirement to consider.

It was the implication within the principal of sales that corporations appear environmentally responsible for customer satisfaction. Thus the CSR scheme was imposed within their respective operations. Nonetheless, Thaioil CSR fund to the Mae Jo project mutually benefitted both partners; Corporate CSR profile for Thaioil group and funding for the project.

**Opportunities**

Since community VSPP project is the future of Thailand’s power development project. To meet the target of 25 percent renewable energy by 2020, it is crucial for policy makers to eliminate challenges and facilitate the process to attract private, as well as community, investors into the VSPP sector. Thus far, a number of challenges have been addressed and solutions were proposed from experts in regards to the promotion of community VSPP projects.

The concept of elimination of the complex approval processes, as well as customary bribes to officers have been proposed. After the Thailand 2014 coup de tat, a reform on the energy sector was under one objective for Thailand’s reform agenda. There were reshuffles of technocrats in Ministry of Energy, other independent agencies including the ERC and state enterprise such as the PTT group. Dr. Piyasawas Amranand has been placed in the executive board of PTT so that reforms ideas were to be expected. He quoted in a news article that:
“The reason Thailand RE development has been in a slow rate of 5%, a worrying rate that its 25 percent Renewable Energy goal to be met on time. The main challenges were created by state agencies, especially within the factory approval process (RN 4) under DIW responsibility. The RN. 4 is almost unnecessary because there are many other Act that regulate more effectively than RN. 4... To counter those challenges, varieties of approvals should be combined to avoid complications which are loopholes for corruptions. One action is to eliminate the RN.4 out of the VSPP approval process...” (Piyasawas Amranand 2014)

In the response to the energy decentralization agenda, the solar roof “one Tambon, one Mega Watt” scheme was a proposed, “Mega project,” by the Yingluck Government in 2013. It was claimed that the project should promote RE and generate additional income within the community (Promastertech 2014). The project aimed to respond to Thailand’s energy security agenda, environmental agenda, as well as the dissemination of technology agenda. However, experts (EforE 2014) doubted the accountability of the project because the Build Operate Transfer (BOT) agreement would raise the questions about the ownership of the assets and whether or not the community would benefit, where as the potential for the private investors to monopolize within small number of companies was significant. Moreover, corruption could occur within the procurement process and the share of benefits would be between big supply companies and local politicians.

However, there is a hope since complications within VSPP approval process is being raised into public attentions. However, in the initial state of development, there are still loopholes. Research must with the hope that future projects, similar to this, can be realized and benefit local communities so that the ideal objective of “inclusive development” can be met.

Conclusion

To raise the awareness of policy makers to recognize the importance of Renewable Energy for community VSPP projects in response to the national agenda to stimulate Renewable Energy production, Mae Jo poses as a successful model of green and inclusive energy business development. The community adopted the hybrid form of governance as they incorporate other actors into the project to bear the costs that the community cannot deal with by itself. The community used their personal resources to negotiate with local governments for co-management of state’s asset (RID dike). EforE, the energy advocacy NGO, facilitates the approval process between central agencies as well as matching the community’s project with the funding from Thaioil group’s CSR budget. Every actor had contributed to the project and at the same time received mutual benefits. The Mae Jo VSPP project was successful not because they can sustain the operation financially, but they have created a platform for local natural resources management within their locality, which brings the increase increased youth participation and
engagement, community contributions to protect their forest, etc. However, there are challenges, which are mostly caused by the state’s conditions, and the ambiguities in RE policies that hamper RE development at the local level. But since RE is becoming a key platform on the Junta’s reform agenda, some issues such, as the RN. 4, may soon to be sorted.

This paper argues that the formation of Public-Private-Social Partnership (PPSP) in the Mae Jo community VSPP project illustrates a local resource management model, which is a contributing factor for success in its establishment and operation. However, the project faced challenges caused by government norms and bureaucracy in the registration process due to low recognition of similar initiatives. This is an important challenge to overcome for similar future community VSPP projects. The paper points out the urgency to include community VSPP into the new REDP and the need for the regulation amendment to facilitate the change, while also raising public awareness for decentralized RE production.
References


Center for Clean Air Policy. 2012. Small power producers play key role. Supporting small-scale renewable energy producers: Thailand aims for rapid growth in renewable energy. Bangkok: CCAP.


Social enterprise and promotion of safe migration among returned migrants: Case studies of a credit union in Bone district of South Sulawesi province Indonesia*

Fatimana Agustinanto**
afatimana@yahoo.com

Abstract

Indonesia is one of the largest sending countries of migrant workers in the Southeast Asia Region. There are approximately 4.3 million documented and 1.7 million undocumented Indonesian migrant workers living abroad (U.S. Department of State, 2012). Unfortunately, significant numbers of them migrated unsafely thus vulnerable to be trafficked in the destination countries. The Government of Indonesia and civil society organizations have been working together to promote safe migration and address human trafficking. This paper is trying to (1) examine civil society group involvement in promoting safe migration, (2) investigate credit union roles in promoting safe migration through economic security, and (3) examine whether credit unions, in providing a better economic security, have promoted safe migration and prevented potential trafficked person from being trafficked. This paper draws on fieldwork conducted on June-July 2013 in Bone District of South Sulawesi Province Indonesia as one of the sending areas in the country. The paper argues that economic security, marital status, age and gender are the four important factors that influenced the decision of returned migrants to or not to migrate in the future. Moreover, strong economic security that possessed by returned migrants does not automatically guarantee them to migrate safely in the future. The paper concludes that Credit Union (CU) Pammase in Bone District currently has not been able yet to strengthen economic security of its members. In addition, it can only increase a little bit understanding of the members on how to migrate safely. As a result, the members are still vulnerable to be trafficked in the future. Self-financing problems as well as management challenges are two factors, among others, that prevent the credit union from achieving its mission. In order to better strengthen economic security and promote safe migration among its members, credit unions must be managed professionally and its staffs’ capacity strengthened.

Keywords: social enterprise, migration, Sulawesi, Indonesia

---

* This article is developed from a paper presented in the 3rd International Conference on International Relations and Development (ICIRD 2013) on “Beyond the Borders: Building a Regional Commons” at Chulalongkorn University, 22-23 August 2013.

** Head of Office, Counter Human Trafficking Specialist, International Catholic Migration Commission.
Introduction

Indonesia is one of the sending countries of migrant workers in the Southeast Asia Region. Unfortunately, many of migrant workers have limited access to information on how to migrate safely abroad for work (Human Rights Study Center of Hasanudin University, 2009, 23). As a result, many of them are migrating unsafely leading to situation where they are vulnerable to be trafficked abroad. The problem of human trafficking in Indonesia is considered serious. The Government of Indonesia reported that around 4.3 million documented Indonesian migrant workers are abroad and in 2011 it is estimated minimum 86,000 of them are trafficked in the destination countries such as Saudi Arabia, Malaysia, Singapore, Taiwan and Hong Kong (U.S. Department of State 2012). Although the The Government of Indonesia has been working to address the problems but they do not fully comply with the minimum standard for eliminating it (U.S. Department of State 2012).

South Sulawesi Province especially Bone District is one of the migrant workers sending areas in the country (Sugiarti 2006, 274). In 2007, the South Sulawesi Government recorded there were 1,500 migrant workers that were placed legally to various countries and in addition to this, they estimated around 150,000 migrated unsafely. (Human Rights Study Center of Hasanudin University 2009, 59). It was also reported that labor export agencies and middlemen often falsified the identity of migrant workers from Bone (Human Rights Study Center of Hasanudin University 2009, 58). The migrant workers from this province are trafficked for labor exploitation purposes to Sarawak and Sabah of East Malaysia Province (Human Rights Study Center of Hasanudin University 2009, 61).

The dynamic of economic development in developed countries provide job opportunities for both high and low skilled labors. As a result, people from less developed countries migrate to more developed countries to find better opportunity. This phenomenon, outlined in more detail below, is also known as globalization (Morgan 2010, 17-20). Malaysia and Saudi Arabia have become two main destination countries for many Indonesian migrant workers. In the last seven years, the Government has placed legally more than 6.7 million migrant workers to these two countries (BNP2TKI 2012). John Keynes a well-known economist said that migration is a natural action of individual to be able to escape from poverty (Turner and Khondker 2010, 4). Many Indonesian migrant workers said that limited job opportunities in their village and the willingness to increase income and improve their living conditions are the main reasons that push them to leave their home to migrate abroad for work (Human Rights Study Center of Hasanudin University 2009, 76). Moreover, labor shortage in destination countries especially to work in the informal sector or also known as dangerous, difficult and dirty jobs as domestic worker and plantation worker has become pull factor for them to work in abroad.
Massey et.al. (1994, 711), noted that the New Economics of International Migration Theory argues that markets especially in developing countries are often absent, imperfect or inaccessible. It creates risks to income, production and property for many poor households. As a result, to overcome the risks, the households will send their members to work in other countries since it offers higher wages. Additionally, the New Economics Theory also acknowledges significant roles played by migrant workers working in abroad in the economic life of the sending area through remittances sent. According to this theory, the remittances sent will have non-unitary effect since it will be used for investment rather than consumption of normal goods. The poor household receiving the remittances will be able to use it as a capital and start new productive economic initiatives.

Remittance sent by migrant workers to Indonesia is quite significant. Bank of Indonesia (2013) noted that in 2012, remittance sent reached $US 7,018 million. Data from Bank of Indonesia (2013) and survey by International Organization for Migration (2010) found out that migrant workers work in Malaysia and Saudi Arabia contributed most of the remittances and sent it through banks and western union. Only few of them hand carried the remittances. The survey also found out that the remittances mostly used by migrant workers’ families for daily needs, house renovation, purchase furniture and equipment and continue child education.

In 2011, a civil society organization based in Bone District of South Sulawesi Province named Lembaga Pemberdayaan Perempuan or LPP (Women’s for Empowerment Organization) established a social enterprise in the form of financial cooperative/credit union (CU) named Pammase (Self-Help) with aim to enhance economic security and promote safe migration practice targeted to migrant workers through one of them, the creation of sustainable financial services that can meet their specific needs. Using Social Enterprise especially in the form of cooperative to promote safe migration and address trafficking problem is very unique and innovative. Unfortunately, research showed that very few CSOs in Indonesia used this as a mean to address the problem (Agustinanto, et.al. 2006, 387-388). Furthermore, there were no researches conducted that specifically looking at the contributions of social enterprise or credit union in promoting safe migration and addressing trafficking problem. Research on social enterprise subject is still in the early stage of growth. Therefore, data on effectiveness and negative outcomes and impacts of social enterprise are limited (Edwards 2011, 87-88). Thus, the specific focus of this paper is to examine whether CU Pammase, in providing a better economic security, has promoted safe migration and prevented potential trafficked person from being trafficked.

The paper is divided into several sections. The first section will describe about the concepts used, they are: migrant workers, credit union, social enterprise, economic
security and safe migration. The second section will discuss about research findings and analysis. And the last section will discuss about conclusion and recommendations.

All data and information for this paper were gathered using qualitative methods such as in-depth interview, observation and content analysis. Total of 23 informants including key informants were interviewed during field research held on June and July 2013 in Bone District of South Sulawesi Province Indonesia. The interviews were conducted using a semi-structured interview guide with the LPP Director and the CU Pammase management and staff, the returned migrant workers, including both CU and non-CU members and also relevant government officials, staff of other cooperatives and officials of local banks. Data collected from interview was transcribed prior coded and analyzed. Observation was used particularly to observe communication and interactions between CU Pammase staff and member particularly when the member had financial transaction with the CU Pammase staff both at the CU Pammase’s office and member’s house. In addition, written sources that relevant both in Bahasa Indonesia and English were analyzed through document research. Through this documentary analysis, relevant data and information were collected including: existing knowledge on social enterprise and credit union including CU Pammase; the role of CSOs in promoting safe migration; the establishment of CU Pammase; and, finally, the concepts of economic security, safe migration, human trafficking, social protection and International Migration Theory.

**Conceptual Framework**

This paper used the conceptual framework below to guide data collection process and analyze the findings.
In the context of this paper, social protection is understood both as social protection mechanisms that used by the migrants to face risks at their home villages such as unemployment and poverty (Sabates-Wheeler and Waite 2003, 17) as well as effort to protect and empower migrants as vulnerable groups from social and economic risks. As social protection mechanism, migrants migrate to abroad for work in order to survive from unemployment and poverty. Furthermore, the establishment of social enterprise in the form of CU Pammase is one of social protection forms that provided to migrants to protect and empower them so that it can reduce their social and economic vulnerability.

This paper is trying to (1) examine civil society group involvement in promoting safe migration, (2) investigate credit union roles in promoting safe migration through economic security, and (3) examine whether credit union, in providing a better economic security, has promoted safe migration and prevented potential trafficked person from being trafficked. In order to achieve the first objective, the author conducted documents review and interview with LPP Director and CU Pammase management and staff. By doing this, the involvement and role of LPP in establishing CU Pammase could be found out. Moreover, to achieve the second objective, the author also conducted documents review and interviews with CU Pammase management and staff particularly to collect data on the profile of CU Pammase including structure, programs, services and how they conduct their business. Finally, to achieve the third objective, the author conducted a series of in-depth interview with key informants including: twelve returned migrant workers out of which six are members of CU Pammase and six are non-members with the aim of collecting data on income security, job security, their reasons in joining or not join CU Pammase, their past migration journey experience, their life experience after returning and joining CU Pammase, their motivation to or not to migrate abroad in the future and, finally, if they intend to, how will they migrate in the future. Lastly, a series of in-depth interviews were also conducted to obtain data on the perception and opinion of the relevant government officials, other cooperative staff and local bank staff on the impact of CU Pammase on the migrant worker community.

Before discussing the research findings, in order to provide more clarity, the paper will first briefly describe the concepts that used for this paper, they are: migrant workers, credit union, social enterprise, economic security and safe migration characteristics.

**Migrant Workers**

First the paper adopts the definition of migrant workers that stipulated under International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families. The convention defines migrant workers term as “a person who is to be engaged, is engaged or has been engaged in a remunerated activity in a State of which he or she is not a national”
Social enterprise and promotion of safe migration among returned migrants:
Case studies of a credit union in Bone District of South Sulawesi Province Indonesia

(International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, article 2 point 1). Indonesia has ratified this convention in April 2012 (Human Rights Watch 2012).

Credit Union

Credit Union (CU) is defined as “member-owned, not-for-profit financial cooperatives that provide savings, credit and other financial services to their members” (World Council of Credit Union 2013). CU has unique characters different from commercial banks and other financial institutions (World Council of Credit Union 2013). In terms of structure, CU is not for profit motive. The profit gained will be maximally reinvested to the community or to sustain its services. In addition, members of CU usually share a common tie such as similarity of occupation, place of live, etc. Furthermore, income generated by CU comes from the savings, share and deposits of the members and not from outside institution or donation. Members who invested their money to CU automatically own CU and they have the rights to elect or to be elected as volunteer board directors. One member has one vote in the election of board of directors regardless how much they have invested in CU. The volunteer board directors will decide what is the best for the CU. The uniqueness of CU is guided by its principles agreed internationally which are democratic structure, service to the members and social purpose (Credit Union Central of Indonesia 2013).

In terms of financial services, in general, CU offers the same financial services like commercial banks such as savings, credits, remittance and insurance. However, CU offers competitive financial services and more benefits compare to commercial banks such as higher interest rates and no administrative fee on savings as well as lower rates and no collateral on loans (World Council of Credit Union 2013). In addition, different from the banks, CU is also independent entity and applies self-financing model, which is using its own resources to finance and sustain its services. CU mainly uses savings, share and deposits that invested by the members to finance the loan products. They mostly do not rely on outside capital. Furthermore, CU also gives added value to its member’s life. Through the financial services and products they offered, CU is not only playing role as financial institution but also as problem solver for the community that mostly not being served maximally by the commercial banks. For example, using various loan products, members can start their own small business and continue their children’s education. And by investing their money to CU, they even can own a financial institution and exercise their democratic decision-making rights (World Council of Credit Union 2013). This is something that they cannot get when they join with commercial banks.

Social Enterprise

CU is one of the forms of Social Enterprise (Alter 2007, 26). Social Enterprise is defined as “businesses with a clear social purpose, have the power to deliver profound and sustainable change for the benefit of all” (Crainer 2012,16). Based on their mission orientation, there are three classification of social enterprise, they are: mission centric, mission related and unrelated to mission (Alter 2007, 23). CU is categorized as mission centric social enterprise, which is an
enterprise that established to solve the social problem in the community using a self-financing model. It is important to note that the mission of this social enterprise is in line with its founder missions.

Social enterprise is doing business for social purpose and not for profit purpose. As a business entity, social enterprise is run not different from private sector in terms of financial discipline, innovation and determination. However, what make it difference from private sector or private sector that practicing social responsibility is that profit gained by social enterprise will be used to solve social problems in the community they served and also to support the sustainability of its services rather than distributed maximally to its owners and shareholders (Alter 2007, 18-20).

**Economic Security**

Economic security is defined as an assured basic level of income usually derived from productive and remunerative work, or in the last resort from some publicly financed or community safety net where that basic level of income will ensure that individuals will, at least, be allowed to have the threshold or minimum level of economic welfare (Sarntisart and Pongkijvorasin 2006, 55-56). Economic security analysis is divided into two, which are micro and macro level. Micro-level analysis focuses more at individual, household or local communities particularly on the protection of their livelihoods whereas macro-level analysis focuses more at nation-states level and their engagement in the international economic system (Dent 2007, 204-205). This paper focuses at the micro-level analysis of economic security particularly income security and job security of the individual and closely related with the issue of their livelihoods including poverty and unemployment. Poverty is condition where minimum income that earned by individual through his livelihood cannot support or maintain his/her normal life. On the other hand, unemployment is a situation where labor is under utilized and it has consequences on shortfall of income and consumption of the individual (Wongboonsin, et al. 2006, 38).

**Safe Migration Characteristics**

International Labor Organization/ILO (2012) noted at least there are 8 characteristics of safe migration, they are: (1) Be informed: Before taking decision to migrate, prospective migrants are advised to talk with different people including the returned migrants, friends, families, and non-government organizations and collect from them all information regarding culture, life styles in destination country, challenges faced when working abroad, migration costs that should be beared and type of job that will be doing. (2) Migrate legally through legal channel. (3) Check the legality and reputation of the recruitment agency through local authority. (4) Sign a work contract with the recruitment agency and with employer before leaving the country. (5) Keep hold of the documents such as passport, work contract, work visa and identity card. Make photocopies of it and leave some copies with family. (6) Prepare for emergencies by recording telephone numbers of embassy, non-government organizations and trade union. (7) Make sure to have a network of support in abroad and (8) Do actions if face problem at the work place such as talk to the supervisors or the agency and
if necessary, ask for mediation assistance from the embassy, non-government organizations or trade union.

**Analysis and Discussion**

**Civil Society Groups Involvement in Promoting Safe Migration through Economic Security**

The involvement of civil society groups in promoting safe migration through economic security particularly in Bone was started in 2011 when LPP Bone as one of civil society groups that very active in addressing gender inequality established CU *Pammase*. CU was established from the “top” instead from the “bottom”. The establishment of CU was part of the project titled “Promote access to remittances in selected rural areas of Indonesia through the formation of Migrant Workers’ Organizations, Micro Finance Institution and Self Help Groups”. This project was financially supported by Ford Foundation as the donor and implemented by Geneva-based NGO named International Catholic Migration Commission (ICMC) in collaboration with LPP Bone. The project was started from September 2010 and ended in March 2012 (19 months). The project was created with concern that debt bondage has been recognized as one of the major causes of trafficking of women and men from Bone District of South Sulawesi Province Indonesia to Sabah in Malaysia. Furthermore, local the Government of Bone had no strategy to empower migrant workers who remained very poor although they are migrating to abroad frequently. Therefore, migration abroad for work had not been able to ‘build economic security’ for the majority of Bone’s population. The goal of the project was to promote access to remittances and to maximize its benefits for poor and disadvantaged migrants from Bone District with a view to increase their economic security in Indonesia and prevent debt bondage abroad.

Prior and after the establishment of CU *Pammase*, ICMC provided intensive technical assistance to LPP Bone. Prior the establishment of CU, ICMC and LPP Bone conducted an assessment mission to Sabah Malaysia involving 120 migrant workers to generate remittances-related information such as instruments chosen, costs, advantages and difficulties encountered. Furthermore, ICMC facilitated LPP Bone staffs as well as candidates of management of CU *Pammase* to visit successful CU in Central Java Province to see how they work. In terms of structure, ICMC also assisted LPP Bone to select CU *Pammase*’s first board of experts, management and staffs. Members of board of experts of CU *Pammase* were selected both from internal and external candidates. Furthermore, the members of management were selected from village leaders and mostly from villages where many migrant workers are coming from. Director of LPP Bone was also selected as member of management as well as chairperson of CU. Management is not-paid position and responsible to lead the operation of CU with assistance from the staffs who are responsible for day-to-day operations of CU. According to organization charter (*Anggaran Dasar*) of CU article 21, management has to serve for 3 years period. In regard to staffs of CU, they were selected from external of CU and also internal of LPP Bone. They are responsible for various positions such
as manager, secretary, finance officer and field officer. After the structure was established, ICMC also assisted CU in creating organization charter (Anggaran Dasar) and internal policy (Anggaran Rumah Tangga). It is important to note that all members of board of experts, supervisors and management were not selected and approved by CU members as it should be and regulated in the organization charter (Anggaran Dasar) and internal policy (Anggaran Rumah Tangga). ICMC and LPP Bone Director played important roles in recruiting and appointing them. After the establishment of CU, ICMC provided various trainings to the management and staffs such as product development, marketing and accounting techniques. Financial support was also provided to CU Pammase especially to support the roll out of its new product portfolios.

CU Pammase Works in Promoting Safe Migration through Economic Security

CU Pammase offers financial products not so much different from commercial banks such as saving and loan. However, it offers more competitive products than bank especially since it offers higher interest rate with no administration fee on saving and lower interest rate with no collateral on loan. In terms of saving, it offers various products such as mandatory, daily, student, children’s education expenses planning, pension and group saving. Furthermore, for loan, it also offers various products such as capitalization, productive, consumptive, seasonal and group loan. In addition to saving and loan products, CU also provides health and life insurance benefits to the members. More interestingly, it offers loan that can be used by potential migrants to finance their migration costs and also remittances services. To be eligible to get loan, the policy of CU says that new member should join CU for minimum 3 months, participates in the education program and possesses at least two saving products, which are Pension or Children’s Education Expenses Planning Saving. During that 3 months period, CU management and staffs will also observe and review his/her behaviors in saving. If he/she is consistent in saving then he/she could be considered to receive loan.

In addition to financial services, CU Pammase also offers other service, which is dissemination of messages on safe migration. Risks of doing illegal migration and the need to have passport prior migration are type of messages that disseminated. Usually, these messages are disseminated together with information about CU and its products. CU staffs also teach the potential members on how to create family budget. This topic is taught to enable potential and current members to allocate money to be saved every month.

Since its establishment in August 2011, the growth of CU members has been increasing gradually. As of May 2013, CU has served total 101 members who live in 11 villages within 4 sub-districts in Bone. Members are not only returned migrants but also families of migrant workers and general public such as teacher, farmer and low ranking government officials. The staffs of CU apply pro-active approach in recruiting new members. Pro-active approach is conducted through dissemination of information on CU and its products during village discussion events as well as through dissemination of brochure to potential new members done by current members.
For members who already received loan from CU, they are also expected to recruit at least 2 new members.

CU Pammase also applies unique approaches in running the business. The staffs pro-actively go to the villages regularly to take deposit from or to disburse loan to members. In one village, CU also has one volunteer who collect saving and loan installment from members. It was also observed that CU staffs give more personal approach to members. Staffs of CU usually called members with their nickname and also talked with them about other personal stuffs such as their daily life, business, local politics or family during transaction. This kind of interaction and communication are never seen in the commercial banks.

Obstacles Faced by CU Pammase in Providing Better Economic Security and Promoting Safe Migration

CU faced several obstacles in running the business, they were: inconsistency in implementing organization charter (Anggaran Dasar) and internal policy (Anggaran Rumah Tangga), lack of capital, limited capacity of staffs and numbers of volunteers including limited knowledge on how to do safe migration among them. The sections below describe more detail on these.

Inconsistency in Implementing Internal Policy and Regulation

CU Pammase since its establishment in 2011, based on organization charter (Anggaran Dasar) of article 13, is supposed to conduct at least 2 (two) annual member meetings already. However, until May 2013, CU has not conducted yet. According to the policy, annual member meeting is the highest forum where management should report on the progress of CU to the members. In addition, the forum could be also used to evaluate and enact new strategic policies such as new interest rate for saving and loan products for next year as well as to distribute CU profit to members. Although one member of board supervisors already voiced about the importance to organize this meeting very soon, it seems that the other members of board directors and management do not aware about the importance to have this meeting. The paper argues that organization charter and internal policy (Anggaran Dasar dan Anggaran Rumah Tangga) are not understood well by them. In addition, the paper also argues that some members of management were very hesitant to voice this to the Chairperson of CU since she (who also became Director of LPP Bone) was playing important roles in establishing CU since very beginning and in appointing them as member of the management. It is very important to be consistent to have this annual member meeting regularly because annual member meeting is one of indicators to measure whether one particular CU is “healthy” or not. It is also to ensure that management is still transparent and accountable to members so that members in the longer run can still trust CU as financial institution.

Limited Capacity of Staffs and Number of Volunteers

Although CU offers various financial products to its members, it was found that many of the members do not utilize all of the products
offered such as pension saving, group saving, productive loan, consumptive loan, group loan and migrant workers placement loan. Even, there are members who are categorized as passive members since they do not utilize CU financial products except mandatory saving. The paper argues that this happened because CU *Pammase* staffs did not conduct proper assessment against current financial needs of the members and did not maximize in conducting product marketing. Currently, only two paid staffs run CU. If the staffs go to the field to do the works then no staff stays at the office to provide members with services. CU ideally should recruit and train more volunteers. This is to increase its productivity without have to worry about increasing of operational costs.

CU was only able to increase a little bit the knowledge of its members on how to do safe migration. From 8 (eight) safe migration characteristics as discussed earlier, CU was only able to promote one characteristic, which is migrate legally through legal channel such as migrating using proper travel document like passport and work visa. It was also found out that two characteristics which are: (1) Be Informed regarding culture, life styles in destination country, challenges faced when working abroad, migration costs that should be beared and type of job that will be doing as well as (2) Possession of network of support in abroad, were naturally possessed by the returned migrants since they were migrating with the assistance of families, relatives or friends who already worked in abroad before. The other five characteristics of safe migrations are not understood by the returned migrants, they are: (1) Check the legality and reputation of the recruitment agency, (2) Sign a work contract with the recruitment agency and employer before leaving the country, (3) Keep hold of the documents such as passport, work contract, work visa and identity card, (4) Prepare for emergencies by recording telephone numbers of embassy, non-government organizations and trade union and (5) Talk to the supervisors or the agency if experience problems at work. The paper also argues that staffs of CU itself have limited knowledge on 8 characteristics of safe migration. Furthermore, they were not equipped with printed awareness raising materials on safe migration messages to be distributed such as leaflet, brochure or comic book. Lastly, the paper also argues that frequency of awareness raising events conducted were not intensive and massive enough.

### Lack of Capital

As like many other CUs, CU *Pammase* depends on three types of capital, they are: (1) own capital such as main saving, mandatory saving, reserve fund and grant, (2) loan capital such as member saving, loan from third party that regulated by special regulation and (3) capital participation such as capital not from member that regulated by special regulation. In the beginning of its operation, CU *Pammase* depended on grant from Ford Foundation and ICMC especially to support the roll out of its new financial portfolios, salary of staffs, and operational costs. After the project with ICMC finished in March 2012, CU *Pammase* still received financial and technical assistance for another 6 months from the Ford Foundation. Since then, CU *Pammase*, like many other CUs, depends very much from members saving to finance their loan products and operation costs.
Due to lack of massive product marketing as discussed previously, not all CU Pammase members become active members and saving their money regularly. It was also found out that CU was applying prudent policy in receiving new members. Management and staffs of CU believe that prospective members should have motivation to develop CU and not only want to get loan from CU. As a result, CU has lack of capital and limited capacity to finance its loan products. In order to overcome lack of capital and increase its capacity to finance the loan products, CU Pammase needs to aggressively mobilize other sources of income such as grant from third party including from local, foreign government and other international development agencies. This approach is acceptable by internal policy (Anggaran Rumah Tangga) of CU. However, this kind of grant needs to be treated differently from members saving and should be regulated with special regulation so that it will not create bad financial implication for CU Pammase in the future and can further maintain CU Pammase’s independence as member own cooperative.

Relation between CU, Economic Security and Future Decision of the Returned Migrants

The paper argues that economic security has become important factor that influence the decision of the returned migrants to or not to migrate again in the future. However, the paper also believes that economic security is not the only factor that influencing. Other factors that also important and influenced the decisions of the returned migrants to or not to migrate in the future are marital status, age and gender. The paper also argues that good economic security does not automatically change the behavior of the returned migrants to migrate safely in the future because the component of safe migration is not simple and not always related with economic factors. The way that will be chosen by migrants to migrate in the future is influenced very much by their past migration experiences and personal preferences.

It was found out that the first group who has big aspiration to migrate again in the future is male, married with children and young (below 45) migrants particularly those who do not possess good economic security such as jobless and no regular income. The second group who also has big aspiration to migrate again in the future is single, young, both female and male migrants who do not have good economic security. Interestingly those who possess quite better economic security also have aspirations to migrate again in the future. This third group is young male and married with children. Their motivation to migrate is to earn more business capital to expand their business activities at home. They are member of CU but unfortunately CU could not answer their needs for big amount of business capital loan.

The fourth group is those who have no aspiration to migrate again in the future. They are both male and female, married with children and old (above 45) migrants who possess good economic security. This group prefers to stay home mainly because they are no longer young to work in abroad and now they have sufficient income by doing farming. In the past, all of them were successful migrants in abroad who were able to invest their money in agricultural assets such as rice fields, plantation and cattle. The fifth group...
is also those who have no aspiration to migrate again in the future. They are both female and male, married with children and young (below 45) migrants with good economic security. Female migrants, most of them currently depend on remittances sent by their husband for main income. Their husbands are still in abroad for work and send money regularly. In addition to good economic security, the other factor that makes them prefer to stay home is the obligation imposed to them to take care children who are currently in school. For male, the same reasons also applied. He has stable job and regular income from his profession as head of village and farmer. In addition, he also prefers to be closed with his family and children.

It is important to note that although some of the returned migrants, member of CU, possess good economic security but CU Pammase has limited contribution to the improvement of their economic security. Most of them possess good economic security from doing farming and small business without business capital support from CU. They established the business mostly from their own past investment as well as from current remittances sent by their husband in abroad. Despite of CU limitations, CU is expected will be able to fulfill and protect the future needs of its members particularly their future children’s education expenses through its saving product they utilized.

It was also found out that the migrants who have both good and bad economic security do not possess comprehensive understanding on how to do safe migration abroad for work. This will put them in the vulnerable situation to be trafficked in the future. They also believe that based on their past migration experiences, migrating abroad for work using legal channel and document were time consuming, costly and could not protect them maximally in abroad. Therefore, many of them prefer to migrate illegally or without proper documents in the future since it is faster, less expensive and could prevent them from being exploited abroad.

**Conclusion and Recommendations**

CU Pammase has not been able yet to strengthen economic security as well as to promote safe migration of its members, leaving the members remains vulnerable to be trafficked in the future. In its young age, CU Pammase now faces some challenges, they are: limited capacity of management and staffs, lack of capital, and lack of volunteer. CU is a promising financial institution that can compete with commercial banks as long as it is run and managed professionally by capable and dedicated staffs and volunteer. Organization charter and internal policy (Anggaran Dasar dan Anggaran Rumah Tangga) of CU need to be understood by all staffs and members and implemented consistently. Furthermore, alternative sources of income such as grant from third party need to be secured to boost CU capital.

Economic security is the most important factor that influenced the future migration decision of the returned migrants. In addition to economic security, marital status, gender and age of the returned migrants are also important factors that influenced the returned migrants to or not to migrate in the future. Possession of good economic security does not automatically
change the behavior of the returned migrants to migrate safely in the future. Some safe migration characteristics are not related with economic factors. The way that will be chosen by the returned migrants to migrate in the future is influenced very much by their past migration experiences and personal preferences. To better increase the knowledge and ability of the returned migrants to do safe migration, it is important to train CU Pammase staffs on safe migration characteristics and equip them with printed awareness raising materials to be distributed. Furthermore, periodic and massive awareness-raising events need to be conducted more in the future.

References

Agustinanto, Fatimana, Keri Lasmi Sugiarti and Eka Rahmawati. 2006. Emerging issue: Counter-trafficking efforts from government, non government organization and civil society’. Keri Lasmi, Abhijit Dasgupta and Jamie Davis (Ed.). *When they were sold: Trafficking of women and girls in 15 provinces of Indonesia*. Indonesia: ICMC Indonesia and Solidarity Center.


Christian faith-based development: 
A case study of World Vision Foundation of 
Thailand in Karen hill tribe communities

Yee Kai Ling, Phoebe*
yeekailing@gmail.com

Abstract

There is a need to understand how faith-based development organisations (FBDOs) express 
their religious identity, values and beliefs in development practice. Using the World Vision Foundation 
of Thailand (WVFT) as a case study, this paper examines the extent to which Christian values, beliefs 
and identity shape the international organisation’s understanding of its development programme with 
Karen hill-tribe communities in Mae Sariang, northern Thailand.

This paper analyses World Vision’s concepts of ‘transformational development’ (TD), 
‘Christian Witness’ and church partnerships in practice, where development is not only the improvement 
of material well-being of the poor, but also their experience with God and spiritual development. 
These concepts are key aspects of the organisation’s mission. The extent of these efforts in influencing 
the development programmes and organisational culture at WVFT is examined.

Data collection is from both primary and secondary sources. An actor-oriented ethnographic 
approach is employed to understand the construction of knowledge relating to the religious beliefs of 
WVFT staff vis-à-vis that of the organization, the patterns of behaviour of WVFT staff, and relationships 
between WVFT staff and community members. Secondary sources like theological documents which 
guide WVFT’s values and beliefs, and programme documents were studied.

As an international FBDO, with roots in the American Protestant Christian movement to 
respond to social issues, World Vision has been seeking to align its Christian identity and mission 
globally and to maintain a balance between keeping its Christian values and pursuing development 
goals. At the same time, Thailand presents a unique context to study the national entity of World 
Vision as it is a Buddhist nation where understandings about development, including that of Christian 
FBDOs, are influenced by Buddhist beliefs.

* World Vision Foundation of Thailand.
Christian faith-based development: A case study of World Vision Foundation of Thailand in Karen hill tribe communities

This paper concludes that due to reasons of sensitivity in the Thai context, adaptations and interpretations of development by field workers, WVFT’s Christian values, beliefs and identity has been reproduced as variations of international guidelines with the co-existence of the ‘secular’ and ‘religious’. Furthermore, the extent to which they are demonstrated at the field level is limited. Considerations should hence be made on the steps that can be taken to bring about better integration and translation of faith into development practice by taking into account the contexts. In addition, integration should be carried in ways that not only reflect the faith-based identity of the organisation, but also bring about positive change, both physically and spiritually, to the intended beneficiaries.

Keywords: faith-based development organisation (FBDO), religious values and beliefs, Transformational Development, World Vision Thailand, Karen hill tribe

Introduction

There is a need to understand how faith-based development organisations (FBDOs) express their religious identity, values and beliefs in development practice. International FBDOs like World Vision have in place development concepts which are guided by their religious values and beliefs. Due to the varying contexts in which these organisations work, such understandings have been re-interpreted and contextualised at the national and field levels, resulting in variances in development practice. Using World Vision Foundation of Thailand (WVFT1) as a case study, this paper analyses the extent to which Christian values, beliefs and identity shape an international FBDO’s understanding of its mission and development programme at the field level within Karen hill-tribe communities in Mae Sariang, northern Thailand.

Thailand presents a unique context to study Christian faith-based development as it is a Buddhist nation where understandings about development, including that of Christian FBDOs, are influenced by Buddhist beliefs. Faith-based development in Thailand was traditionally carried out through Buddhist monks and temples which were seen as centres of communities to provide for the needy. Since the middle of the 19 century, Catholic and Protestant Christian missionaries arrived in Thailand with the aim of spreading their faiths and this was carried out through the meeting of social needs. WVFT’s identity as a Christian organisation presents itself to the intended beneficiaries and partners as carrying the goal of proselytism, which is not an accurate reflection of the organisation’s mission. In this context, Christian FBDOs have to navigate these

1 In this paper, the term ‘WVFT’ will be used to refer to the entity of World Vision International (‘WVI’) that is in Thailand; WVI is used to refer to the collective corporate body on the international level; and ‘World Vision’ is used to refer to the organization generally.
sensitivities while maintaining their Christian values and identity.

The review of the existing literature revealed that there is a need for 1) more in-depth research on the role of religion in the field of development (Bradley 2009; Clarke 2006; Deneulin and Rakodi 2010; Hoover 2010; Marshall 2011; Rennick 2013), and 2) more knowledge about community-based FBDOs in Thailand, especially in terms of how they demonstrate their values, beliefs and ethics in development practice (Ashley 2008; McCaskill and Kam 1997; Pongsapich and Kataleeradabhan 1997; Shigetomi, Tejapira, and Thongyou 2004; Horstmann 2011; Platz 2003). This paper engages with outstanding studies that have been done on World Vision in Christian contexts of South Africa and Zimbabwe (Bornstein 2001a; Bornstein 2001b; Bornstein 2005; de Wet 2013) and aims to contribute knowledge about World Vision’s efforts to integrate religion and development in the context of a predominantly Buddhist and Asian country.

This paper uses the concept of ‘FBDO’ to describe WVFT – an FBDO is understood to be motivated and guided by spiritual sources and their religious values and beliefs in their work involving development issues. At the same time, FBDOs are differentiated from secular development organizations by their concern with the spiritual well-being of the community members – while secular development organizations aim to raise the quality of life of their intended beneficiaries, they are “not specifically concerned with the non-physical nature of the individual” (Berger 2003, 35). This paper analyzes World Vision’s development term of ‘transformational development’ (TD) and the related concepts of ‘Christian Witness’ and church partnerships in understanding the extent that Christian values and beliefs influence development programmes of World Vision in Thailand (refer to Figure 1).
Figure 1 Conceptual Framework for understanding Christian values, beliefs and identity of WVFT in development practice

Research Methodology

In gathering the data for this paper, qualitative field research was the key methodology used, due to the ethnographic nature of the research which involves the study of people, their relationships with each other, their cultures and religious beliefs. Participatory observations were carried out as an intern from March to November 2014 at both World Vision’s Asia and Pacific Regional Office and WVFT, through attendance at regular staff devotions, work meetings and staff trainings. When in the field programme of WVFT (also known as ‘Area Development Programme’ or ADP), in Mae Sariang, northern Thailand, both participatory
and non-participatory observations were carried out. This study also uses observations that were made at another WVFT ADP during an informal day-long visit.

In-depth semi-structured qualitative interviews were carried out with four key informants from Mae Sariang ADP of WVFT and the World Vision South Asia-Pacific Regional Director for Faith and Development, 13 key informants and 18 households from the two selected Karen hill-tribe villages (Ban Pamak and Ban Mae Kanai, in Mae Sariang ADP) where WVFT works.

On top of data collection through primary sources, this study also analyzes secondary data, including World Vision’s documents relating to values, mission and identity, history, theology, and programme design and implementation. Community baseline studies carried out by WVFT were obtained to understand if there were attempts to understand the perceptions, value and belief systems of community members before its development intervention. In addition, photographs and planning documents relating to development activities (for example, children’s camps) in the research area were analysed.

Translators, both outside and within WVFT, were engaged to translate the interviews with speakers of Thai and Sgaw Karen (a dialect widely spoken by the WVFT ADP staff and community members in the selected field sites at Mae Sariang). To verify the accuracy of the interview responses, information gained from the informants was constantly triangulated throughout the period of the fieldwork.

Setting the Context – World Vision and Its Work in Thailand

World Vision International (WVI) has its roots in an American evangelist, Bob Pierce, who in 1950, responded to the needs of the children orphaned by the Korean War. Since its founding by a single missionary, WVI has morphed into one of the largest development organisations in the world and it was largely influenced by the ‘new evangelicalism’ Protestant Christian movement in America which took place during the 1940s to 1980s, which had an emphasis on social concerns (Bornstein 2005).

In the mid-1970s, after its realisation that its traditional evangelical identity was unsustainable, the organisation shifted from its missionary outlook to focus on more contemporary social issues of world poverty, relief and humanitarian aid. It was during this time that World Vision endorsed the United Nations’ definitions of human rights and targets for social improvements (Whaites 1999). In an effort to make the organisation more effective globally, a Declaration of Internationalisation was made and took effect from 31 May 1978. This Declaration essentially separated the organisation from its US-centric past with the creation of a partnership secretariat and a governing body which constituted the organisation’s constituents. The Declaration was also a response to pressures from non-Western field staff that expressed that the US office had “paternalistic and controlling tendencies” (King 2012, 933). The Declaration had an awkward mix of Christian and development jargon, in an effort to keep the church language but still express aims similar to humanitarian agencies. It was the first
document that placed greater emphasis on aid than evangelism.

Towards the end of the 1980s, signs of the organisation’s shift away from its evangelical core beliefs began to be apparent and there was a diversity of views on the meaning and the implications of its evangelical beliefs on its work. This brought about an unwieldy understanding of the organisation’s philosophy and identity. The World Vision President at that time made a decision to draft the Core Values, Mission Statement and Covenant of Partnership to align the identity, purpose and inter-office relationships (Whaites 1999). In the documents, the ethos of ‘following’ Jesus Christ through ‘Christian Witness’ was emphasised over the relatively aggressive message of Christian evangelism. Proselytism, where aid is disbursed with the coercion of religious conversion, was prohibited and instead, the focus was to demonstrate Christian concern in a culturally-sensitive manner. These documents remain relevant up to today. With this set of new documents, World Vision has been able to maintain a balance in keeping its Christian values and pursuing development goals.

Today, World Vision carries the identity of an international Christian non-profit organisation which focuses on relief, development and advocacy. Globally, WVI is explicit about its Christian identity. The development organisation is child-focused and uses a holistic approach in working with the world’s most vulnerable children, families and communities to overcome poverty and injustice. Currently, WVI works in almost 100 countries and has about 50,000 staff and volunteers worldwide (World Vision International 2014).

With this historical backdrop of World Vision on an international level, there can be better understanding on the extent of influence on Thailand office’s organisational ethos and structure. The tensions that exist between secular development and traditional Christian missions are not only in existence at the global level, but also in the Thai context.

In Thailand, World Vision started its work in 1972, working with orphans in Udon Thani Province. Subsequently, child support centres were set up in the Northern and Northeastern Province. In 1974, the organisation was registered and focused on the well-being of children, humanitarian emergency relief and Indochinese refugees at the Thai border. From 1980, WVFT changed its direction to community-based development, with focus on children and their families. Currently, WVFT works in 70 projects in 42 provinces of Thailand, with 94,627 sponsored children (World Vision International 2014). WVFT staffs are distributed at the national and field levels – there are 826 staffs, of which 253 are office staff (including those based at the National Office) and 573 field staff (most of whom are working in the ADPs). More than half of the WVFT staffs are Christians.

Community-based development interventions relating to education, food security, water access, health and economic livelihood are rolled out over a period of about 10 to 15 years, in phases of 5 years each. Currently, WVFT is introducing the Development Programme Approach (DPA) from WVI to ADPs which are new and undergoing redesigning after 5 years of implementation. In this new initiative, each ADP (usually a district as defined in Thailand) would
be subdivided into sub-districts, each taken charge by a field staff who is known as the Development Facilitator (DF). The DF is responsible for the implementation of the development interventions within the sub-district that is under his/her charge.

*Mae Sariang* ADP was set up in the year 2010 and is targeted to complete its child-focused development programme by the year 2024. At the time of the research, the ADP was finalising its plans for the second phase of the programme, by going through a programme redesigning process, which can be attributed to the recent re-envisioning of the TD direction by WVI (de Wet 2013).

All staffs in *Mae Sariang* ADP are Christian or Catholic of Karen ethnicity, except one who is a Buddhist of Thai ethnicity.

‘Transformational Development’ in Practice of WVFT

Understanding of ‘Transformational Development’ (TD)

A common development conceptual term used in WVI is ‘Transformational Development’ (TD) which is defined as “a process and actions through which children, families and communities move towards fullness of life with dignity, justice, peace, and hope, as the Bible describes the Kingdom of God” (World Vision International 2002). This term is commonly used within WVI instead of the traditional ‘development’ to avoid 1) associations with past meanings, some of which are not positive. It also conjures up connotations of changes in the material world; and 2) ideas that it is about westernisation or modernisation which may not necessarily be good for the intended beneficiaries (Myers 2006).

The notion of integrating both physical and spiritual development is relatively new among Christians – a few decades ago, development work was seen to be separate from the concern of Christians, who put more attention on missionary work to bring about the conversion of people into the Christian faith. Development work was regarded to be out of step with traditional theological understanding. However, as the uneasy relationship between the two became more apparent, Christians began to see the need to have a response to the social issues of poverty and hunger. Today, even missions organizations have adapted principles of development (King 2012) and Christian development organizations are seeing the need to approach social issues in a holistic manner by addressing all areas of human needs.

The concept of TD emphasises that the work of World Vision is beyond the improvement of material well-being, and that it is concerned with relationship-building with the poor and their experience with God and their spiritual transformation, where community members feel fully human and know that they are made in the image of God (Myers 2006). De Wet (2013) observes that TD is “framed by core Christian beliefs, particularly the biblical narrative of the Kingdom of God and its attendant themes of individual salvation, transformation and connection to God, and redemption” and “incorporates developmental insights and
practice alongside the mobilisation of religious resources”. This development concept aligns with WVI’s mission statement (refer to Figure 2).

**Figure 2** Mission statement of WVI

World Vision is an international partnership of Christians whose mission is to follow our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ in working with the poor and oppressed to promote human transformation, seek justice and bear witness to the good news of the Kingdom of God.

We pursue this mission through integrated, holistic commitment to:

1) Transformational Development that is community-based and sustainable, focused especially on the needs of children.

2) Emergency Relief that assists people afflicted by conflict or disaster.

3) Promotion of Justice that seeks to change unjust structures affecting the poor among whom we work.

4) Partnerships with churches to contribute to spiritual and social transformation.

5) Public Awareness that leads to informed understanding, giving, involvement and prayer.

6) Witness to Jesus Christ by life, deed, word and sign that encourages people to respond to the Gospel.

Extracted from World Vision International 2014

TD is an area which contributes to the fulfilling of the mission statement, along with ‘Christian Witness’ and ‘church partnerships’. TD offers an expanded perspective with regards to helping the poor – it is not only about God’s concern for the oppressed or Jesus’ teachings and responses to the poor as put forward by theologians like Baggett (2005), but a larger biblical story involving the God’s Creation, the Fall of Man, God’s redemption through Jesus Christ and the church’s continuing role until the end of history. The Kingdom of God perspective provides the framework in which poverty is understood and consequently, the Christian response – it recognises that the current world is dysfunctional because of broken structural and interpersonal relationships, with the result of poverty (both material and non-material), loss of dignity, loss of opportunities and loss of ability to achieve their God-given potential (Myers 2006;
Christian 2011). In order for the impoverished to achieve fullness of life, churches and Christians have a role to respond to their physical, social and spiritual needs (Myers 2006). Myers puts forward that work which is pro-life and enhances the quality of life points towards the Kingdom of God. The emulation of Jesus Christ provides guidance in meeting the needs of material and spiritual aspects of the poor. TD takes a holistic approach by not only targeting the development of children, but the larger context in which they are situated in.

As the use of TD is an attempt to integrate both Christian and secular development discourses towards helping the poor, the understanding of TD has had an influence on the use of contemporary development techniques and modus operandi of World Vision. Specifically, there are TD-related documents for design, monitoring and evaluation (DME), policies on Witness to Jesus Christ, partnership with churches and technical interventions that address development issues. The concept of TD, which is motivated by Christian values and beliefs, has an impact on how development processes (for example, the Development Programme Approach or DPA) are organised and how development programmes are implemented. This allows the principles of TD to be demonstrated in the field where World Vision’s role is to provide technical support, oversight and funding for programme implementation at the community level. When translated into development practice, World Vision uses contemporary development techniques like Design, Monitoring and Evaluation (DME) and Logical Framework (Log Frame), with development outcomes and measurable indicators, to achieve development goals. There are also TD indicators, which are a set of programme indicators to measure the quality of life in communities. While it can be seen that the operations of World Vision are not distinctively different from secular development agencies, the underlying mission and concept of TD which drive these operational strategies are informed by the organisation’s Christian values and beliefs.

Expressing the Christian Faith in TD-Related Programme Documents

The DPA which is used in Mae Sariang ADP’s redesigning process, encompasses principles from TD involving the integration of World Vision’s work and building of staff capacity to engage local partners. As part of the DPA, there is ‘The Critical Path’ process (see Figure 3) which involves eight simple questions that are asked at various stages of the programming process to evaluate the current situation of local communities and improve World Vision’s work with local partners which is seen to be able to contribute towards the well-being of children.
In the guide on ‘The Critical Path’, which was developed at the international level, the presence of God is acknowledged and sought in discerning God’s involvement in the community. This is done through prayers and biblical reflections as staff listen to children, partners and communities. At the international level, WVI developed a spiritual discernment resource guide for field staff to use during devotions, prayers and reflections as they move through ‘The Critical Path’. When the ADP programme manager at Mae Sariang was asked whether he saw the component of ‘God’s presence’ in ‘The Critical Path’ diagram, he was not able to recall it. However, he could very confidently articulate how he personally saw the involvement of God in the process. For example, for Step 3’s “What is already being done?”, he recognised the need to look back and thank God for the blessings that He had given; and for Step 6’s “Who will contribute what?”, he saw that as something biblical, similar to how the 12 disciples of Jesus Christ allocated work amongst themselves. The confidence that the programme manager displayed was due to the fact that he has had many years of experience in community development work and he did his self-study to make sense of his work using texts from the Bible.

From this, it can be seen that the understanding of development work from a biblical perspective is largely left to the interpretation and initiative of each individual staff. While there are resources available like the spiritual discernment resource guide to help staff discern the Christian basis of development work, there are limitations in terms of their 1) access (because the resources developed at the global level are in English and not widely understood by Thai field staff as it has yet to be translated into Thai); and 2) extent of use (because these resources are only for voluntary use and there are already many technical aspects in the DPA to pay attention to, hence understanding the spiritual aspect of the development approaches is not high on the priority of field staff).
Field Levels Activities in Achieving TD-Related Goals Towards Child Well-Being

In achieving the goal of children having the fullness of life as part of TD, one of the development aspirations of World Vision is “Girls and boys experience love of God and their neighbours.” At Mae Sariang ADP, the development aspiration is fulfilled through activities like children’s moral and ethics camp and school-based Christmas celebrations. During the children’s camps, child participants (both Buddhists and Christians) are asked to close their eyes and bow their heads in a prayer position before meals to give thanks for the food. The prayers also asked God for protection over the children during the camp. This act of praying led by WVFT staff is carried out to help all child participants appreciate the importance of being thankful for blessings, and in the case of the children’s camp, for the provision of food. In addition, it is aimed at helping Christian children experience the love of God, by recognising God’s involvement in the activities. During the children’s camp, participants are grouped to discuss and present their hope for the future.

During the Christmas celebrations, the character of Jesus during his childhood days is talked about as a role model for the child participants, where “Jesus grew in wisdom and stature and in favour with God and man” (Bible verse from the Book of Luke, chapter 2, verse 52). Through the Christmas celebrations, it is hoped that children can also understand the love of God, as displayed when He sent Jesus into the world to care for those in need.

Due to the sensitive context of presenting a Christian identity in Thailand where the donor and partner base is predominantly Buddhist, the development aspiration has been adapted by WVFT to mean “Children to have good morals and generosity to others” in Thai (Thai text: “มีคุณธรรมและเอื้ออาทรต่อคนรอบข้าง”), where the reference to God has been removed. As a result, staff of WVFT cannot fully appreciate the aspiration to introduce appropriate development activities which contribute to the spiritual development of children. During the process of drafting the Log Frame for the second phase of development at Mae Sariang ADP, the problems brought up by staff which impede the meeting of the child well-being aspiration were all relating to low morality of children and the low social support of their families, schools and communities, without any reference to spiritual state of the children. Furthermore, the ADP team at Mae Sariang are focused on correcting so-called bad moral behaviour which relates to the failure of the child to fulfil his/her duties in the family (for example, not helping with the household chores, and disrespect for elders) and school (for example, poor attention in school, and dropping out of school). While such efforts can contribute to values formation of children, it is perhaps a lopsided effort to fully contribute to the child well-being aspiration. The loss of meaning because of translation is a lost opportunity for Christian staff at WVFT to appreciate the spiritual motivation behind this aspiration, and carry out development programmes that align with the international direction. Hence, while there is an initiative at WVFT to align its national policies to the international direction of focusing on the spiritual development of children as a cross-
cutting theme to contribute to the child well-being aspiration, it is still at an infancy stage with much consideration needed for its definition and contextualisation.

While there are efforts at the global and regional level to attempt to integrate the values of the Christian faith into development work in World Vision, it is perhaps a long process, as can be seen in Thailand where TD is a relatively new concept and certain spiritual concepts have been watered down as a result of translation and sensitivity in the Thai context.

‘Christian Witness’ of WVFT Staff
Understanding ‘Christian Witness’

‘Christian Witness’ defines the identity of the organization and its staff. Myers (2006) adopts the term ‘Christian Witness’, which has an extended meaning from ‘evangelism’ (usually understood to be a loaded word which brings to mind the verbal proclamation of the gospel of Jesus Christ). ‘Christian Witness’ not only includes the declaration of the gospel by words, but also life and deed. In such a proclamation of Christ through how they lead their lives through love of God, Christian development workers are believed to inevitably provoke the question to which the gospel is the answer and this is with the hope that non-Christians in the community will understand the Christian faith or eventually come to accept Christianity as their personal faith. ‘Christian Witness’ is hence an extension of ‘transformational development’ where through the work of the Christian development practitioner, the poor are restored to reach fullness of life through spiritual transformation. During an interview by Bornstein (2005) with the Director of Sponsorship Ministry and Funding at World Vision United States, the latter discussed World Vision’s understanding of introducing Christianity to the communities and the organisation’s potential to introduce God’s presence through ‘Christian Witness’ –

“We are planting the seed…, but ultimately God is responsible for bringing it up. You see you can bring scripture even into everyday life; that’s the whole essence of integrated Christian development… Even where you are not necessarily buying a Bible for somebody but … buying seeds, you are introducing God, and saying how God can be involved in that situation.”

To depict the same concept, Bornstein (2005) coined the term ‘lifestyle evangelism’, where evangelism involves “living a life in the manner of Christ, and providing an example for non-believers” (Bornstein 2005, 50) by building relationships with, and loving, the people, through their Christian lifestyle. I would use ‘Christian Witness’ in this paper for clarity in usage of term and because it is more widely used.

The Separation of Evangelism from Development Work

In discussing ‘Christian Witness’, it is necessary to consider the tensions that arise when development is associated with evangelism or proselytization. There is the general sense in the development field that evangelism adulterates development work and should be kept separate. In other words, the spreading of religious opinions should be delinked from humanitarian action (Fountain 2015). This is a result of
modernisation which edges out religion from the public sphere into the private sphere, resulting in the secularisation of development work. With the rise of capitalism which emphasises the accumulation of material capital, cultural values correspondingly became secularised, with more focus on the material world and less so on the spiritual realm (Bocock 1996). Secularisation is hence socially constructed, perpetuated by human imagination and its translation into action (Barnett and Stein 2012). Along with capitalism, rationality that came with modern science also resulted in secularisation in many areas of life (Weber 1970, cited in Bocock 1996,171). This has impacted the conception of development, which primarily focuses on using science and technology to address the issues of the poor.

In addition, Fountain (2015) also propounds that there is an ‘amnesia’ which demarcates humanitarianism from evangelism, often forgetting that “contemporary Western development is a direct descendant of Christian proselytising impulses, dispositions, practices and organisational forms” (Fountain 2015, 12).

Furthermore, evangelism is seen to be problematic in Thailand because conversion to Christianity threatens statehood and conceptions of community which are primarily based on Buddhism, which is used as a means to unify the nation and perpetuate the Thai identity. Hence, it is important to critically evaluate this separation and not deem evangelism as an essentially religious act, but as “intentional moral practices of transformative interventions aimed at reworking the social practices of others” (Fountain 2015, 22), similar to development projects which are value-laden and have roots in certain traditions. In this paper, I consider the separation as perceived by the WVFT field staff when they carry out development projects in Mae Sariang.

In a Christian development organization which places importance on its Christian identity and uses biblical values to transform the communities that they work with, Christian field staffs are seen to have a special position in the communities to bring about TD.

However, introducing spiritual elements into development can be a touchy issue in light of modernization which secularizes the interpretation of many dimensions of life, including understandings about how development should be carried out (Barnett and Stein 2012; Deneulin and Rakodi 2010). This is evident in the work of the Mae Sariang ADP team, which seeks to carry out its work in a way that follows closely the methods of contemporary and modernized development practitioners. Furthermore, WVFT works in a context where Christian organizations are perceived to be primarily involved in the conversion of people to Christianity (there is hence apprehension among communities towards Christians), especially in hill-tribe areas of northern Thailand where there is a long history of missionization. While World Vision does not take advantage of the vulnerability of the community members to pressure them towards conversion to Christianity, should any of them indicate a desire to do so, staff of World Vision can identify an individual (for example, a Christian from the local church) who can support the community member in his/her decision, taking into account the potential contextual sensitivity. From this...
position of World Vision, it can be seen that the organisation would choose not to be directly involved in the conversion of the intended beneficiaries that they work with, to avoid any potential complications in long-term relationships within the communities.

The separation of the Christian faith from development work is apparent in Mae Sariang ADP. Christian beliefs and practices are very much kept within the ADP team and at times, Christians in the communities. The Christian ADP staffs who were interviewed mentioned that they are happy and comfortable in the work environment due to the fact that they are able to express their faith freely with their colleagues, for example, by participating in staff devotions, worships and prayers. They were also able to talk about God in the work setting. They were also of opinion that sharing the same faith helped them in carrying out their work, much like brothers and sisters working together.

“Perhaps the topic on faith is kept to the private realm among the staff in the organisation. In the organisation, what matters more is the fulfilment of the technical programming expectations and not so much on how dependent you are on God. This is further supported by what was observed at the training sessions where there were morning devotions and prayers, but during the rest of the day, there were not many references to God.”

While the Christian faith is freely expressed with the ADP team, it can be seen that there is restraint when they work with the intended beneficiaries, due to their understanding that there should somewhat be a separation between their Christian belief and their work with the villagers. One of the field staff understands her work as not preaching about God like a missionary, but to show God in and through her work (for example, by showing love to the people), i.e. to be a ‘Christian Witness’ in the mild sense of the term. She sees the priority to be the development of the people. In the same way, another field staff sees his role to not evangelize to avoid potential disputes, but to only encourage the spiritual growth of Christians.

During the children camps where children are asked to go into the prayer position, the WVFT field staff explained that the intention was not to convert the religions of the children and the act of praying and giving thanks to God in public is the staff’s way of asserting the organisation’s Christian identity and to show the reliance of the field staff on God in their work. The act of prayer has only been demonstrated in child-oriented activities and not in other community activities like the installation of water tanks and the distribution of school materials due to the presence of adults from other religions which made it inappropriate for prayers to be initiated, as explained by the programme manager of Mae Sariang ADP. It appears that the staff would be bolder in expressing their Christian faith with children who are perceived to be more open to receiving the acts of prayers.

This conservative understanding and practice of ‘Christian Witness’ by the WVFT staff at Mae Sariang ADP is different from what was observed during a short informal visit to another ADP in Thailand where the program manager being very explicit about her faith to a community health volunteer who is Buddhist –
she shared about her miraculous quick recovery of her toe after a bad fall and gave thanks to God for healing her. It was surprising to see her boldness in expressing her faith, without fear of being accused of trying to proselytize. During the visit, she also shared on how she contributed to bringing a community member to conversion to Christianity a few years ago. This behaviour of the ADP programme manager is ‘Christian Witness’ taken to the extreme since she was unconstrained by her professional identity, but instead in her interaction with community members, she is actively involved in the proclamation of Christ not only through words, but also living her natural self as a Christian who is passionate to share about her Christian faith.

The characteristic of Mae Sariang ADP field staff of making few references to God, especially when relating to community members, supports Berger’s (2003) claim of Christian FBDOs, compared to those which are of non-Western origin, which are focused on the inner spiritual advancement of individuals. However, this characteristic differs across ADPs within WVFT, as exhibited in the case of the other ADP as discussed above.

**Awareness of WVFT’s Christian Identity in Karen Hill Tribe Communities**

Out of the 18 households which were interviewed, 12 (66.67%) are aware that WVFT is a Christian organisation, of which 8 found out through conversations with the WVFT staff (it appears that to know a person’s religious belief was a common conversation topic among the Karen hill-tribe people). Most respondents are not able to tell that the WVFT staffs are Christians based on their behaviours. However, this is not indicative of the level of ‘Christian Witness’ among field staff, as most of the villagers only meet the WVFT staff between 2 to 5 times a year at Ban Mae Kanai (possibly due to the fact that the village is more inaccessible compared to Ban Pamak, where the villagers meet the WVFT staff about 12 times a year), which results in far fewer opportunities to observe the demonstration of Christian values and beliefs through life and deed. Perhaps ‘witnessing’ can come not only from the lives of the ADP staff, but also through the material items, like school notebooks and water tanks, where the World Vision logo is imprinted. Some villagers commented that there are hints of Christian identity in WVFT – the organisation’s Thai name, Supanimit, is Christian sounding; the organisation logo looks like a Christian cross; and the write-up of WVFT in the school notebooks uses Christian terms.

It appears that ‘Christian Witness’ among the field staff at Mae Sariang is minimal and the demonstration of Christian values and beliefs are only kept within the ADP team and towards Christians in the communities. WVFT staffs are left to judge how they should demonstrate their faith as staff representatives of the FBDO. ‘Christian Witness’ is not through the lives of the Christian field staff, but done primarily through the distribution of material goods that carry the World Vision logo and corresponding Christian message. At the same time, this demonstrates the Christian value of giving.
Extent of Church Partnership

“WV (World Vision) especially recognises and affirms the essential role of churches in contributing to the well-being of children within families and communities. This commitment to work with churches is part of WV’s Christian commitment, grounded in the biblical call to serve the poorest and most vulnerable. WV seeks to build on the strengths and initiatives that churches already have and work with them in mutually beneficial collaboration for the sustained well-being of children.” (World Vision International 2011b)

It is clear from the above statement that churches are seen as strategic partners for World Vision to fulfil its development mission. World Vision also recognises that partnership with churches is a core part of its identity, regardless of denominations (including Catholics, despite World Vision’s evangelical Protestant roots), as part of fulfilling the work in the Kingdom of God, by bringing about fullness of life with characteristics of dignity, justice, peace, and hope. Hence, churches are seen to be key in bringing about community transformation due to their potential in operationalizing the restoration to fullness of life and spiritual development of community members (de Wet 2013).

While World Vision in the TD and DPA recognise the importance of partnering with as many community groups as possible to build up the empowerment and sustainability of the communities that they work with, special priority is placed on partnering with, and building up the capacity of the local churches to contribute to the transformation of communities where they are in. World Vision highly values church partnerships due to their potential to bring about the development goal of bringing fullness of life to the children, families and communities that the FBDO works with.

However, this may not necessarily be reflected at the field level. In both Ban Pamak and Ban Mae Kanai, church partnerships with WVFT were almost non-existent. When asked if there was a possibility for WVFT to work more closely with the local Catholic Church in developing the community, the village Catholic leader at Ban Pamak responded that WVFT has already agreed to give them money for the refurbishment of their church building. Upon further probing, he mentioned that perhaps WVFT could directly disburse funds to the villagers when purchasing livestock. From this, it can be seen that partnership with WVFT on a deeper and sustainable level is not in the conscious of the local church at Ban Pamak.

On the other hand, although the Protestant Baptist church in Ban Mae Kanai has no existing relationship with WVFT, the pastor-in-charge appeared ready to be involved in community development, on the premise that WVFT is clear about their goal of working in the village. He highlighted that God’s presence can enter in the village through many ways, including through WVFT. Implicit in this statement is the idea of sharing Christianity and in turn, increasing the number of Christian believers in the village.

Currently, WVFT at the national level attributes the low level of church engagement to the corresponding low capacity of field staff to do so and is aiming to increase the capacity of
staff to engage local churches in the ADP, which is also part of the strategy of the DPA process. Furthermore, field staffs do not have an adequate understanding of TD to appreciate the value of engaging churches in the communities that they work in. While the WVFT national office has earmarked the equipping of field staff to involve churches in the development process and the ADP team has indicated plans to increase the engagement of churches, it is yet unknown how this would be done, especially in a context where work that is overtly Christian would rather be avoided by the ADP field staff, as discussed in the previous section.

**Faith-Based Organisational Culture of WVFT**

The culture of a faith-based organisation is a reflection of Christian values and beliefs, based on working culture, staff policies, activities that staff do on a regular basis, and the priority that is given for such activities. Furthermore, they can serve to reinforce the Christian identity of the organisation.

To maintain the integrity of the Christian identity and ‘Christian Witness’ in development work, it is an international policy that World Vision offices employ field staff locally who are Christians. The rationale of employing local staff is so as to relate with World Vision’s intended beneficiaries, in terms of culture, language and communication style, and to encourage development from ‘within’ rather than present the organisation as Western and foreign. The prerequisite for staff to be Christians is characteristic of FBDOs which mobilise workers who are motivated by their faith and belief that they are doing the work of God (Thaut 2009). Through interviews with, and observations of, the Christian staff at Mae Sariang ADP, it is apparent that they are committed Christians. Of the three Christian staff interviewed, two of them believe that God has called them to work at WVFT and constantly make references to the influence of God in their work in Mae Sariang. Fern, the Development Facilitator of Mae Hoh sub-district, shared that when she was a child, her teacher asked about her ambition and her innocent reply was that she wanted to work with children. Fern remembered her response to her teacher and has since been focused on seeking vocations related to child development. She believes that her child-like response was a calling from God. Similarly, Bom, the Development Facilitator of Mae Sariang sub-district, sees the importance of partnering with God in his work, he shared:

“I cannot do things by myself, unless God gives me the strength. We need to ask help from God by praying. We not only meet with parents, children and the villagers, or leaders, we also meet with high-ranking people, so this kind of things I cannot do it unless God is there. So I need to pray. God has to give me the knowledge and strength.”

However, in places where qualified local Christians cannot be hired, exceptions can be made and due processes put in place by WVI have to be followed to allow this to happen. This can be seen in the Mae Sariang ADP where there is one non-Christian staff, Aom, who is Buddhist, due to the fact that Thailand is a predominantly Buddhist country and it is relatively challenging to employ competent Christian staff in the development field. While it may seemingly be challenging for
the Christian identity of WVFT to be maintained due to the presence of non-Christian staff, Ajit Hazra, the South Asia-Pacific Regional Director for Faith and Development at WVI explains the organisation’s perspective:

“As a Christian organisation, we have certain values that all staff both Christian and staffs of different faith need to understand and agree with. You don’t have to be a Christian, but these are the values and perspectives that each person has to understand because this guides how we work with people. Some of these perspectives are not specifically Christian but also inclusive of other faith traditions. Inclusive not in the sense, ‘okay, we all have the same common beliefs’, … [and] asking those not of the Christian faith to participate in Christian rituals, but we are asking each staff to understand our Christian motivation and perspective in the work we do, whether you are Christian or not … Our mission says that we … follow our Lord Jesus Christ. So when we say we follow, how do we follow? We follow not in terms of going to church, but we follow in terms of how Jesus worked with the people and the Christian perspectives on, such as, giving dignity, advocacy, caring for the poor and working with the communities.”

Hence, in order to overcome the different religious beliefs which can be potentially divisive, World Vision will choose to find common grounds for the purpose of development and serving the poor.

As a Christian FBDO, field staffs are individually appraised based on the extent to which they follow the example of Jesus, involving the attributes of love, justice, humility, and servant leadership when they engage with community members and partners. At World Vision, being a Christian staff involves “a constant translation between the expectations of the institution, defined according to codified Christian principles that directed the work of the NGO, and the religious expectations of its employees” (Bornstein 2005, 61). As discussed earlier under ‘Christian Witness’, while staff appear to be left to evaluate some parts of the work of WVFT vis-à-vis their own faith, dialectically, they are also evaluated based on their performance. This is exemplified in the case of Mae Sariang ADP where the programme manager, Dee, is expected to evaluate his staff based on the values of Jesus – he observes whether they use what they have learnt in church to share at the Monday morning devotions and whether they display characteristics of responsibility, love, care and unity. With a non-Christian in the team, and it would seemingly be difficult for Aom to be appraised according to the above requirements due to her different religious belief. However, Dee interprets this as a non-issue – Aom is not expected to know the Bible; as long as she shows love and care for others, he sees it as a reflection of God in her life. At the end of it, Dee indicates more importance for the ADP staff members to perform in their work and their ability to meet their work responsibilities, regardless of their religious beliefs.

The ADP staff team gathers for devotions every Monday morning and staffs rotate duties to lead worship and share devotion messages based on Christian values. The Monday morning devotions are sacralised as religious activities for the team as everyone is expected to set aside time on Monday mornings for God and are not allowed
to arrange work meetings. Despite Aom having a different religious belief, Dee does not exclude her from this involvement and expects everyone in the team to have shared responsibility and be involved as a corporate body in staff devotions. Aom was a former WVFT sponsored child and subsequently a volunteer before becoming a staff member. Hence, she is familiar with the organisational culture, and does not take issue with being involved in religious devotions which are not of her own religious belief. While there appears to be a potential disjuncture between World Vision’s expectations of its staff based on Christian values and the religious beliefs of non-Christian staff, which could be divisive to the corporate body, it appears that the only non-Christian staff in Mae Sariang ADP has been integrated into Christian environment despite her being the only non-Christian (and non-Karen) in the team. While the act of having morning devotions is being sacralised, it is done so for the whole ADP team, regardless of religious beliefs. This act of regular devotion meetings is therefore not a fully spiritual Christian act, but one that is made ‘sacred’ within the organisational structure of creating opportunities for staff bonding. In other words, a seemingly religious gathering with reference to the spiritual realm is now being interpreted to serve an organisational purpose – a co-existence of the ‘religious’ and the ‘secular’.

Another characteristic of a Christian organizational culture in the Mae Sariang ADP staff team is their commitment to pray, for example, before each work task, as a way to recognise the role of God in their work. This commitment which was shared by the ADP field staff, was also observed by a Christian villager at Ban Mae Kanai who is the cook of the local nursery school (and whose children are sponsored by WVFT, Household No. 15) – once when she was in the ADP office to collect the money to purchase the ingredients for the meals, she saw that the staff gathered to pray before going to the villages to carry out their work. As discussed earlier on prayers by WVFT staff during children activities, such an act of prayer is also being made ‘sacred’ as a way to affirm the team’s affiliation with the larger organisation’s Christian beliefs and identity.

Conclusion

Using WVFT as a case study, this paper has sought to analyse the extent to which Christian values, beliefs and identity of an international FBDO have shaped the understanding of its national office’s mission and development programme, in particular, its work in hilltribe communities of Mae Sariang, Thailand.

The operationalisation of WVI’s faith-based components of TD, ‘Christian Witness’ and church partnership in the Thai context have reproduced variations of the international directions. While there are instances where the development programme and organisational culture of WVFT reflects Christian values, beliefs and identity, these Western faith-based concepts of development have been adapted and re-interpreted in an Asian context, especially one which is predominantly and views Christianity as somewhat threatening. Buddhist values that are prevalent in Thailand have steered the development approach towards a focus on education, moral and ethics, and responsibilities.
of the child, instead of the fuller organisational mission of bringing about the spiritual nurture of children through their experience of God. At the same time, ‘Christian Witness’ which is part of the organisational mission is mellowed down due to the Buddhist backdrop and history of evangelism in the nation – a culturally-sensitive move to achieve conventional development goals (which is after all the priority of a development organisation), but at the same time, a shortfall in terms of how WVI defines its mission and desired outcomes in relation to its intended beneficiaries.

In addition, there is the co-existence of the ‘secular’ and religious’ where faith-based values and beliefs are differentiated from modernistic development techniques as a result of a response to the current context in the development field. While WVFT is explicitly an FBDO, its modus operandi in relation to community members is not distinctively different from secular organisations, but at the same time, references to their religious values, beliefs and identity are still evident in the organisation.

While it is commendable that WVFT takes a holistic approach in looking beyond the material well-being of its intended beneficiaries to address their spiritual development based on the principles of TD, the extent to which it is demonstrated at the field level is limited in the context of Thailand. Christian values and beliefs at World Vision have stretched to the national level in the Thailand office but they are minimal at the field level. Considerations should hence be made on the steps that can be taken to bring about better integration and translation of faith into development practice by taking into account the contexts. In addition, integration should be carried in ways that not only reflect the faith-based identity of the organisation, but also bring about positive change, both physically and spiritually, to the intended beneficiaries.
References


Christian faith-based development: A case study of World Vision Foundation of Thailand in Karen hill tribe communities


Thailand’s move from a pity to a rights-based understanding of disability*

Michelle Proyer**
michelle.proyer@univie.ac.at

Abstract

More often than not disability - as most other minority-related topics - is perceived as of neglect able interest in policy design. Recent developments show an increased reference towards persons with disabilities and the enablement of their equal and independent lives in Thai legislative. There are several questions that arise from this observation: 1) What led to this development? 2) To which extent is it related to the signature of international agreements (such as the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, UNCRPD in 2008), developments in other (ASEAN) countries, a change in public awareness or the pressure of social movements or personal initiative respectively? And last but not least: 3) In what way does it impact each person with disabilities’ life and his/her unrestricted access to education?

By looking at the role disability has played in Thailand’s recent educational policy development and how this affects children with disabilities in elementary school settings, conditions for changes in legislature, general perception and social attitudes will be elaborated on. The investigation of 1) whether there is an actual (intention to) move from a pity- based understanding towards a rights-based one in educational policy, 2) where the urge, motivation or support for such a striking change stems from, 3) how it will be (further) realized and 4) which challenges are to arise from its implication will be of central interest. Reflecting the Odyssey through (G) local Agreements and National Legislation, we can see whether an ASEAN perspective on disabilities makes sense or not.

Keywords: disability, educational policy, inclusion, rights-based approach, Thailand

---

* This article developed from a paper presented in the 3rd International Conference on International Relations and Development (ICIRD 2013) on “Beyond the Borders: Building a Regional Commons” at Chulalongkorn University, 22-23 August 2013.

** Institut für Bildungswissenschaft, Universität Wien.
Introduction

In the course of field research activities on the educational realms of children with disabilities living in and around Bangkok, the author of this paper kept asking herself how the – at least in the Western hemisphere – heavily discussed implementation of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities – UNCRPD (UN 2006) affects individuals’ lives, especially in the field of education.

During field research between 2010 and 2013 for the comparative research project CLASDISA¹, primary school – aged children, their parents, teachers and other stakeholders in disability and education were interviewed. The interviewees were invited to share their perspectives on barriers and facilitators (World Health Organization 2007) they experience in terms of education. More than 20 educational institutions (different types of schools, NGOs, GOs etc.) participated in data collection. Due to the high level of involvement and cooperation almost 200 interviews were collected.

It was especially interesting to hear from parents how they had learned about the fact that their children had rights, the rights that were to ensure their full participation in every aspect of life such as the right to “appropriate” education. It was initially enacted in 1975 (Individuals with Disabilities Education Act), followed by the Disability Act in 1991, the National Education Act 1999 and the Education Provision for People with Disabilities Act in 2008 (Cheausuwantavee and Cheausuwantavee 2012, 70; Vorapanya and Dunlap 2012, 2; Carter 2006, 32; Namsiripongpun n.d., 6). Parents explained that they had learned about their child’s right to access every school either in the course of being rejected by a number of (so called inclusive) schools (claiming a lack of resources and (wo)menpower), through neighbors/friends/relatives (who know someone who is) having a child with disability or via TV. That they themselves had the right to complain or urge authorities to change something was not of interest to them. Most of the interviewees came from very low or low socio – economic backgrounds. In their opinion other issues presented more pressing problems in their lives.

None of the interviewees, apart from a representative of the Ministry of Education and some academics, had ever heard about the UNCRPD. Accordingly, none of the parents or teachers raised the topic or could comment on whether they thought that the implementation could improve the situation of persons with disabilities. Most of them perceived the present legal framework as close to perfect. Things that prevented its implementation were to be searched for elsewhere. Low levels of involvement of the parents, low levels of quality of teacher education are just to mention a few. So the initially raised question manifested further:

¹ Further information on the project funded through means of the Austrian Science Fund, project number P22178, can be obtained here: http://classifications-of-disabilities.univie.ac.at/.

² Whatever that means.
• Does the ratification of the UNCRPD actually have an impact on policies in Thailand (and elsewhere)?
• If so, how does this affect, at its best, improve, the situation of persons with disabilities in everyday life?
• Which role does individual engagement/disability movements play in that regard?

The paper at hand elaborates on these and further questions from a wide variety of perspectives. It starts with a reference to the (irrational) claim to describe and understand disability globally. Thereafter moving gradually among various geographic spheres to illustrate the complexity of grasping the dynamics of disability related policy making and implementation. Along the way more questions will be accumulated and a final statement will conclude this paper with some thoughts on further research.

The methodology used on this qualitative research paper is literature and document studies, as well as in-depth interviews with experts and individuals with disability.

International Perspectives on Disabilities

The complex interrelation between disability and culture has been thoroughly discussed in interdisciplinary literature (Riddell and Watson 2003). The aim can be summarized as identifying possible explanatory patterns at the boarders of disability and anthropology, cultural studies, educational studies etc. Disability means something distinct in every culture. It depends on a variety of culture- and society-bound factors whether a person with disability is involved in everyday life of a certain cultural space or not. It has been widely approved that it is not the disability that causes restrictions in participation but that the societal attitudes and the environment play a much more important, the major, role. This concept can be summarized under the bio-psycho-social model/understanding of disability. Among a number of other sources the following document (claims to) utilize this model: The World Health Organization’s (WHO) International Classification of Functioning, Disability and Health – Children and Youth Version (ICF – CY) that was published in 2007. It claimed to enable its users to create a functional profile of any child or young person. By providing a coding scheme that covers areas such as “body functions” and “environmental factors” it is possible to describe e.g. levels of restrictions in participation. This classification was intended to provide a universally understandable language about disability. It appears only natural that this toplofty enterprise is not solely doomed due to complexity and trouble related to translation (Üstün et al. 2002)3. Meekosha (2011), among others, elaborates on the common concept of

---

3 One has to mention that the ICF – CY is the third version of the classification scheme published after the International Classification of Impairment, Disability and Health (ICIDH) in 1980 and the ICF in 2005 (that is almost identical with the ICF – CY apart from some child and youth – related areas). Compared to the ICIDH much has been improved in the ICF and the ICF – CY. E.g. there has been a clear shift from the sole medical approach to disability to a more bio-psycho-social one. Nevertheless the author claims that its application needs a certain level of infrastructure and understanding of the underlying concepts that will not be available globally.
disabilities that is widely based on a Western understanding. Her postcolonial critique is only one that can be held against the ICF – CY”s claim to enable profiling by providing a set of codes and classifiers.

Arising from this short elaboration on the limitations an international perspective on disability might produce, is the following:

- Can a global document on the rights of persons with disabilities actually comprise all the culture - specific characteristics (of non – Western societies) that lead to exclusion?
- Would this equal to the fact that international claims to ensure disability rights are a futile intent?

Moving from the global to a more regional setting, the following section will focus on agreements about disability-related rights within the Asian and Pacific sphere. This detour along the way to reflecting the local conditions in Thailand more in detail is to emphasize the above mentioned complexity of thinking disabilities globally.

Asian and Pacific Perspective(s) on Disabilities

Disability is a world - wide phenomenon. After what has been said some readers might question the author’s decision to look at disabilities under a regional lens. This critique is comprehensible. Nevertheless, taking a closer look at the region of Asia and the Pacific region in terms of disabilities, in which Thailand acts as important member, makes sense due to the following reasons (ESCAP 2013, 2):

- Despite some periods of minor drawbacks, the region is characterized by economic growth
- and stability. This alludes to the intersection of disability and poverty (Elwan 1999) and offers a prospect to successfully work to overcome the vicious circle induced by it.4
- The region is inhabited by around two thirds of the world’s population.
- Like no other place in the world, the region is affected by natural disasters. Adding to a constant increase in the number of persons with disabilities and the need for adapted (rehabilitative) measures.

An initial internet and online journal – focused research on the terms “Asia” and “disability” – conducted after the pair “Thailand” and “disability” seemed somewhat saturated and the pair “ASEAN” and “disability” brought up rather few matches - lead to the identification of a number of protocols on meetings, press releases on more signatories to the UNCRPD as well as agreements etc. Reading through these one gets the impression of a highly harmonic and collective strive towards equal rights for persons with disabilities. It comes unsurprisingly that a high number refer to work and education.

---

4 As has been thoroughly described elsewhere the intersection between disability and poverty is manifold. A small example might illustrate this: A person who does not have access to proper nutrition over a long period of time might develop an illness, acquire a disability or/and die. As this person might be unable to access medical facilities due to lack of money or infrastructure, the condition might deteriorate and also affect other family members as this person might no longer contribute to the household income etc.
The UN’s Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP) has meanwhile agreed to a third decade for enforcing the rights of persons with disabilities. After the UN Decade of Disabled Persons between 1983 and 1992 they introduced the following (ESCAP 2007, 1):

- 1993 to 2002: Asian and Pacific Decade of Disabled Persons
- 2003 to 2012: The Biwako Millenium Framework for Action Towards an Inclusive, Barrier – Free and Rights – Based Society for Persons with Disabilities in Asia and the Pacific
- 2013 to 2022: Asian and Pacific Decade of Persons with Disabilities (ESCAP 2013, 3)

The explanation for prolonging the first decade with another one appears logical as “much progress was achieved during the [first, M.P.] Decade, [still, M.P.] the challenges were overwhelming.” (ESCAP 2007, 1) The second decade was focusing on the change from a pity–based approach to a rights-based one towards disability. The second prolongation might be interpreted as culture of postponing or suspension. At least the third decade has a nice motto: “Make the Right Real!” (ESCAP 2013, 2)

Reading through the midterm report (ESCAP 2007) that was published during Decade two or a report published by ESCAP in 2012 one gets the impression of a lot of movement. Paragraph after paragraph is filled with lists of countries or governments that have implemented this or that law or held another meeting. Detailed developments can be read about in these publications. What is interesting in the context of this paper are references to the Millenium Development Goals (MDGs) and development issues as such (ESCAP 2007, 3). We will encounter these again at a later stage of this paper. They are of special relevance when looking at the important role the Asian and Pacific region could play in refer tackling the miserable socio-economic situation of most persons with disabilities (see above).

Among others one question that remains is: Does all this impact national legislations and in the end individuals with disabilities?

Thai Perspective on Disabilities

Moving from the regional focus to a national one, one might perceive that the understanding of disability and disability-related policy making becomes easier. Due to the fact that all persons with disabilities are individual, the author doubts this approach.

Before looking at the impact of international agreements and cooperations on Thai disability – policy it makes sense to look into the Thai perception (if there is anything like this at all) of disability. As stated before disability is something tightly related to local cultures, in

---

5 Reasons for focusing on Thailand in this paper can be summarized as follows:
- The author’s research activities.
- Thailand’s important role in terms of disability-related issues (foremost trainings held in neighboring countries such as Cambodia and Myanmar) in the South-East Asian and Asian-Pacific region.
the case of Thailand one of the main influential factors in this regard is Buddhism and closely related to that: pity (songsarn) (Naemriratch and Manderson 2009). A person with one or more disabilities is likely to be perceived as someone one has to take care of. Interestingly, this is even mirrored in some passages of the law: “Some statutes appear to work in favor of persons with disabilities, but actually have resulted in adverse effects on their rights.” (Namsiripongpun n.d., 6). Exemption from the law to have to attend school and obligatory carrying of an ID are just two of the examples given by Namsiripongpun in his review of Thai legislature in accordance with applying the UNCRPD. If for example a person with disabilities is not able to protrude an ID when asked to do so by authorities, he or she will not be punished. A person without a disability on the other hand would receive a punishment on the same account.

Thailand signed the UNCRPD in 2007 and ratified it in 2008 (UN enable n.d.). Looking at the development of disability-related developments in Thailand it is interesting to contrast it with international developments happening around that time. The following column makes no claim to completeness. It aims at giving an overview and to pave the way to identify possible overlaps and influences:

Table 1 Contrasting sections of Thai legislature related to Disability and International Developments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Thailand</th>
<th>International</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1991 Rehabilitation of Persons with Disabilities Act (MFA n.d.,)</td>
<td>2001 Launch of ICF. Move away from medical approach to disability (WHO 2007)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^6\) Many of the persons interviewed in the CLASDISA project said that the situation had improved and that people with disabilities were treated differently. Still most of them are under the impression that the foremost perception was “pity”.

\(^7\) Probably this could be considered as starting point of the Thai disability movement.
As Apichatabutra claims in the findings of her thesis, there seems to be a connection between international developments, the disability movement, and policy making in Thailand. (2003: pp. 95). She argues that in the course of time the intensity of the impact of social movements diminishes. The intensity of this interrelation between disability movement and policy – making varies and it would be interesting to broaden the table above with more columns on historical, political and economic events as well as the development of the disability movement in Thailand. This would enable a more comprehensible picture. At least for a column on the disability movement no useful sources could be identified so far. This leads to the fact that the role of the disability movement in the implementation process remains unclear. Apparently, some members of the Association for the Deaf and the Council of Disabled People were able to influence politics as far as leading to the full recognition of all persons with disabilities as voters in the 1991 Constitution (Namsirigpongpun n.d., 5).

What should not be forgotten when putting the Thai and the international developments next to each other is the fact that regional and local specific characteristics have to be considered. Questions such as the following might be of interest in that regard:

- Is the UNCRPD accommodating the Thai approach towards inclusion of persons with disabilities?
- Is Thailand’s stated urge to move from a pity-based to a rights-based understanding (MFA, n.d., n.p.) really the “right” decision?
- Would it probably need much more time to find appropriate ways to “translate” it?
- Moving back to the table above once more, another analytical threat can be followed. Especially, the lowest lines on the side of Thailand are filled law enforcements. This takes us back to the initial point of interest:
- Does/Did the implementation of the UNCRPD have an impact on policy implementation in Thailand?

---

8 This is definitely not to indicate that the author is against equal rights for persons with disabilities all over the world. The total opposite is true. There might be ways to accelerate inclusion by learning from each other’s specific approach towards equality.
• If yes, does this or will this ever have an impact on individuals with disabilities?

Especially, the last question seems to be far from answerable. Conditions people with disabilities are living in are very different. So even if the implementation of the UNCRPD would trigger a shift in the Thai law to enable a theoretically more equal situation for persons with disabilities, this would still not guarantee the same levels of inclusion. A very striking point is that of living in urban or rural areas. A few kilometres might mean inaccessibility for a person using a wheelchair but enable another one with a visual disability to having access by a newly installed bus that is only accessible via steps.

An undated report by the MFA sums up the latest developments after Thailand’s implementation of the UNCRPD. It focuses itself clearly towards the following three goals in relation to the Millenium Development Goals (Ministry of Foreign Affairs n.d.):

• End poverty and hunger including poverty alleviation, social security, sustainable livelihoods, employment etc.

• Universal Education including training programs for persons with disabilities

• Gender Equality

Further points in relation to the UNCRPD mentioned deal with accessibility of public transport, accessible media, and involvement of NGOs etc.

Despite these important references within the Thai (planned) activities, doubts about the activities to realize or guaranteeing the sustainability of these points remain. Elaborating on this here are some points of discussion in relation to the implementation of the UNCRPD in Thailand:

• Next to the UNCRPD consisting of 50 articles there is an Optional Protocol consisting of 18 articles. Thailand has neither signed nor ratified it (UN enable n.d.)

• One of the main corner posts is the involvement and support of the disability movement, not only but also, in the monitoring process (UN 2006, 24) of the implementation. Namsiripongpun (n.d., 25) concludes that the involvement of persons with disabilities/their agencies is of high relevance in ensuring a proper monitoring as well as implementation process. It is not clear who wrote the report that can be found on the MFA’s website. It claims that services and organizations of persons with disabilities are to be involved and supported. In order to guarantee the implementation of article 33, Disabled People’s Organizations should be transparently involved in such processes.

Insights from the Field

In 2010 the author of this paper got the opportunity to interview a famous advocate for rights of persons with disabilities in Thailand. Talking about which role the movement played in changing the lives of persons with disabilities. He said:

---

9 A second interview before the ICIRD in 2013 is to shed more light on some of the open questions.
“We’ve been fighting for all of this. It’s not granted to us.” (Personal Communication 2010)

“You have to fight. So collectivism, you know, collective power bargaining, fighting is really needed.” (Personal Communication 2010)

It would be of high interest to go deeper into the meaning, importance and impact of global disability movements. Villeval applies Amartya Sen’s approach to freedom and the importance of empowerment the US gay – rights movement and the international disability movement (Villeval 2008, 256). The question is whether there is anything like an international disability (rights) movement at all (Villeval does not thoroughly define it in his article) and if so how it manifests or influences activities in Thailand.

Moving even closer to the micro – level one might consider looking at individuals with disabilities. As elaborated in the beginning, the author had the opportunity to interview a broad range of stakeholders in the field of education. She collected 23 cases consisting of at least three persons (child, legal guardian and teacher) who were interviewed up to three times.

As barriers and facilitators (ICF – CY 2007) in the educational environment were of central interest, topics related to law and politics popped up as well. The high level of acceptance most of the parents displayed towards the treatment of their children prevented them from knowing about or taking legal actions. Most of them mentioned that they were satisfied that they had found a school that accepted their child. This is despite the implementation of the 2008 Educational Provision for People with Disabilities Act that should enable entrance to any (public) school (Vorapanya and Dunlap 2012, 2). Only few parents were well informed, involved and even less thought about taking steps such as changing school or talking to administrators. Some said that they were afraid that this would cause bad treatment of their children. Overall most of the interviewees (mostly mothers or grandmothers) underlined that they were happy with everything provided and that they simply did not have time to get involved as they had to work.

Another interviewee, one of the pioneers of deaf education in Thailand, summarized the parents’ role as follows. She described a recent shift from the passive nodding receiver to a more involved, empowered and informed participant in school life. Having worked as a principal of a school, she was aware of the fact that it was hard work to get parents participate. As the word on disability spreads, thanks to media and more accessible facilities, chances rise that parents can afford to question the educational provision for their children with disabilities. Teachers reported about being overburdened by bureaucracy.

Having tried to shed light on the Thai situation, a final part of this paper will sum up and intends to sort out or at least order open questions.

**Conclusion**

This paper tried to approach the issue by reflecting the odyssey through (G) local Agreements and National Legislation, we can see whether an ASEAN perspective on disabilities
Thailand’s move from a pity to a rights-based understanding of disability

makes sense or not and in the end we still have open questions to be investigated further.

The undated report by the MFA which has been mentioned before, points out the important role of Thailand in the field of international cooperation on persons with disabilities. Indeed many of the protocols on meetings of ESCAP in regard to disability available online indicate Bangkok as meeting place.

One of the latest ones took place in May and what seems special about it is the fact that it was termed “ASEAN workshop”. Interestingly, almost no (academic) reference to the positioning of ASEAN towards disabilities could be identified by the author so far. It would be interesting to find out why this topic has been neglected so far or at least not been easily accessible for Western-based researchers. Nevertheless, one document of high interest will be summarized hereafter. The outcome of the meeting “Bangkok Recommendations Declaration of ASEAN Workshop On the Rights of Persons with Disabilities And the UN Convention on the Rights Of Persons with Disabilities CRPD” in Bangkok, termed the “Bangkok Recommendations Declaration”, consists of the following nine points (ASEAN workshop 2012, 1):

- Agreement on an ASEAN Decade of Persons with Disabilities between 2011 and 2020
- Recognition of international and national cooperation
- Encouraging the implementation of human rights and disability rights
- Encouraging the implementation of the UNCRPD
- Encouraging linkages with UN organizations and others to implement the UNCRPD
- Encouraging inclusion of disability in national action plans towards realization of MDGs (as these do not explicitly refer to disabilities; ESCAP 2013: 3)
- Inclusion of persons with disabilities at the (political) decision level
- Recognition of ASEAN disability forum as place for exchange
- Ensure realization of disability rights

The author of this paper got confused when reading about another, an ASEAN, Decade of persons with disabilities. Asking herself whether promoting, reporting on and planning all these Decades at the same time might keep Thailand and other countries, who are members of ASEAN and ESCAP, from implementing all these rights promised. Would it not make more sense to merge the efforts? It is hard to understand why international agreements and documents do not refer to each other. The MDGs and the UNCRPD could be a perfect match and their impact multiplied by intersecting.

On the other hand the quoted approach toward taking common decisions is fascinating. The document at hand comprises easily comprehensible and liveable concepts such as cooperation, recognition and insurance. But most of all: It has been summarized in only one page!
Something that could hardly be achieved by an agreement made under the lead of a Western-based organization. Even if documents are changed into “easy to read” versions, they are sometimes hard to understand.

Finally, the following questions can be posed as provoking further thoughts in relation to a culture-sensitive or at least considerate view on universal approaches to disability-legislative:

- Is the document provided by the ASEAN workshop, that seems to summarize many important considerations in terms of disability-related policy, that other international documents include, in such simple terms, the “ASEAN approach” towards the implementation of disability rights?
- Can this open but still comprehensive document ensure an improvement for persons with disabilities” in real life?

References


Thailand’s move from a pity to a rights-based understanding of disability


Transformative pedagogy: An evaluation of the use of the Learning to Live Together (LTLT) principles in higher secondary schools in Thailand

Muara Cusack*
muaracusack@hotmail.com
Claudine Claridad Tanvir**
claudine.claridad@gmail.com

Abstract

It has been almost 20 years since the concept of learning to live together (LTLT), one of the four pillars of learning, was endorsed by UNESCO as a vitally important element for peaceful and successful living for the 21st century. This research is an attempt to evaluate if LTLT has been successfully implemented through transformative pedagogy in senior high schools in Thailand. LTLT competencies encompass the following skills: knowledge of others; understanding of discrimination, empathy, acceptance, cultural sensitivity, communication skills, community involvement, teamwork, trust, tolerance, political participation, and concern for the environment. It is argued that if taught correctly, these 12 skills have a deep and profound influence on young minds (Delors, 1996, 43). This paper, therefore, used the conceptual framework in which these skills were evaluated as a connection between what is expected from LTLT principles and what is the actual reality in successfully delivering this through effective pedagogy in senior high schools in Bangkok. This paper carried out opinion surveys and interviews among teachers, and 30 classroom observations in two schools in Bangkok to ascertain if these 12 competencies are being taught and more importantly how these are being taught in class. Transformational pedagogy including student-centred, problem solving, action/project-based group work are examples of necessary teaching skills required for success. It is argued in this paper that even though LTLT is pledged in policy and is implemented in the current 2008 Thai Basic Core Curriculum, it is poorly delivered in practice because of a traditional teacher-centred pedagogy which relies on rote, is linear oriented, does not develop socio-emotional skills and does not appear to engage and connect the students with relevant life issues outside the classroom.

* Independent scholars
** Chairperson, Kabataan Kontra Kahirapan (Youth Against Poverty – Philippines)
Transformative pedagogy: An evaluation of the use of the Learning to Live Together (LTLT) principles in higher secondary schools in Thailand

Results of the opinion survey and data collected from interviews and classroom observations reveal that the teaching practices are inconsistent with the LTLT mandates which advocated a learner-centred focus and for students to take more initiatives in and become independent with their learning. The study exposes a distinctly teacher-centred style of pedagogy whereby the focus was on the teacher controlling the learning of the students rather than on learner autonomy in the social studies classroom.

Keywords: Pedagogical methods, transformative education, higher secondary school, Thailand, learning to live together (LTLT)

Introduction

In the 1996 UNESCO International Commission on Education for the Twenty-first Century report ‘Learning: The Treasure Within led by Jacques Delors the importance of education to personal and social development was high in the agenda as noted:

“At the dawn of a new century the prospect of which evokes both anguish and hope, it is essential that all people with a sense of responsibility turn their attention to both the aims and the means of education. It is the view of the Commission that, while education is an ongoing process of improving knowledge and skills, it is also perhaps primarily an exceptional means of bringing about personal development and building relationships among individuals, groups and nations.” (Delors 1996, 12)

The Delors Report also underscored that if education succeeds in its task, it “must be organized around the four pillars of learning: learning to know, learning to do, learning to live together, and learning to be” (Delors 1996, 12).

The Royal Government of Thailand (RGT) mentions some of the illustrative outcomes of LTLT in its vision in the National Education Act (NEA) where such abilities are highlighted: “to live in harmony with others” and “sound awareness of politics” (ONEC 1999, 8). In the 2008 Thai Basic Core Curriculum, the vision statement also describes the aims of education as aiding “development of morality” and having “responsibilities as Thai citizens and members of the world community” (OEC 2008, 4). Thailand has signed and ratified the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, Conventions on the Rights of the Child (Article 29) (1989), UN Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training and Recommendations Concerning Education for International Understanding, Cooperation and Peace and Education Relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (1974), all of which constitute an awareness of the importance of LTLT in its national normative frameworks. Thailand also takes part in the Education for all (EFA)¹ (2000-2015), United Nations’ Decade for Sustainable Development (UNDESD) (2005-

¹ In order to fulfill Article 26 of the 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights that “Everyone has a right to education” Education For All (EFA) was established in 1990 to commit to this pledge. Goal 3 states: To ensure that the learning needs of all young people are met through equitable access to appropriate learning and life skills programmes.
2014), Teaching Respect for All initiative, UN Secretary General’s Education First initiative (education for global citizenship as one of the three priority areas), World Programme for Human Rights Education, and the UN Decade for a Culture of Peace and Non-Violence (2001-2010). These international programs and frameworks endorse the concept of LTLT and this has indubitably influenced educational policy making and reform in Thailand.

With this backdrop, the purpose of this study is to evaluate whether the current pedagogy used in select secondary schools in Bangkok are in line with the promotion of the concept of Learning to Live Together (LTLT) principles through academic subjects such as: civics, economics, geography, history, and religion, all of which constitute social studies in the Thai curriculum for higher secondary schools.

**Learning to Live Together (LTLT)**

The Delors Commission stated that LTLT occurs through two complimentary processes: the “Discovery of others” and the “Experience of shared purposes”. It is the role of education to teach the diversities, similarities and interdependencies of the human race to children (Delors 1996). Within schools therefore, every opportunity should be encouraged to teach these two competencies. By encouraging children to be given an accurate view of the world, children need to discover who they are first. As the Delors Commission stressed that to be able for the children to put themselves in other people’s shoes and understand their reaction, they need to develop empathy at school towards a social behavior that comes across throughout life (Delors 1996, 93). This assertion is further described in Table 1 where the two complimentary processes and their corresponding competencies that are required for development of each one are outlined.

**Table 1 The 12 competencies associated with LTLT**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>“Discovery of Others”</th>
<th>“Experiences of Shared Purposes”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Knowledge of other cultures</td>
<td>• Communication skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Acceptance</td>
<td>• Teamwork</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Understanding of discrimination</td>
<td>• Trust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Cultural sensitivity</td>
<td>• Community involvement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Tolerance</td>
<td>• Political participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Empathy</td>
<td>• Concern for the environment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Delors 1996

---

2 Learning to live together will be referred to by the acronym of LTLT for the sake of brevity throughout this paper.

3 Higher secondary levels are grades 10, 11 and 12 or mattayom (class 4, 5, 6).

4 The International Commission comprised of multi-faith, multi-cultural academics and teachers from all over the world and was led by Jacques Delors who chaired the Commission from 1993-1996. In 1996: Learning: The Treasure Within was presented and was considered to be a landmark report which called for a radical rethinking about education in the 21st century.

5 Competencies are defined as: a combination of knowledge, skills and attitudes appropriate to the context. Key competences are those which individuals need for personal fulfillment and development, active citizenship, social inclusion and employment. (Delors 1996).
Transformative pedagogy: An evaluation of the use of the Learning to Live Together (LTLT) principles in higher secondary schools in Thailand

Although there may be a curriculum which ‘ticks all the boxes’ in content and structure, it is the practice of delivery through teaching methodologies that ensures it becomes a classroom reality. In order for this to be successfully carried out, transformative teaching and learning is necessary so that theory and practice are joined to form the praxis as Cogan and Morris (2002) argues:

“The manner in which teachers teach values in their classrooms can have a profound effect upon their students’ learning. As a group, teachers can wield significant influence over successive generations of young adults through a combination of the way they teach civic education, knowledge, skills, values, and through their selection (and omission).” (Cogan and Morris 2002, 245)

Democratic conscience as one of the core competencies in citizenship studies, for example (political participation in the context of the LTLT conceptual framework), must not only be taught, but also must be lived within the classroom, the school and the community. This assertion is shared by Wink (2005) when he argues that:

“In transformative education, the spirit leads the search for meaning. Students need to have classrooms in which they are safe to take risks. In this pedagogical model, teachers shift from control of knowledge to creation of processes whereby students take ownership of their learning and take risks to understand and apply their knowledge. Students and teachers come to realize that their actions can make a difference.” (Wink 2005, 122)

Obviously, it can be reassuring for children of a certain age to know that they exist in a clear power structure controlled by notions of family, patron/client relationship, religion, monarchy and seniority as can be observed for example in Thailand. However, in later years such a structure can create what Friere (1970) called a “Culture of Silence” which is an inability to critically assess society and its problems. The pedagogy adopted by Freire sought to give a voice to the marginalized and oppressed groups within society. This “culture of silence” obstructs what both Dewey (1916) and Friere (1970) agreed that the main concern and point of education is the improvement of society such as the community around a school or participation in improved governance. The teaching of LTLT can be seen as an anathema to this “culture of silence” as it advocates critical thinking, active participation and the development of positive socio-emotional skills, all of which can assist social cohesion.

---

6 In the classic “Pedagogy of the Oppressed” Paulo Freire, building on educators such as John Dewey described the traditional education system as the banking model because it sees a learner as an empty bank that needs to be filled with valuable knowledge in what is basically a transfer from one more powerful person (the teacher, lecturer) to a less powerful person. This is also referred to as the rote or transmission model of pedagogy and “Discovery of others” and “Experience of shared purposes” is not enhanced or encouraged through these teaching methods.

7 Philosophers might address these LTLT competencies at an abstract level however, the researcher believes from a sociological perspective the inclusion of culture, context and character building can empower individuals particularly young adolescents to exercise their rights without offending others and to be able to cope in various social arenas.
In the socio-political context of Thailand, LTLT competencies if correctly taught can be used to address challenges relevant and specific to Thailand such as: social inequality, recognition of a multicultural society, conflict, democratic reform, an appreciation of ethnic diversity, and, cultural and linguistic diversity. These can have a deep influence on young adolescents and could be a positive catalyst for social change and social justice. LTLT promotes how things ought to be or should be and how to value them, which things are bad or good in a society and which actions should be taken to correct a wrong into a right. These competencies have profound repercussions on what actions a society performs. Inevitably, such actions shape social policy and reform and advance true development in the form of enhanced livelihoods and decreased inequalities.

The focus on learners as the centre of learning contrasts with the traditional view where the teacher is being at the centre of the learning process. In transformative form of learning, teachers become facilitators of learning rather than transmitters of knowledge. On the other hand, the transmission model or commonly referred to as rote learning or the banking model is concerned with an over emphasis on literal questions where the teacher’s role is to give knowledge to students in a lecture-orientated manner and critical thinking skills are not encouraged and considered a byproduct of content (Dewey 1916, 45). Furthermore, as argued by Tozer, Viola and Senese (2002, 257), competitive individual focus overrides cooperative group focus. Table 2 details the differences between these two styles of pedagogy.

Table 2 Detailed differences between transformative and transmission styles of pedagogy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pedagogical Style</th>
<th>Uses:</th>
<th>Which:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transformative/critical method</td>
<td>- Dialectical</td>
<td>- Enquires with students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Multi-sourced</td>
<td>- Emphasizes higher questions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Grouping variety</td>
<td>- Models reading and thinking skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Values student’s context</td>
<td>- Teaches comprehension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Heterogeneous ability-grouped</td>
<td>- Integrates critical thinking and content</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Cooperative group focus</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Banking/transmission method</td>
<td>- Lecture oriented</td>
<td>- Gives knowledge to students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Linear</td>
<td>- Overemphasizes literal questions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Text-oriented</td>
<td>- Presumes thinking and reading skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Large group dominant</td>
<td>- Tests comprehension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Classroom bound</td>
<td>- Views critical thinking as a byproduct of content</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Ignores students context</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Homogenous ability grouped</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Competitive individual focus</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Adapted from Tozer, Viola and Senese 2002, 35
As shown in Table 2, the differences between transformative and transmission styles of pedagogy emphasize the crucial role the teacher can play in determining if LTLT is introduced in a classroom setting.

**Transformative Pedagogy**

Teachers are supposed to facilitate this transformative process towards a learner-centered classroom. In order for “Discovery of others” and “Experience of shared purposes” to be successfully implemented at the classroom level, fundamental pedagogical methods are needed such as:

1. Group work methods,
2. Co-operative learning modes, and
3. Methods of discussion, debate and agreement (APCEIU 2008, 35)

Group work methods can help improve students problem solving skills, work together for a common cause and enhances students’ perspective consciousness and awareness of human choices. Co-operative learning modes encourage students to learn a diversity of perspectives, cultures, human choices, global problems, and global systems. This aids group investigation and inspires students to carry out independent research which contributes to an end product highlighting teamwork, trust and effective communication skills learning modes. Methods of discussion, debate and agreement help students to practice listening skills, feel sympathy and/or empathy towards others. It also can help students learn to plan actions to solve real problems. Discussion time enables students to listen, question and come to an agreement in amicable terms with the best outcomes for both parties considered.

These collaborative and participatory teaching strategies facilitate “Discovery of others” and “Experience of shared purposes”. Teachers would require pedagogical skills that are “LTLT friendly” in order for opportunities to be enabled to be carried out in a classroom setting. The change from a teacher-centered to a learner-centered teaching approach advocated by the National Education Act (1999) and from teaching standards guidelines prioritizes the teacher to play the role of a facilitator who encourages students to “…develop active learning with freedom in thought, action and problem solving within the scope of the ethical and moral values of society” (OEC 2006).

**Research Methodology**

To be able to evaluate whether LTLT principles are applied in the pedagogy in schools, this paper used the case study approach. According to Burns (2000), a case study is a useful research strategy in which who, when, where, which, what and why are asked concerning real-life situations. This qualitative technique in data collection provided a deeper insight into how teachers interpret and transform LTLT principles into their teaching practices. The unit of analysis for this research is class practice where teaching methods and application of LTLT principles will be observed.

For this research, two higher secondary schools in Bangkok were selected to capture a broader picture of curriculum and practice. These schools were considered wholly appropriate in answering the main research question.
School A was selected as it is regarded as being one of the top elite state secondary schools in Thailand and which has the highest university entry rates in the country. It is Buddhist in its religious outlook. The school staff design and write the curriculum for social studies at this school. It is coeducational and has about 4,000 students. School B was chosen because the teachers in this school do not write their own curriculum and it is an all girls’ school with a student population of over 5,000. School B obtains the standardized textbooks from the Ministry of Education (MOE). The schools are located in central Bangkok. Another layer of the basis for selecting the schools for this research is the private and public classifications of the academic institutions. School A, being a public state school, adheres to the national policy where the State has the “…powers of duties for overseeing all levels and types of education.” (Section 31, MOE). School B, on the other hand, being a private religious school, states that the administration and management of education by the private sector shall “…enjoy independence with the state being responsible for overseeing monitoring and assessing educational quality and standards” (Section 43, MOE).

An observation checklist was used to evaluate the actual class practices in the school subject being selected. Thirty classroom observations were conducted. To further substantiate the data needed for the research, a questionnaire enquiring about teaching styles, important qualities deemed necessary to teach and outside of school participation in voluntary activities was given to the 18 teachers who participated in the survey. Table 3 summarizes the specific methodology that was used to determine how teachers of social studies interpreted and implemented LTLT principles into their pedagogy.

**Table 3 Data Collection Matrix**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research Question to be addressed</th>
<th>Data required</th>
<th>Sources</th>
<th>Tools needed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| How do teachers interpret and implement LTLT principles into their teaching practices? | • Textbook/manual for teachers  
• Pedagogical methods of the teacher  
• Group work methods used  
• Co-operative learning modes used  
• Methods of discussion, debate and agreement in use  
• Project based work being used  
• Problem solving work being used  
• Classroom arrangement conducive to a LTLT friendly environment | • Ministry of Education guidelines  
• Teaching standards for teachers from the Teachers Council of Thailand  
• Comparative analysis of pedagogical styles of social studies teachers | • In depth interviews with social studies teachers x 11  
• Classroom observations x 30  
• Detailed questionnaires x 18 |
Semi-structured interviews with the teachers were carried out to determine personal preferences for styles of teaching, extracurricular activities associated with LTLT that teachers engage in, involvement of students, among others. Table 4 gives an overall schema used for evaluating the responses of the teachers.

**Table 4 Overall schema for evaluating LTLT interview responses from social studies teachers (grades 10-12)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responses to Questions in Teacher questionnaire concerning:</th>
<th>Knowledge and practice of LTLT Principles Evident =E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. “Knowledge of other cultures”</td>
<td>Knowledge and practice of LTLT Principles not Evident =NE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. “Acceptance”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. “Understanding of discrimination”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. “Cultural sensitivity”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. “Empathy”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. “Tolerance”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. “Communication skills”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. “Teamwork”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. “Trust”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. “Community involvement”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. “Political participation”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. “Concern for the environment”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Had the teachers heard about LTLT/peace education/global citizenship?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do the teachers engage in LTLT activities outside the classroom?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do the teachers promote LTLT activities in the classroom?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do the teachers trust people in general?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do the teachers use any other supplementary material?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is the classroom layout such as seating arrangements, wall décor conducive and advancing a LTLT environment/atmosphere?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is there any evidence of group work activities/project work?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
For the social studies classroom observations, this research determined whether transformational pedagogy was being taught conducive to enhancing LTLT principles and competencies. Note taking on observations about student-teacher interactions in class, classroom layout, and evidence of course work associated with LTLT on notice boards/displays was undertaken. Table 5 indicates the subjects which encompass social studies for senior high school secondary students in Thailand and details the number of social studies classes observed by the researcher.

**Table 5** Brief synopsis of social studies classroom observations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Total No. of Classroom observations</th>
<th>Social Studies: History</th>
<th>Social Studies: Geography</th>
<th>Social Studies: Religion</th>
<th>Social Studies: Economics</th>
<th>Social Studies: Civics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A final observation analysis was used to determine if transformative or transmission/rote style teaching methods were being employed to teach these subjects using guidelines stipulated by the Thai Education Bureau. Table 6 gives an overview of the schema used to analyze the styles of pedagogy used by the teachers of social studies in their respective classrooms.

**Table 6** Overall schema for evaluating use of transformative pedagogy of social studies teachers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concept/ Analytical category of : “Discovery of others” (1-6) and “Experience of Shared Purposes” (7-12)</th>
<th>Pedagogical style of instruction</th>
<th>Transformational Pedagogy (E=Evident) (NE=Not Evident)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
Results and Analysis

Based on the results from the questionnaire, the findings revealed that the average teacher had taught social studies for 11 years. Sixty per cent are female as opposed to 40 per cent male. Fifty per cent of the teachers are over 45 years old, 25 per cent are between the ages of 20-34, and 25 per cent are between the ages of 35-44. The average number of students in each class was 46. Social studies teachers conduct this subject between 2-3 classes a week.

In the questionnaire given, 18 teachers were asked to rank the LTLT qualities (as shown in Table 4) in order of importance (with 5 being the most important and 1 being the least important) which they consider important to teach to their students. Their response frequencies were added up to produce their preferences. Educating students to have a feeling of responsibility was significantly ranked the most important quality. This was followed by hard work, self expression, determination and perseverance, independence, religious faith, unselfishness, obedience, imagination, tolerance and respect, and thrift/saving money. Teaching a feeling of responsibility can be seen as promoting a positive program of experiences to students and encourages a sense of empathy and trust and making them feel responsible for their actions. It can also encourage students to be responsible not only towards respecting each other but also towards caring for the environment. It promotes a sense of responsibility for the community such as improving or participating in programs which are designed to enhance a learning to live together mentality. Figure 1 showcases the preferences of social studies teachers on the LTLT qualities that are considered important in their teaching practices.

Figure 1 List of qualities teachers of social studies consider important to teach their students

Findings also revealed that even though religion is taught as a complete subject, social studies teachers ranked it sixth in the questionnaire out of eleven qualities as shown in Figure 1.

Teachers’ personal engagement and participation in civic-related activities outside school can reveal their level of civic connectedness. These indicators can measure how engaged social studies teachers are and
to what extent these could be introduced and brought into their pedagogy and into a classroom setting contributing to enhancing LTLT competencies. The constructs listed in Figure 2 details the voluntary organizations listed in the teacher’s questionnaire which the teachers are active members. Surprisingly, results revealed that not one teacher was an active member or belonged to a political party. This construct of being inactive members could be viewed as a lack of engagement, apathy, fear or lack of faith in political processes and participation. Indubitably, this will have an effect on the teaching (albeit lack of teaching) of political participation, one of the core competencies of LTLT.

Figure 2 Social Engagement of Social Studies Teachers

![Chart showing social engagement of teachers](image)

The vertical axis represents the number of teachers who participated in the questionnaire survey.

Another question in the questionnaire asked teachers to answer whether or not most people could be trusted. Interestingly, 60 per cent of teachers stated that most people could be trusted leaving 40 per cent of teachers believing that you need to be very careful in dealing with people. This high figure of 40 per cent could be construed as having a lack of trust to people in the school or community and could be embedded in a hidden agenda whereby the

---

8 At the time of carrying out research and writing, a military coup had occurred and Bangkok was under martial law.
teacher by not trusting people could impart this mistrust of others through their pedagogy.\(^9\)

Regarding the classroom layout, it was observed that all of the classrooms revealed the same seating arrangement rows of desks were all facing the teachers’ desk and whiteboard. This arrangement does not enable the students to interact in groups and it also makes both presentation and discussion in groups difficult. The teacher is viewed as the “sage on the stage” or as a “preacher teacher” and during the 30 social studies observations that were conducted, there was never an occasion where a teacher walked around the class to engage and interact with the students in the classroom. Teachers stayed in the same positions at the top of the classroom throughout the learning session. Answers given in the questionnaires in relation to encouraging students to work in groups proved contradictory in practice. There were notice boards in all of the classrooms, however, apart from one classroom which had a poster about the harms of drug abuse, every classroom had pictures of His Royal Highness The King or other members of the Thai Royal Family. There was no evidence of project work or activities which linked social studies themes on display.

It is also worth mentioning that all the social studies teachers were informed that they were going to be observed for teaching styles one week prior to the researchers visit. A considerable amount of time was spent with the teachers in the staffroom discussing textbooks, assessments, school climate and teaching workloads.

In almost all of the classrooms observed except for one, group work methods, cooperative–learning modes, debates and open floor discussions were absent. There was most definitely a teacher-centered approach and the students did not get an opportunity to discuss topics at any stage during the lesson. It was a teacher-led lesson accompanied by a Power Point (although in some classes, teachers did not use Power Points) accompanied by the standard textbook. There was no extra course material introduced. In the only student exchange\(^10\) observed, students were asked to list the advantages and disadvantages of Thailand becoming a member of the economic community of ASEAN in 2015. The following replies were extrapolated:

**Advantages:**
- Cultural exchanges
- Unity
- Easy to visit other countries

**Disadvantages:**
- Do not know if people are bad or good
- More diseases could be introduced
- More competition

---

9 In the only classroom interchange observed (detailed further in the article about the advantages and disadvantages of Thailand joining the Economic Union of ASEAN in 2015) one of the disadvantages the students said was that they did not know if people were bad or good. The teacher did not question the students about why they considered this a disadvantage, leading the researcher to conclude that by not questioning or indeed encouraging students to develop a trusting outlook in other ASEAN member state citizens, the impact of the hidden agenda was clearly observed.

10 This exchange took place in a grade 10 civics class
Regarding the textbooks used in the social studies subject, it was found out in the study that the content lacked relevant, inclusive, experiential and situational role play scenarios which could have reinforced non-cognitive domains such as trust, empathy, and tolerance necessary for the classroom learning experience. As a result of this absence, the teachers were not able to practice these activities as observed during any of the classroom observations. When teachers were asked about what classroom exercises they carried out to inculcate values, three teachers replied that they used examples from developed countries such as The UK, France, and Germany. This could be deduced by the students that the teachers perceived “good values” to emanate from “developed” countries and to consider “bad values” to have originated in underdeveloped countries. Teachers being observed expressed that practice role plays did take place in health class, not in any of the social studies class itself, to teach safe sex, HIV prevention, overcoming peer-group pressure and bullying, among others. Hence, the teaching of some LTLT competencies could be seen as cross-curricular, as taught in health. Moreover, teamwork, for example, could be exemplified in sporting activities. “Trust” could be exemplified in health class when students group in teams to work on some role play.

In a grade 10 religion class, students listened attentively to the teacher who spoke at length without debate about the merits of the present coup d'état and how beneficial the military overthrow of the red shirt dominance in national politics had restored true democracy to Thailand. Afterwards, there was a rapturous applause from all the students which led the researcher to wonder how such a stance promoted and enhanced having a true democratic conscience in which both sides of the political spectrum got a chance to air their views and opinions. This illustrates an example of the hidden agenda element which is difficult to detect and which involves the teachers own perspectives on how social studies should be taught and is based around their own norms, habits and traditions.

Scouting, girl guides, civil defense and volunteering for the Red Cross did not continue in higher secondary school. The students volunteered to clean the temple or altar at the school. When teachers were questioned about what projects or activities they encouraged their students to participate in outside of the classroom, few responses were given. One teacher was involved with the Teachers’ Motorcycles of Thailand (TMT) and encouraged his students to donate money, food and school supplies to the poorer border regions in northern Thailand. A few teachers stated they encouraged their students to volunteer but did not elaborate or give examples. It was also observed that bins of empty water bottles outside classrooms were present which prompted students to recycle, thereby, creating awareness for the need to protect the environment. There was a monetary collection for some donations to charitable organizations in both schools as can be observed in Figure 3.
The money tree is made up of real bank notes and garlands to express the generosity of students in School B.

What can be deducted from the responses is that even though teachers do participate in extra-curricular activities for the benefit of the outside community there does not appear to be an overall link up with their place of work and their students.

Pedagogical methods used by teachers of social studies were distinctly teacher-centred and not learner-centred. In all of the classroom observations conducted, it was found out that learning by rote seemed to be the standard norm and used throughout. There was minimal discussion between the students and teachers and between the students themselves. There was no evidence of group work, debates or discussions. Therefore, the transmission method was overwhelmingly the pedagogical style of choice. Table 7 gives a breakdown of the responses obtained from the teachers.
Table 7 Summary of responses from questionnaire and classroom observations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concept/ Competency domain</th>
<th>Responses to Questions in Teacher questionnaire and classroom observations</th>
<th>Knowledge and practice of LTLT: (Evident or Not Evident)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Of “Discovery of others”(1-6) and “Experience of Shared Purposes” (7-12)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. ”Knowledge of others”</td>
<td>Had the teachers heard about LTLT/Global citizenship/peace education?</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. “Acceptance”</td>
<td>Do the teachers engage in LTLT activities with students outside the classroom?</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. “Understanding of discrimination”</td>
<td>Do the teachers promote LTLT activities in the classroom?</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. “Cultural sensitivity”</td>
<td>Do the teachers trust people in general?</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. “Empathy”</td>
<td>Do the teachers use any other supplementary material?</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. “Tolerance”</td>
<td>Is there evidence of project based group work?</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. “Communication skills”</td>
<td>Are the teachers ordering and prescribing the content of the subject indicating a theory of teacher-centered instruction or transmission method?</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Concept/ Competency domain  |  Responses to Questions in Teacher questionnaire and classroom observations | Knowledge and practice of LTLT: (Evident or Not Evident)
---|---|---
Of “Discovery of others”(1-6) and “Experience of Shared Purposes” (7-12) | Are the students described as initiating and participating in independent tasks and activities, in project based work that might go beyond the classroom indicating a learner centered based or transformative mode of pedagogy? | No | Not evident

As can be observed from the interview responses in Table 7 and from the classroom observations, it was obvious that a teacher-centred, lecture-oriented, linear, transmission method of pedagogy was being used by the teachers of social studies. The social studies teachers gave their own interpretations of the topic and there was no student interaction; no application and synthesis of the information being “transferred”; it was not enquiry based; it did not have a cooperative group focus and was most definitely not multi-sourced. The banking/transmission method was the pedagogical method employed by all of the eighteen teachers. To conclude, this can be viewed as not successfully implementing LTLT competencies because the pedagogy is not appropriate.

These 12 concepts which promote an inclusive society and embrace diversity are in line with international standards and agreements to which Thailand has signed but which are disappointedly absent in social studies curricula. They were seen by the researcher to be discrete, disconnected and not linked to the actual curricula. Even though the twelve concepts get mentioned, what is not specified and contextualized is a correct definition relevant to Thailand’s current social challenges. This makes it difficult for social studies curriculum developers and teachers in the case of School A to write clear, cohesive textbooks which promote inclusiveness thereby hindering successful implementation. The concept of “Tolerance” for example does get mentioned,
however, on a more practical and relevant context. “Tolerance” of what is what is absent. Considering Thailand has numerous ethnic groups, minority religious groups, refugees, migrants, and a foreign tourist influx this needs to be represented in the curriculum. There also needs to be extensive periods of reviewing and sociological challenges relevant to Thailand which needs to be defined and included in regularly updated social studies curricula. This will adequately prepare teachers to teach and prepare students for the realities of life after school and help them understand the challenges faced by minorities, the poor and marginalized in Thai society.

**Conclusion and Recommendations**

The findings concluded that the pedagogical methods used by teachers of social studies were overwhelmingly teacher-centred and not learner-centred. Learning by rote or by transmission method seemed to be common in all of the social studies classrooms based on the observations made. There was minimal discussion between the students and teachers and between the students themselves. There was no evidence of group work, debates or discussions. The hidden agenda encompassing the teachers’ own beliefs, traditions and experiences interacted and affected the classroom learning environment. In other words, social studies teachers had a powerful influence in convincing the students to think in the same way as they did rather than encourage differences of opinion marked by lively debates and discussions. The transmission method practiced by all of the teachers ignored the students’ contexts and personal aspirations in life. There was an absence of integrating critical thinking skills used in transformative teaching, no evidence of cooperative group working methods and a lack of supplementary materials. Therefore, the transmission method was distinctly the pedagogical method of choice for senior high school social studies teachers. To conclude, transformative pedagogy was not being used to teach learning to live together (LTLT) principles through social studies subjects in the selected senior high schools in Thailand.

This article has concentrated on the curriculum and pedagogy to detect if LTLT is evident and being effectively taught by a transformational style of pedagogy in Thailand. The findings revealed that the teaching practices were inconsistent with the mandates from the MOE which advocated a learner-centred focus and for students to take more initiatives in and become independent with their learning.

The findings of this research have heightened the great need for effective, pragmatic subjects to be taught in schools which equip students with the knowledge and necessary skills for life. The transformative method of teaching encourages students to develop critical thinking and decision making skills that are facilitated by activities in class such as interactive consensus building, role playing, debates, and groupwork exercises. In the socio-political context of Thailand, LTLT competencies taught using a transformational
Transformative pedagogy: An evaluation of the use of the Learning to Live Together (LTLT) principles in higher secondary schools in Thailand

approach can be used to address challenges relevant and specific to Thailand such as: social inequality, recognition of a multicultural society, conflict, and democratic reform, an appreciation of ethnicity, cultural and linguistic diversity. All these can have a deep influence on young adolescents and could be a catalyst for social change and social justice. LTLT promotes how things ought to be or should be and how to value them, which things are bad or good in a society and which actions should be taken to correct a wrong into a right. These competencies have profound repercussions on what actions a society performs. Inevitably, such actions shape social policy and reform and advance true development in the form of enhanced livelihoods and decreased inequalities. Conclusions drawn from the research infers that Thailand is still not getting a return on its investment in education. The provision of a relevant, inclusive social studies curriculum delivered by proficient teachers (who are regularly, professionally developed) that use a student-centred, transformative style of pedagogy is ineffective and deficient. Another contribution derived from the research was how the delivery of a social studies programme depends on the characteristics and personality of the teacher (in the form of the hidden agenda) and this can impact its provision, sometimes positively and sometimes in a negative way.
References


Education for disaster risk reduction toward change: The case of the ‘Climate Change Academy’ in Albay province, Philippines*

Claudine Claridad Tanvir**
claudine.claridad@gmail.com

Abstract

The increasing frequency of disaster risks due to natural hazards such as typhoons that hit the Philippines over the past years has become a major concern of disaster risk reduction managers especially in the Province of Albay – a typhoon highway of the country. Local and national legislations have begun to address this issue by means of capacitating the local government units (LGUs) so that communities can prepare, respond and recover (better) from the impact of disasters. The purpose of this paper is to examine the contribution of the government-led education program through the ‘Climate Change Adaptation and Disaster Risk Reduction and Management Training Institute’, most commonly known as the ‘Climate Change Academy’, to the overall disaster risk reduction processes for community resilience building in Albay. To be able to substantiate the Academy’s contribution, this paper used the socio-ecological model of change and organizational behavior concept to evaluate the factors that contribute to behavioral changes of the staff of LGUs who underwent the training as well as changes in their workplace policies and practices as a result of the training program. Following this, these changes were explained further by looking at how the concept of education for disaster risk reduction (EDRR) was carried out in the Academy’s training program in order to help achieve the desired results in terms of building the capacities of the LGUs. For this paper, data was collected mainly through a tracer study of 11 former participants of a particular training activity and in-depth interviews with different individuals who are directly or indirectly related to the Academy. It was argued in this paper that capacities and skills were built and that positive changes in the participants’ behavior were observed after undergoing the training in the Academy and that these changes have been helpful in reducing disaster risks in their respective communities, which in effect contributed to the community resilience building effort of the Province of Albay.

Keywords: education, disaster risk reduction, behavior change, Albay, Philippines

*This article is developed from a paper presented in the 3rd MSSRC International Conference on “Mekong Region and ASEAN in Transition: People and Transborder Issues”, 11-12 September 2014 at U-Place, Ubon Ratchathani University, Thailand.

**Chairperson, Kabataan Kontra Kahirapan (Youth Against Poverty – Philippines)
Introduction

Considered as the typhoon highway of the Philippines, the Province of Albay has been identified as one of the most vulnerable to disasters provinces in the country according to a study released jointly by the Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR) and the Manila Observatory (Center for Environmental Geomatics – Manila Observatory 2005). Disaster risks and vulnerabilities of Albay includes climate weather related risks such as typhoon, rainfall increase, El Niño, and temperature increase, and geophysical hazards such as earthquake induced landslides, earthquakes, tsunami, and volcanic eruptions (Salceda 2012).

Without much of a debate, education creates a positive effect on reducing risks and vulnerabilities of peoples and communities (Asia-Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO (ACCU) 2011; Fazey et al. 2007; Huckle and Sterling 1996; Nathe 2000; Polotan-dela Cruz and Ferrer 2010; UNESCO 2005; UNISDR 2005). At the global level, it is regarded as a key feature in disaster risk reduction and management (DRRM) as articulated in the Hyogo Framework for Action (HFA 2005-2015), a blueprint agreed by 168 national governments in 2005 to catalyze and institutionalize a process to establish the culture of safety and resilience in and among nations and communities (UNISDR 2005). UNESCO explained that the role of education for disaster risk reduction (EDRR) is to ‘develop a resilient population that is able to reduce the economic, social, and cultural impacts should a hazardous event occur,’ and ‘save lives and prevent injuries should a hazard occur’ (UNESCO Website). The United Nations Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), when applied in the Hyogo Framework, builds a stronger foundation for disaster risk reduction and resilience building.

Purpose and Objectives of the Study

To be able to understand the contribution of education in the overall disaster risk reduction strategy in Albay, this paper will look into the case of the training programs done by the Climate Change Adaptation and Disaster Risk Reduction and Management Training Institute (CCADRRMTI), commonly known as the Climate Change Academy. This paper will particularly address the following objectives:

- Determine the capacities gained by the participants as a result of the Academy’s training program, and
- Determine the positive changes in the participants’ behavior as a result of the training program.

Conceptual Framework

This paper used the socio-ecological model of change to explain how changes in behavior of the individuals trained by the Academy are influenced by crosscutting factors on information

---

1 Another role of EDRR as pointed out by UNESCO is to prevent interruptions to the provision of education, or ensure its swift resumption in the event of interruption.

2 For this paper, ‘Climate Change Academy’ or the ‘Academy’ will be used instead of the new name of the institution.
and knowledge, motivation, ability to act, and social norms that are manifested from the social environment to human action (Figure 1). The social structures that are in place that implement and contribute to the education program for disaster risk reduction in Albay will be taken in consideration so that necessary conditions in identifying opportunities and obstacles in maximizing impact of the Academy’s objectives is contextualized. As described in Figure 1, the enabling environment where institutional policies and practices are located as well as the type of leadership/s that are mandated to implement educational programs such as that of the Climate Change Academy will be analyzed as necessary factors needed to create behavioral changes.

It is also necessary to include the organizational behavior concept in order to analyze how the interactions between the individuals and the organizations or institutions influence the making of the desired human behavior and workplace policy changes in the organizational setting (Moorhead and Griffin 1995). The political dynamics in the government, in the case of Albay, for example, can be strong determinants for personal behavior and policy changes and can therefore affect the effectiveness of programs both in the community and provincial levels.

While disaster studies have already established the importance of education in DRRM, there are still limited researches that specifically identify the changes that have occurred both in the behavior of the individuals being trained and in the workplace as a direct result of the training and education provided by an institution.

**Figure 1** The Socio-Ecological Model of Change

Source: Agrawal, Aruldas, and Khan 2014, 6
Methodology

This paper used the case study approach, particularly employing the tracer study method to gather feedback from 11 select individuals who participated in the trainings of the Academy. These individuals are either members of the Sangguniang Barangay (SB or Village Council) or employees of the Provincial Government of Albay (PGA) – both belonging to the local government unit (LGU) of the province (refer to Table 1). The technique used in selecting the participants or informants of the study is purposive sampling technique. The sampling was based on a set of criteria that determines the relevance/irrelevance of learning to his or her functions in work both at the time of and after the training. The training selected for the tracer study is the ‘Disaster Risk Reduction and Climate Change Adaptation Training’\(^3\). A participants list was provided by the Academy and was used as the main source of the sample. Fifty-two individuals representing the Albay Province were identified in the full list of participants in which the purposive sampling technique was applied. In circumstances that contact details provided in the list were unreachable, a referral system or snowballing technique was used.

Table 1 Tracer Study List of Informants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Informant No.</th>
<th>Training Year</th>
<th>Organization/Workplace During Training Year</th>
<th>Position During Training Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PGA1</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Provincial Government of Albay (PGA)</td>
<td>Local Government Operations Officer II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SB2</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Village Council or Sangguniang Barangay (SB)</td>
<td>Barangay Councilor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PGA3</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>PGA</td>
<td>Assistant Chief of Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PGA4</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>PGA</td>
<td>Researcher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PGA5</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>PGA</td>
<td>Project Development Officer II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SB6</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>SB</td>
<td>Barangay Councilor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SB7</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>SB and City League of Barangays</td>
<td>Barangay Treasurer and League Staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SB8</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>SB and City League of Barangays</td>
<td>Barangay Captain and League President</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PGA9</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>PGA</td>
<td>Admin Aide IV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PGA10</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>PGA</td>
<td>Admin Aide IV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PGA11</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>PGA</td>
<td>Supply Officer</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^3\) Three respondents however where selected from similar trainings that were done in 2011 and 2013 to include staff-participants from the Academy itself and two from the PGA and to cover in the analysis the political transitions that happened within the Academy and the local elections in 2013.

\(^4\) The Village Council locally known as the Sangguniang Barangay is the smallest governing unit under the Local Government Unit (LGUs) of the provinces in the Philippines. Council members are elected by registered voters in the community once in every three years.
In depth interviews with the Academy’s officials and staff, and some of its partners who are directly and indirectly involved in the training program were also done to support the data collection process. Finally, a secondary data review provided relevant information in determining the current status of the DRRM in the province and the Academy’s guiding principles and strategies in carrying out its training and capacity-building programs for the LGUs and other stakeholders.

Structure

This paper is structured as follows. An introduction to this paper will be discussed in Section 1. Section 2 will discuss the basic profile of Albay Province which include its disaster risk reduction (DRR) strategies that respond to climate related risks and vulnerabilities to hazards. Section 3 will briefly discuss about the Academy and its training programs to give a background to its education principles and strategies in order to gauge their contribution in achieving disaster risk reduction in the province. In Section 4, the whole discussion about the capacities that have been built among the participants of the training will be determined and eventually be analyzed whether the lessons learnt have resulted into changes in personal behavior change. Finally, Section 5 will summarize the findings of this paper and pose some recommendations that can be made useful for the Academy’s future program planning and implementation.

The Albay Model: ‘Safe and Shared Development’

Profile of Albay: Social and Environmental Vulnerabilities

As briefly discussed in the introduction section, Albay is home to various disaster risks and vulnerabilities. This condition inevitably worsens the poverty situation of the people of Albay.

Bounded on the east by the Pacific Ocean, on the northwest by the Lagonoy Gulf and on the west and southwest by Burias Pass, it is no wonder Albay is prone to climate related disasters with 3-5 major typhoons that hit every year resulting to mudflows, storm surges, flooding, and landslide. Situated also along the Pacific Ring of Fire, it has a very high risk of exposure to volcanic eruptions due to Mount Mayon’s active volcanic activities that may threaten the communities of three cities and municipalities of Albay. Because of its geographic location, tsunamis are a huge threat to the people as Albay, with a population of 1.2 million (2010 Census), is surrounded by 364-kilometre long coastlines that can affect around 300,000 people.

Not only that Albay has high environmental vulnerabilities to disasters, it is also challenged by persistent poverty. According to the official statistics, poverty incidence among families in Albay has increased from 30.2% in 2009 to 33.9% in 2012. This provincial figure,
which is way above the national average of 19.7%, has not been changed that much since 2006 when poverty incidence was at 28.7%. At a national scale, Bicol (Region V) where Albay is located is among the poorest regions in the Philippines (National Statistical Coordination Board (NSCB) 2013). The constant threat and destruction of disasters to the source of livelihoods of a large portion of the Albay, a population which are mainly based on agriculture, fisheries and ecotourism, plays a huge factor in poverty situation in the province. This condition traps the poor population in a cycle of (increased) poverty and disaster (Oxfam GB 2013). Figures 2 and 3 visually describes disaster and poverty situation in Albay:

**Figure 2** Combined Risks to Climate Disasters

**Figure 3** Poverty in the Philippines

Sources: National Statistical Coordination Board (NSCB) 2013; Salceda 2012

---

5 Poverty as a social indicator is defined by the Philippine government as the condition in which the basic food and non-food needs are not being met by an individual or a family. Income of a household/family (with 4-5 members) which falls below the national average of USD 183 (PhP 7,890) or less than USD 1.25 per day per person is categorised as poor.
The vulnerability to disasters experienced regularly by the local people of Albay, especially the poor, clearly captured the social justice issue where ‘those who have less in life, have more in risks’ (Salceda 2012). This fundamental basis of disaster risk reduction and management initiatives in Albay currently led by Governor Joey Sarte Salceda reinforces what previous studies have underscored that the idea of reduction of human vulnerabilities created by poverty is a central element in DRRM paradigm (Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change 2012; Wisner, Blaikie, Cannon, and Davis 2004; World Bank 2005) where education and skills training is a crucial component.

Adaptation Strategy of Albay: Innovation in Disaster Risk Reduction

Albay has established the Albay Public Safety and Emergency Management Office (APSEMO) in 1994, which serves as the permanent mechanism for preparing and responding to various types of hazards and disasters. This innovation in disaster management was later followed by the institutionalization of the Centre for Initiatives and Research for Climate Adaptation (CIRCA) in 2008 and the Albay Millennium Development Goals Office (AMDGO) in 2009. To specifically respond to the growing needs to provide training and education for the LGUs, the Climate Change Academy was created in 2011. These four institutions with interlinked objectives and roles facilitate disaster risk reduction and management as well as the climate change adaptation programs in Albay. The combined efforts of these institutions contribute to programs that will initiate sustainable economic growth especially in poverty and disaster stricken communities. This strategy makes up Albay as a model LGU.

Due to the recurring cycle of disasters and socio-economic deprivation in Albay, the leadership of Salceda, who were elected in 2007, further introduced innovative approaches to addressing these issues by integrating these strategies in the development planning and implementation processes. These strategies, which make up the Albay Model, are the following:

- Localization of Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and as a goal for DRR;
- Establishment of environmental and socio-economically sound policies with appropriate budget allocation for DRR and development projects;
- Execution of programs and projects from the provincial level down to the communities;
- Building institutions for social service delivery, research and development, and capacity building; and
- Nurturing partnerships and resource mobilization. (Salceda 2012)

---

6 The AMDGO is the reorganised form of Ayuda Albay formed in 2007 to manage the cluster approach to rehabilitation post 2006 disaster (Salceda 2011).

7 Before being elected as Governor of Albay, Salceda served as a Member of the Philippine House of Representatives (Congress) from 1998 to 2007. He also had a short stint in 2007 as Malacañang Chief of Staff under the Office of the President Gloria Macapagal-Arroyo.
The ‘Albay Model’ reinforced the ‘Zero Casualty’ policy during disasters and institutionalized ‘safe and shared development’ paradigm which encapsulates goals on climate and disaster proofing and improved human development index (HDI) as necessary conditions to development. In effect, this strategy resonates with the human security approach to development defined by the UNDP in 1994 where environmental security is set as crucial principle in protecting people from the onslaught of natural hazards and human-induced disasters. As argued by Bohle, Etzold, and Keck (2009) and Obrist, Pfeiffer, and Henley (2010), resilience is a dynamic process linked to human agency where groups and people are able to deal with hazards, adapt, cope, learn, and innovate, and to develop leadership capacity arising from the onslaught of disasters.

All programs that are envisaged in the Albay Model are located in the DRRM continuum: pre-disaster phase (risk reduction and preparedness), disaster phase (response), and post-disaster phase (early recovery, rehabilitation and reconstruction).

The triple typhoons in 2006 (Milienyo in September, Reming in November, and Seniang in December) which triggered the collapse of volcanic debris deposited on the slope of the Mayon Volcano left more than 600 dead and 400 more missing, and billions of pesos worth of destruction to infrastructure and agriculture in Albay (Salceda 2012). This 2006 disaster was considered as a painful reminder for Albay to strengthen even more its DRRM programs especially in the enforcement of the ‘Zero Casualty’ policy. The Provincial Disaster Risk Reduction and Management Council (PDRRMC), which oversees the overall DRR programs, are operationalized under the following guiding principles led by its governor since 2007:

- To promote a proactive and not a reactive response to disasters;
- To evacuate at the early stage of the calamity instead of to rescue affected families;
- To promote an institutional rather than personal orientation;
- To promote coordination and teamwork and not individual action;
- To conduct community-based disaster risk reduction programs and projects as basic input to the Regional Master Plan;
- To adopt a disaster proofing approach to development; and
- To integrate DRR in the Comprehensive Land Use Plan and promote no or selective investment in high-risk zone, maximum protection in the low to moderate risk zone, and to identify safe zones as sites for new development investments. (Espinas 2013)

This set of guidelines is the basis of the training and education programs of the province under the auspices of both APSEMO and the Academy which puts premium on the three elements that will achieve the ‘Zero Casualty’ policy: 1) early warning systems, 2) communication protocol, and 3) evacuation procedures.

---

1 Foreign exchange rate is approximately 1 USD = 44.5 PhP as of 10 November 2014.
Since Typhoon Reming in 2006, Albay has been successful in maintaining the ‘Zero Casualty’ goal except in 2011 when another strong typhoon hit the Bicol region, which left Albay with 77 deaths and more than PhP 4-billion damage to infrastructure and agriculture. It should be noted also that from 1994 since the establishment of APSEMO to 2005, no casualty was recorded from climate and volcanic related hazards that affected the province during that period (Salceda 2012).

Model for National Laws

Because of Albay’s effective strategy on building institutions and successful implementation of its DRRM programs, the province was declared as a role model of the United Nations International Strategy for Disaster Risk Reduction (UNISDR) for Institutionalized and Innovative Disaster Risk Management in 2008. Following this, two national laws on DRR and CCA were based on the Albay Model (Salceda 2012). The Republic Act (RA) 9729 or ‘The Climate Change Commission Law of 2009’ and the RA 10121 or the ‘The Philippine DRRM Act of 2010’ are the laws that mandate the institutionalization of a DRRM Office (aside from the DRRM Council) and the Climate Change Commission, respectively. Prior to the passing of these laws, Albay was able to organize two national conferences on climate change, which produced the “Albay 2007 Declarations” and the “Manila 2009 Declarations”. The former has become a tool for the early passage of the Climate Change Act and the creation of the Climate Change Commission which is the sole national-level policy-making body tasked to coordinate, monitor and evaluate the programs and action plans of the government relating to climate change’ (UNISDR website). The deadly typhoons that hit the Philippines in 2008, 2009 and most especially in 2010 which exposed the weak disaster management in the country, legislators were pushed to accelerate the passing of the DRRM Law.

Albay Governor Joey Salceda who is known in the country as the ‘green economist’ and a champion of CCA and DRR institutionalized CIRCA in 2009 which provides technical support on research and development to APSEMO about climate change adaptation strategies and is currently co-managing the Academy.

The Climate Change Academy: An Innovation for Disaster Risk Reduction

Institutional Profile

Being a model in DRR and CCA and consequently because of the passage of the CCA Law, the Climate Change Academy for the

---

9 Republic Act (RA) 9729 or the “Climate Change Act of 2009” is a law that aims to mainstream the concept of climate change into government policies, establish a framework strategy and programs on climate change, and create a Climate Change Commission that will address the vulnerabilities of the Philippines and its people.

10 Republic Act (RA) 10121 or the “Philippine Disaster Risk Reduction and Management Act of 2010” is a law that institutionalises the strengthening of the country’s DRR and DRM system by providing a national framework, plan, and funds for its implementation from the local to national levels.
LGUs in the Philippines was established and inaugurated in 2011 in Albay under the auspices of CIRCA and APSEMO. It is the first institution in the country that provides education, research, training and public awareness programs pertaining to climate change adaptation and disaster risk reduction. It envisions for ‘a world-renowned Academy on CCA and DRR towards the development of empowered, socially-responsible and resilient communities’ (Daep 2014).

The Academy was created upon the initiatives of different government and private institutions such as the Provincial Government of Albay (PGA), the Bicol University, UN System, Agencia Española de Cooperacion International para el Desarrollo (AECID), the Office of the President, Climate Change Commission, University of the Philippines Los Baños (UPLB), International Centre for Agroforestry, CLIM System Limited, University of Sunshine Coast - Australia, and various national government agencies such as the Department of Science and Technology, Department of Environment and Natural Resources, Department of National Defense through the Office of Civil Defense (OCD), Department of Interior and Local Government, and the Department of Agriculture (Climate Change Academy, Undated).

Hosted by its partner the Bicol University, the Academy’s training programs that are designed for executive positions in LGUs around the country as well as public officials down to the village level have the overall learning goals as follows:

- Orient participants on how climate system works, with focus on large-scale features and processes that are relevant to social and individual decision-making;
- Provide a general overview of the dynamics of the environment with society and how such interaction can be modified and managed with the use of modern climate information;
- Introduce intervention techniques for climate change adaptation initiatives relevant to their context or areas of concern, and;
- Introduce plans on disaster risk reduction and management relevant to their context or areas of concern. (Climate Change Academy, Undated)
In order to achieve the set vision and goals of the Academy, Figure 4 describes the logical framework where education and training is among the four final outputs.

**Figure 4** Climate Change Academy Logical Framework

Despite being young in its program implementation, the Academy has been serving other LGUs by means of providing education and training and technical inputs to their DRRM plans. These engagements fall under the Education and Training, and the Extension Services and Advocacy programs.

Because of its close working relationship with the OCD and APSEMO especially in the pre-disaster phase of the DRRM continuum, the Academy has now been renamed as the Climate Change Adaptation and Disaster Risk Reduction and Management Training Institute (CCADRRMTI). This action is considered to further institutionalize the functions of the Academy as a training ground for LGUs (GE1 Interview, 3 July 2014). While the OCD serves as the Secretariat of the Provincial DRRM Council (PDRRMC), APSEMO acts as the permanent disaster risk management office (DRMO) in Albay. The Memorandum of Agreement signed by the OCD and the Provincial Government of Albay (PGA) in March 2014 officially launched the country’s first training institution, combining the Climate Change Academy and the APSEMO. According to the governor, this transition ‘further elevated the legal and technical status of the Academy… and is designated as a training institute of OCD and the NDRRMC, under RA 10121, for Southern Tagalog (Luzon), Bicol and the Visayas’ (Salceda 2014).
The Training Course: Education for Disaster Risk Reduction

The specific training course that will be analyzed in this paper is the ‘Disaster Risk Reduction and Management and Climate Change Adaptation Training’, which was organized in seven batches from mid-2012 to early 2013 in Albay. The four-day certificate training course was envisaged to provide professional and technical training and education for managers and professionals working in national government agencies, LGUs including the village councils (Sangguniang Barangay), and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) who have a track record in working with LGUs in Southern Luzon including Bicol and the Visayas – all of which are identified as highly vulnerable to disasters (Center for Environmental Geomatics - Manila Observatory 2005).

Course Content, Design and Pedagogy

The content of the course is divided into themes per day which are: 1) Understanding Disaster Risk; 2) Approaches, Principles and Laws in DRR and CCA; 3) Engaging Stakeholders; and 4) Ways forward and Field Visit. Participatory training methods were used such as interactive lectures, case presentations, group dynamics and workshops, individual reflections and exercises, and scenario building and simulations. These mixed approaches of the Academy training program emphasized the role of the mentor as merely an enabler and a starter of the thinking process (Climate Change Academy, Undated). This clearly supports what Kelman, Mercer, and Karlsson (2014) argued that:

‘Education should not be a one-way, but instead should be about education through cooperation, so that people can set and create their own pathways by combining their own knowledge and concerns with those being brought in from outside.’ (Kelman, Mercer, and Karlsson 2014, 97)

According to the informants of the Tracer Study, the top three most effective methods/approaches used in the training are the following (order according to preference): 1) workshop/group work/brainstorming; 2) lecture and PowerPoint presentations; and 3) field exposure/visits. The training design itself fosters the importance of learning exchanges between the academe (science/theory) and the communities (practice) themselves by bringing together resource speakers from both fields of practice in DRR. The participants were able to locate the lessons learned from the training in everyday life through a field exposure that was organized at the last day of the training which was dedicated to field exposure attempts to bring the lessons closer to reality.

---

11 Participants who completed the training will be given a certificate from the Academy which is a 3-unit credit in a post graduate program on MA in Public Administration major in Emergency Health and Disaster Management being offered in Bicol University Graduate School.
The pedagogical approach used by the Academy is the ‘Albay as a natural laboratory’ (Daep 2014; Salceda 2012) where past disaster experiences of the province are put into use. As Bicol University’s basic premise in building partnership with the Academy, the LGUs as the ‘first on the ground’ in all phased in the DRRM continuum is a crucial element in providing ‘education to build resilient communities’. That is why it is important for the Academy to involve the LGUs from different cities/municipalities especially the Sangguniang Barangay (SB) officials to participate in trainings.

Impact of the Academy: From lessons learned to behavior change?

Gained Capacities on Knowledge and Skills

The results of the Tracer Study show that the knowledge and skills gained from the training have contributed to the overall DRR strategy of Albay as shown in Tables 1 and 2.

Table 1 Results of Tracer Study on Knowledge Gained

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Knowledge Gained</th>
<th>Frequency of Knowledge Mentioned</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hazard and risk awareness</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contingency planning</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hazard and resource mapping</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concepts and terms on DRR and CCA</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capability and vulnerability assessment</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning and budgeting</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early warning system</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternative livelihood</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response and rehabilitation process</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental protection</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy conservation</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender in DRR</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Networking</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Summary of results of Tracer Study questionnaire and interviews.
Table 2 Results of Tracer Study on Skills Learned

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Skills Learned</th>
<th>Frequency of Skills Mentioned</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Risk communication</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Survival</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decision making</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identification of alternative livelihoods</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critical thinking</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizational development and management</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capability and vulnerability assessment</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hazard and risk mapping</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contingency planning</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning and budgeting</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early warning system</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adaptation</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barangay/village engagement</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Summary of results of Tracer Study questionnaire and interviews

The development of capacities on critical thinking, problem solving and other social and emotional skills that is essential in people’s survival in times of disasters (Lopez-Carresi, Fordham, Wisner, Kelman, and Gaillard 2014) has been manifested by the results of the Tracer Study. The skills and knowledge outlined in Tables 1 and 2 are necessary capacities to undertake all actions required to successful DRRM program especially in terms of preparing the local people to the onslaught of any types of disaster risks. The informants of the Tracer Study who function as the first responder to disasters felt that the training enhanced their basic knowledge and skills in DRRM, taking into consideration the personal lessons learned from their experiences in previous disasters.

As the data suggest in Table 1, increased awareness on hazards, risks, vulnerability, and capability are the most learned knowledge from the training attended. Based from the power point presentation materials used for the training, multiple hazards such as typhoons, tsunami/storm surge, flooding, and lava/mud flow, among others, that pose risk to the province were used as examples to describe the concepts explained.
This set of learning is crucial as these four concepts define what disaster is in the context of Albay and that these inform policies and practice on how disaster risk reduction can be done in communities. For example, the case of the 2006 Typhoon Reming disaster was an unforgettable experience for the entire population of Albay because it showed how vulnerable the province is during extreme hazard events such as volcanic eruption followed by prolonged raining and typhoons.

It was noted in the Tracer Study interviews that the practicality of the content of the training modules especially in the workshop activities and the experiential approach to knowledge sharing as expressed by all the trainees interviewed strengthened the needed capacities through ‘learning by doing’ exercises. As Schank, Berman, and Macpherson (1999) argued regarding the experiential aspect of learning, the most important goal of the theory ‘learning by doing’ is to ‘foster skill development and learning of factual information in the context of how it will be used’. This has been manifested in the training design where lectures are combined with group work and workshops (e.g., hazard and vulnerability mapping). As one respondent shared, the experiential and practical approach used in the training made it easier for the participants to understand the rather technical topics in DRR and CCA. For example, in terms of practical survival tips in overcoming disaster risks, which were shared during the training, were notably remembered as an important knowledge in DRR, that is:

‘To be able to avoid damage to your house during a strong typhoon, we have to open a window where the wind is coming to avoid a vacuum that will cause too much pressure inside the house and lead to breaking of window panes.

One key example of the ‘learning by doing’ exercise is the demonstration of informants’ knowledge and skill on planning and budgeting. This skill set which are crucial components of the implementation of the DRRM Law is seen as an important learning for all SB officials. It was expressed by all the informants from the SB group that for them to be able to perform their duties in the BDRRMC (Barangay Disaster Risk Reduction and Management), they have to gain knowledge about concepts in DRRM (i.e., disaster risks and hazards, resources and capabilities, vulnerability) so that they can locate these in their own communities and consequently plan and appropriate budget for their plans through the calamity fund of the LGU’s internal revenue allotment (IRA). As a former barangay treasurer in Ligao City explained:

‘Dati, daeng sistema ki pag-release kan calamity fund kapag may minaabot na bagyo. Pagkatapos kaitung training kan Climate Change Academy sa paagi kang budget planning na piggibo mi duman, aram mi na kung paano gastuson ang budget kan samuyang barangay. (Before the training of the Climate Change Academy, there was no proper system in terms of the release of the calamity fund during typhoons. The training gave me the proper skills and knowledge in terms of proper budget appropriation and spending through the workshops that we did in the training.)'}
As mandated by the DRRM Law, the allocation for the local DRRM fund (LDRRMF) should not be less than 5 per cent of the estimated revenue from regular sources (i.e. IRA) which 30 per cent for pre-disaster and 70 per cent for post-disaster activities should be appropriated and spent by the BDRRMC. In the provincial level, the DRRM and CCA programs which includes the ‘Zero Casualty’ policy of the province is being allocated 9 per cent of the annual budget (Salceda 2012).

This crucial learning from the point of view of the barangay official coming from a city that is vulnerable to flooding, landslide, and mudflow has been supported by another officer from a barangay in the Municipality of Malinao which has the same risks said:

‘Ngunyan aram mi na ang breakdown kan calamity fund iyu ini: 30% para sa Quick Response tapos 70% para sa prerasyon (Now we know that the calamity fund of the barangay should be allocated accordingly according to the 30% for quick response and 70% for preparations breakdown).’

Another key result that has been observed from the Tracer Study interviews is the integration of indigenous knowledge into ways of predicting hazards, which are usually explained by science. According to some of the informants, it was considered helpful for practical knowledge and skills enhancement especially in communities. Some of the examples that were shared in the study and interviews are the following:

- ‘Calm before the storm’ → ‘Area is in the eye of the storm’
- ‘When wild animals come down from Mayon Volcano, it is abnormal and will erupt soon’ → Emission of white steam plumes, rockfall events, edifice inflation from (January 2012) baseline are signs of increased volcanic activity
- ‘When ants start to build houses in higher places, there will be flooding’ → soil saturation

However, while all respondents felt that the training has provided knowledge and skills, all interviewed from the PGA except for one expressed that the impact of the training should also consider the already strong DRRM ‘training’ of the local people especially the government officials through regular occurrence of typhoons, for example. As one informant explained: ‘Luto na ang mga Albayanos kaya review na lang sainda ang training (The Albay people know about DRRM so the training is only a review to them)’. The same informant however added that the repetition of knowledge reinforces skills and values that are crucial for successful DRR efforts. Another informant stressed that: ‘Even before the training of the Academy, I have attended the first batch of training on emergency paramedics for the Albay Health Emergency Management System (AHEMS) so I have a basic understanding about disasters and hazards, but
the training broadens my knowledge and skills’. The new capacities gained and the ones that were already learned prior to the Academy’s training program contribute altogether to the achievement of the ‘Zero Casualty’ goal.

‘Zero Casualty’ Goal as Center of Organizational Interaction

The anchor of the education for DRR (EDRR) programs in the Province of Albay as it appears in the Tracer Study interviews is the ‘Zero Casualty’ strategy. The merits of the policy in terms of protecting the lives of the local people are well regarded and followed by all the informants.

In the training program mentioned in Section 3.2, the content of the training module discussed about the various elements and procedures that can be done toward achieving ‘Zero Casualty’ goal. Early warning and evacuation are considered to be crucial elements for the policy. The fatal 2006 Mayon landslide was a strong justification to reinforce the ‘Zero Casualty’ policy and that it forced local people to act without much pressure from the government. ‘People don’t need to be told to evacuate because they follow the policy by heart and that they don’t want the 2006 tragedy to happen again in the future’.

The combined efforts of APSEMO and the Academy through its awareness-raising programs and the built sense of ownership of the people to the goal maintained the ‘Zero Casualty’ status of the Albay from 2012 to November 2014. The success of the Albay Model as demonstrated by the innovative policy on ‘Zero Casualty’ has been recognized by the people of Albay, especially the LGUs and has in fact received accolades from the Philippine President Benigno Aquino III when he cited Albay as a model in DRRM during his State of the Nation Address speech in July 2014, days after Typhoon Rammasun (Glenda) ravaged the province and the rest of the Bicol region.

Behavior Change: Disaster Preparedness

Given the lessons learned and the application of these in everyday life, disaster preparedness as a key behavior change among the 11 informants is an obvious outcome of the training program. Table 3 details the changes of behavior that were observed and their corresponding manifestations as expressed in the Tracer Study.
Table 3 Results of Tracer Study on Behavior Change

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Observed Changes</th>
<th>Frequency of Mention</th>
<th>Informants</th>
<th>Manifestations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Sense of preparation                   | 11                   | All        | ● Personal management in household during disasters  
● Enhanced adaptive capacity during interruptions on basic services such as water, electricity, communication  
● Risk mitigation regarding economic losses  
● Alertness to hazards especially typhoons (remembering Typhoon Reming disaster in 2006)  
● Community preparation through appropriate budgeting for DRRM  
● Adherence to ‘Zero Casualty’ Goal through awareness on evacuation protocols  
● Enhance training on emergency paramedics |
| Confidence on role in the government or in the community | 10                   | PGA1, SB2, PGA3, PGA4, PGA5, SB6, SB7, SB8, PGA9, PGA11 | ● Proper appropriation of budget on DRRM programs in the barangay  
● Awareness on laws and policies on DRR and CCA  
● Awareness in role in DRRM especially on specific functions of Barangay Treasurer in planning and budgeting (procurement of calamity goods) |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Observed Changes</th>
<th>Frequency of Mention</th>
<th>Informants</th>
<th>Manifestations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Change in belief about disaster/s              | 9                    | PGA1, SB2, PGA3, PGA4, PGA5, SB6, SB7, SB8, PGA9 | ● Avoidance to disasters can be done  
● Change from Filipino fatalistic trait as ‘bahala na’ (it is up to God) attitude  
● From reactive to proactive approach to disasters  
● From disaster as a way of life to culture of safety |
| Responsiveness to needs of the vulnerable and marginalized | 6                    | PGA1, SB2, PGA3, PGA5, PGA9, PGA11 | ● Integration of women-led livelihood projects in DRRM  
● Integration of ideas on climate resilient crops in agriculture programs for poverty reduction  
● Prioritization of women, children and elderly during evacuation procedures |
| Resilience                                     | 2                    | SB2, PGA5  | ● Integration of women-led livelihood projects in DRRM  
● Integration of ideas on climate resilient crops in agriculture programs for poverty reduction |
| Concern to environment                         | 1                    | PGA3       | Energy conservation in household and workplace  
● Recycling |
| Motivation to learn and do more                | 1                    | PGA3       | ● Contributed to producing information and education campaign materials on climate change with focus on adaptive agriculture  
● Writing a book on DRRM specifically on high risk zones of Albay |

Note: Summary of results of the Tracer Study and individual interviews
The results of the Tracer Study argued that ‘raising the awareness of the people on how their behavior is connected to policy outcomes that affect everyone, and teach them the alternative skills and behavior that lead to outcomes that policymakers intend’ (Weiss 2002, 217) is important in DRRM. This can be seen as how the ‘Zero Casualty’ goal of Albay as a policy and the personal experiences of the people on disasters facilitated behavior change among the informants.

Achieving the desired change in people’s behavior would require understanding of the array of attitudes and external factors that influence ordinary people (Monaghan 2012). Using the socio-ecological model of change, which explains the complex interplay of personal, cultural, and environmental factors that influence the desired behavior change according to cross-cutting factors of information, motivation, ability to act, and norms will attempt to describe the results of the Tracer Study (Table 4).

**Table 4** Capacities Gained According to 4 Cross-cutting Factors in the Socio-Ecological Model of Change

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factors</th>
<th>Capacities Gained</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Information and Knowledge</td>
<td>● Hazard and risk awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>● Contingency planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>● Hazard and resource mapping</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>● Concepts and terms on DRR and CCA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>● Capability and vulnerability assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>● Planning and budgeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>● Early warning system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivation (Attitudes and Beliefs)</td>
<td>● Change of beliefs in disasters: Can be mitigated and avoided</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>● Confidence on role in the government/DRRMC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>● Resilience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>● Needs of the vulnerable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>● Sense of preparation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>● Gender sensitivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>● Environmental concern</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>● Learning by doing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Factors</td>
<td>Capacities Gained</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Ability to Act (Skills, Efficacy and Access) | ● Risk communication  
  ● Survival  
  ● Decision making  
  ● Leadership  
  ● Alternative livelihoods identification  
  ● Organizational development and management  
  ● Critical thinking  
  ● Capability and vulnerability assessment  
  ● Planning and budgeting  
  ● Early warning system  
  ● Hazard and risk mapping  
  ● Adaptation  
  ● Engagement with barangay |
| Norms (Perceived, organizational, socio-cultural) | ● Zero Casualty goal  
  ● Culture of safety  
  ● Indigenous knowledge  
  ● Learning by doing  
  ● Accountability of public officials in times of disasters  
  ● Competitiveness  
  ● Sense of recognition in DRRM |

Note: Summary of results of Tracer Study questionnaire and individual interviews

As presented in the table, it can be argued that capacities built according to the four cross-cutting factors in the matrix somehow are overlapping with each other as skills are linked with the knowledge gained, same way with norms, either perceived or organizational, as these relate to motivations of the individual within the system in which he/she interacts with (Claridad Tanvir 2014). This apparent cross-relationship can be further explained by what Brehm and Rahn (1997) argued that behavioral change toward a common goal depends on the positive association between the level of trust of individuals have for one another and the effective and favorable performance of governments in terms of accountability, flexibility, and innovation in policy making and the inclusion of stakeholders in planning processes (Fazey et al. 2007). Therefore, the personal experiences of people and DRRM policies in place define human agency toward disaster risk reduction.
In this case, the effective implementation of the Albay Model combined with the proven leadership of the Governor and the DRRM institutions that rally behind this serve as an enabling force toward desired behavior change. This in effect creates socio-cultural norms that encourage positive behavior change toward successful disaster risk reduction. These norms often point to how these are described by Governor Salceda (2012; 2014) as the ‘culture of safety in Albay’ in his public speeches and interviews and by the Academy and APSEMO chief who defined ‘DRR as a way of life’ (Daep 2008, 11). This philosophy has been standing to support the developmental and DRR targets of Albay.

Conclusion

The developmental framework of the Albay Model that guided the process of institutionalization of disaster risk reduction and management in Albay has shaped the quality of education and training programs and activities of the Climate Change Academy. The proven leadership of the local executives of DRRM institutions such as the APSEMO and CIRCA led by the governor influenced the impact made by the Academy in terms of building the capacities of the participants as demonstrated by the knowledge and skills observed in the Tracer Study. These capacities have been instrumental in the identified changes in the informants’ personal behavior, which are needed as they function in their respective communities and in their workplace. Further, these changes have also contributed to improving their personal management in their own households and communities regarding disaster preparation.

The interplay of different factors present in the society influenced the establishment or the strengthening of the desired changes as a result of the education-training program. The changes identified in the Tracer Study have been guided by the overall value system in the province that prioritizes the safety of the people during impending disasters. The ‘Zero Casualty’ strategy and the ‘safe and shared development’ which make up the Albay Model serve as the overarching principles of the province in defining the overall direction of the DRRM initiatives, particularly in building the capacities of people.

While the results of the study demonstrated positive behavioral changes, it would be necessary to expand this study in order to test these findings in a larger data sample and perhaps capture an even larger context that hopes to analyse the changes to other participants coming from other provinces.
References


Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. 2012. Managing the risks of extreme events and disasters to advance climate change adaptation: A special report of working groups I and II of the intergovernmental panel on climate change. Cambridge, UK and New York, USA: Cambridge University Press.


Book Review Essay

Sida Sornsri*
sidapols@gmail.com

This book, “The making of Southeast Asia,” is composed of 9 chapters. The introduction in chapter one covers region, regionalism and regional identity which concentrate on unity in diversity, interaction and identity. The author explores the issue of identity in the international relations of Southeast Asia, which is understood as “Regional Identity.” He argues “the regionness and regional identity have lurked beneath the surface of major issues in the foreign policy and international relations of Southeast Asia States.” I agreed with the author’s major issues, such as the end of the Vietnam War, the Vietnamese invasion of Cambodia and the birth of globalization that brought the Southeast Asia establishing the ASEAN just for bargaining power.

The questions, such as “Who are Southeast Asians?” and “What is the typical and appropriate Southeast Asian way of doing things?” were mentioned by the author. I think that these are the crucial factors influencing the intraregional ASEAN which affect ASEAN at the present and the future.

Regarding *unity in diversity*, the author urged that, Southeast Asian Countries have diversities in cultural, historical, economic and political matters, for this is why there have been so few scholars who attempted to study the region systematically. I do agree, to some extent, ASEAN is different from the European Union in the case of Supra–National. The EU has Supra–National to control the member states. The EU started with economic cooperation by introducing security in the region order to build economic cooperation. Security in this sense means political amalgamation of which member states should have shared values, assimilation in one Europe by communication continually in order to achieve economic cooperation with creating Supra–National. While ASEAN on the other hand, started with political issues for a long time before the member states initiated economic cooperation. ASEAN was organized by cooperation system in ASEAN Way, which cooperated and coordinated loosely, with no

---

* Southeast Asian Expert and Dean of College of Politics and Governance, Mahasarakham University
interference each from one another. But it does not mean that scholars do not study the region systematically. They have studied the specific issues and prospects deeply in some areas such as political, historical, economic and social aspects. We have diversity and should recognize diversity (Dieter Evers, 1980). Diversity can be developed into cooperation in the long run.

Chapter 2 presents a conceptual framework for understanding regions, drawing upon both the emergent social science perspective on regions and the area studies literature on Southeast Asia. The literature that he reviewed found out that nation states of Southeast Asia might be imagined and socially constructed. Regarding the term of “imagined,” it means that territorial and functional interactions are by themselves inadequate to constitute a region in the absence of an idea of the region. By socially constructed, although identity are not givens, but result primarily from self–conscious socialization among the leaders and peoples of a region. I agree that in the case of “imagination” that ASEAN is absent of this idea of the region, although the leaders try to raise the consciousness. This is because of cultural diversity which the people cannot get along with. So it is an imagined ASEAN. For socially constructed, at this time regional coherence and identity have already been given but for the region is what the politician and people want them to be. Nation – State cannot be viable without a sense of nationalism and region cannot be a region without a sense of regionalism and common interest. At the same time nationalism will be considered the sense of regionalism.

Chapter 3 covers imagining Southeast Asia, which the author does not agree with the literature of Southeast Asia that paid little attention to its pre–colonial interstate system. The Argument of this literature review is summarized in similarity and differences among the states and societies in the region, in terms of their physical attributes, sociocultural characteristics, domestic political and economic systems, which construct an identity of Southeast Asia.

Chapter 4 looks at the interrelationship between nationalism, regionalism and the Cold War international order in Southeast Asia and its contribution to the idea of region. The author reviews pros and cons of the literature on this topic. He began with the literature of post–war Southeast Asia, pointing out that the two most important factors affecting regionalism and international relations in the immediate postwar years were the decolonization process itself and the problems of creating national identity within the former colonial boundaries and the obstacles of regionalism in general.

Chapter 5 looks at the circumstances surrounding the emergence of ASEAN, the development of its political, security and economic cooperation, as well as the relationship between Southeast Asia and the outside powers. The Cambodian conflict helped to accelerate the powers of socialization and norm – setting in the region, while Vietnam remained isolated and excluded from this process. The author concentrated on the norm of the ASEAN Way. I think this norm is still practiced until this day. This is the cooperation system of which the members cooperate loosely in ASEAN Way.
Chapter 6 focuses on the ASEAN-Indochina divide, by discussing and concluding the domestic, intra-regional and international forces that end the polarization of Southeast Asia. It states the ASEAN and the Vietnam Conflict, East Asian Regionalization and Southeast Asia together with the concept of the ASEAN Way.

Because of the ASEAN Way, the reliance on *Musyawarah* (consultation) and *Mufakat* (consensus), the ASEAN members avoid of formal mechanisms and legalistic procedures, it cannot be the module of European Union Style of which they can enforce the rules and regulations of the members by Supra-National, this is the sign of weakness of ASEAN Cooperation that author should explain clearly more on the European as comparing with ASEAN.

Chapter 7 examines the international relations of Southeast Asia from the end of Cold War and the Paris Peace Agreement on Cambodia (1991) until the outbreak of the financial crisis in Thailand in 1977. This chapter indicates the political settlement of the Cambodian conflict and the ASEAN’s ability to manage regional order. This is the beginning of member states ability to think about ASEAN Communication in building a regional identity, one Southeast Asia concept, which brings about a picture of unified Southeast Asia in chapter 7. By the end of the Cold War, through fundamental changes to the international relations of building the identity of Southeast Asia, Vietnam became ASEAN’s seventh members in July 1995, Laos and Myanmar were admitted in 1997 and Cambodia’s entry was accepted in 1999. Regarding the entry of the new members, it created the problems of ASEAN as a whole because the levels of development are not equal.

Chapter 8 examines some of the most pressing challenge to the regional concept of Southeast Asia since the Asian economic crisis that began in mid-1997. This chapter explains the crisis posed a critical test of regionalism in shaping international relations of the region in competition with wider regional and global trends. The author ends up with the grouping of East Asian Community with the rise of China. The more interesting issue in this chapter is Civil Society in Southeast Asia, which consists of official regionalism and non-official regionalism. Especially, a non-official regionalism gave birth to the social movement in the region.

Chapter 9 the author concludes that in the future ASEAN should be one ASEAN, which would become a single identity and single market, a more realistic vision in 2015.

To conclude on reviewing about this book, it is an outstanding overview of the international politics of the region, which attempts to discern the conceptual meaning of Southeast Asia’s efforts to force its own identity by reviewing the literature concerned and conclude the possibility of ASEAN regionalism. However it would be extremely invaluable if the author could look into the conceptual frameworks of the European Union and compare it deeply to the ASEAN Regionalism in order to compare differences of the two regions.
แบบเสนอบทความ
เพื่อดำลัยในการส่งต่อผลงานวิจัย คณะนิติศาสตร์ จุฬาลงกรณ์มหาวิทยาลัย

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>บทความวิจัย</th>
<th>บทความปริทัศน์</th>
<th>บทวิจารณ์หนังสือ</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

ชื่อบทความ
ภาษาไทย........................................................................................................................................................................

ภาษาอังกฤษ...................................................................................................................................................................

ชื่อ/นามสกุลผู้เขียน (ตัวบรรจุ)
ภาษาไทย........................................................................................................................................................................

ภาษาอังกฤษ...................................................................................................................................................................

หน่วยงาน (สังกัด)
........................................................................................................................................................................

ตำแหน่งทางวิชาการ (ถ้ามี)
........................................................................................................................................................................

ตำแหน่งบริหาร (ถ้ามี)
........................................................................................................................................................................

ที่อยู่ที่สามารถติดต่อด้วยสะดวก
บ้านเลขที่.......................................ซอย...............................................ถนน...................................................................
แขวง ...............................................เขต................................................จังหวัด...............................................................
รหัสไปรษณีย์ ................................E-mail:.......................................................................................................................
โทรศัพท์ ...................................................................โทรศัพท์มือถือ..............................................................................

ข้าพเจ้าขอรับรองว่าบทความดังกล่าวเป็นของข้าพเจ้าจริงโดยไม่ได้คัดลอก หรือละเมิดลิขสิทธิ์ของผู้ใด
รวมทั้งไม่เคยตีพิมพ์ในวารสารอื่นใดมาก่อน และไม่อยู่ระหว่างการพิจารณาตีพิมพ์ในวารสารอื่นภายใน 2 เดือน นับจากวันที่ทางกองบรรณาธิการได้รับต้นฉบับ

ลงชื่อ........................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................

กองบรรณาธิการวารสารสังคมศาสตร์
คณะนิติศาสตร์ จุฬาลงกรณ์มหาวิทยาลัย
ถนนอังรีดูนังต์ แขวงวังใหม่ เขตปทุมวัน กรุงเทพฯ 10330
โทรศัพท์ 08-0626-0299
http://www.library.polsci.chula.ac.th/journal e-mail: cusocscij@gmail.com

ปีที่ 45 ฉบับที่ 1 มกราคม–มิถุนายน 2558 153
คำแนะนำสำหรับผู้เขียนบทความ
เพื่อตีพิมพ์ในวารสารสังคมศาสตร์ คณะรัฐศาสตร์ จุฬาลงกรณ์มหาวิทยาลัย

วารสารสังคมศาสตร์ (Journal of Social Sciences) พิจารณาตีพิมพ์บทความทั้งภาษาไทยและภาษาอังกฤษ ประเภทบทความวิจัย (Research Article) บทความปริทัศน์ (Review Article) และบทความวิชาการประเภทอื่นที่มีเนื้อหาวิชาการทางรัฐศาสตร์ การเมืองการปกครอง ความสัมพันธ์ระหว่างประเทศ สังคมวิทยาและการเมืองวิทยา รัฐประศาสนศาสตร์ และสาขาอื่นที่เกี่ยวข้อง ที่ไม่เคยตีพิมพ์หรือไม่อยู่ระหว่างการพิจารณาเพื่อตีพิมพ์ในสิ่งพิมพ์วิชาการใด

รายละเอียดบทความ ประกอบด้วย
1. ชื่อบทความ ชื่อ-สกุล ตำแหน่งทางวิชาการ (ถ้ามี) และชื่อหน่วยงานหรือสถาบันที่ผู้เขียนสังกัด และคำสำคัญ (keywords) ไม่เกิน 5 คำ
2. ขนาดความยาวของเนื้อหาบทความวิจัย (Research article) และบทความปริทัศน์ (Review article) ระหว่าง 15-25 หน้า และบทความวิชาการอื่น ๆ (Book review) ความยาวประมาณ 7-10 หน้า กระดาษ A4 พิมพ์ด้วยโปรแกรม Microsoft Word รูปแบบตัวอักษร Cordia New ขนาดตัวอักษร 16 pt. ระยะระหว่างบรรทัด (single space)
3. บทความต้องมีบทคัดย่อทั้งภาษาไทยและภาษาอังกฤษ วางตำแหน่งของบทคัดย่อภาษาอังกฤษก่อน บทคัดย่อภาษาไทย จำนวนไม่น้อยกว่า 150 คำ และไม่เกิน 200 คำ
4. หากเป็นงานแปลหรือเรียบเรียงจากภาษาต่างประเทศต้องมีหลักฐานการได้รับอนุญาตให้ตีพิมพ์เป็นลายลักษณ์อักษรจากเจ้าของลิขสิทธิ์
5. ต้นฉบับที่มีตารางต้องมีชื่อตาราง คำอธิบายตารางและที่มาด้วย สำหรับต้นฉบับที่มีภาพประกอบของผู้เขียนหรือได้รับอนุญาตได้ตีพิมพ์ได้ โปรดส่งไฟล์ภาพแยกต่างหากจากต้นฉบับโดยให้แนบเป็นไฟล์สกุล .jpg หรือ .gif หรือ .png เป็นต้น โดยมีความละเอียดอย่างน้อย 150 dpi เพื่อความคมชัดในการพิมพ์
6. ส่งต้นฉบับโดยกรอกแบบฟอร์มการส่งบทความเพื่อพิจารณาตีพิมพ์ในวารสารสังคมศาสตร์ พร้อมผลงานได้ทาง http://www.library.polsci.chula.ac.th/journal_submission/
7. ในกรณีที่ผู้เขียนต้องการทราบผลการพิจารณาบทความ ต้องแจ้งเป็นลายลักษณ์อักษรให้กองบรรณาธิการทราบล่วงหน้าอย่างน้อย 7 วันที่พิจารณาตัดสินแล้วได้รับแจ้งผลการพิจารณาบทความ

เกณฑ์การพิจารณาบทความที่เสนอเพื่อพิจารณาตีพิมพ์จะได้รับการพิจารณาเป็นต้นด้วยโดยกองบรรณาธิการภายใน 1 เดือนหลังจากได้รับต้นฉบับ

1. ผู้เขียนต้องอยู่ในระหว่างการศึกษาการศึกษาในระดับปริญญาตรี
2. บทความต้องมีความน่าสนใจและมีคุณค่าทางวิชาการทั้งในระดับประเทศและระดับนานาชาติ
3. บทความต้องมีความถูกต้องตามจริงและมีความน่าเชื่อถือ

การอ้างอิง
ใช้การอ้างอิงแบบนาม-ปี (Author-date citation system) และการเขียนเอกสารอ้างอิง (Reference) แบบ The Chicago Manual of Style ดังนี้

(Wilson 2011, 261)
(Dorothy and Clay 2010, 237)
(อุดมทุมโฆสิต 2552, 113)
(ผาสุกพงษ์ไพจิตรและคริสเบเคอร์ 2546, 97)

หนังสือ

ผาสุกพงษ์ไพจิตรและคริสเบเคอร์. 2546. เศรษฐกิจการเมืองไทยสมัยกรุงเทพฯ. พิมพ์ครั้งที่ 3 แก้ไขปรับปรุง. เชียงใหม่: Silkworm Books.

วารสาร


นิตยสาร/หนังสือพิมพ์


วิทยานิพนธ์

แหล่งข้อมูลอิเล็กทรอนิกส์
Author Guidelines
Journal of Social Sciences, Faculty of Political Science, Chulalongkorn University

Manuscript Submission

The Journal of Social Sciences seeks original and academic papers, namely research articles, review articles, book reviews and other types of academic articles written in Thai or English that fall within the scope of political science, government, international relations, sociology, anthropology, public administration and related fields. Articles submitted to Journal of Social Sciences should be original contributions and should not be under consideration by any other publication at the same time.

Instructions to Contributors

1. All manuscripts must include: the title of the manuscript; the author’s name, academic position (if applicable) and affiliated institution; and up to five keywords.
2. Research and review articles in principle must be no more than 8,000 words in length, including references. The length of book reviews must be no more than 3,000 words. Articles must be in MS Word format, using the 12-point Times New Roman font, and single spaced.
3. All manuscripts must include an abstract that is between 200 and 500 words in length.
4. Articles translated or excerpted from foreign language texts must obtain a written permission from the copyright holder.
5. When tables are used, the title, description and source must be clearly stated. Any pictures or photographs included must not infringe on copyright laws. Pictures or photographs should be sent in separate files saved in .jpg, .gif or .png format. The image resolution should be at least 150 dpi.
6. All manuscripts and completed Manuscript Proposal Forms must be submitted electronically as separate attachments to http://www.library.polsci.chula.ac.th/journal_submission/
7. In the case that the author wishes to withdraw from publication an approved article, the request must be expressed in writing to the editorial board within at least 7 days after the approval of the said article.
Evaluation Process

1. The Editorial Board will give a preliminary review of all received manuscripts within one month of their submission.
2. Accepted manuscripts will then be peer-reviewed by 2-3 reviewers. This process will take approximately one month. Manuscripts will then be returned to the authors for any necessary correction.

Parenthetical Citation

Use the basic author-date citation system.

Examples:

(Wilson 2011, 261)
(Dorothy and Clay 2010, 237)

References

Use The Chicago Manual of Style.

Examples:

Book

Journal
Magazine/Newspaper


Dissertation


Electronics Sources

ใบสมัครสมาชิก
วารสารสังคมศาสตร์ คณะรัฐศาสตร์ จุฬาลงกรณ์มหาวิทยาลัย

กรุณากรอกรายการละเอียด
ชื่อ-สกุล (นาย/นาง/นางสาว) .................................................................
หน่วยงานสังกัด ..........................................................................................
ที่อยู่สำหรับจัดส่งวารสาร ........................................................................
โทรศัพท์ ................................................................. โทรสาร .........................................................
E-mail ........................................................................................................

สนใจสมัครสมาชิกวารสารในรูปแบบ
☐ ฉบับพิมพ์ 200 บาท/ปี สมัครสมาชิกปีที่ ............... ฉบับที่ ...............
☐ ฉบับพิมพ์ + ฉบับอิเล็กทรอนิกส์ (web + iPad) 300 บาท/ปี
สมัครสมาชิกปีที่ ............... ฉบับที่ ...............

ชำระค่าสมาชิกวารสารโดย
☐ โอนเงิน
ชื่อบัญชี คณะรัฐศาสตร์ จุฬาลงกรณ์มหาวิทยาลัย เลขที่บัญชี 045-2-06661-0
ธนาคาร ไทยพาณิชย์ สาขาสภากาชาดไทย
(กรุณาส่งหลักฐานการโอนเงินโดยแฟกซ์มาที่ 02-218-7331 หรือส่งมาอย่าง cusocscij@gmail.com)

กองบรรณาธิการวารสารสังคมศาสตร์
คณะรัฐศาสตร์ จุฬาลงกรณ์มหาวิทยาลัย
ถนนอังรีดูนังต์ แขวงวังใหม่ เขตปทุมวัน กรุงเทพฯ 10330
โทรศัพท์ 02-218-7336 โทรสาร 02-218-7331
http://www.library.polsci.chula.ac.th/journal e-mail: cusocscij@gmail.com
Academic Articles

Revisiting democratization in Myanmar and Indonesia from a comparative perspective
Nguyen Thi Anh Thu

Renewable energy development and environmental justice in Thailand: A case of biomass power plant in Roi-Et province
Yeji Yoo

The emergence of Public-Private-Social Partnership (PPSP) in Very Small Power Producer (VSPP) industry: A case study of Mae Jo Micro-Hydro Power project: The implication for environmental governance
Thita Orn-in

Social enterprise and promotion of safe migration among returned migrants: Case studies of a credit union in Bone district of South Sulawesi province Indonesia
Fatimana Agustinanto

Christian faith–based development: A case study of World Vision Foundation of Thailand in Karen hilltribe communities
Yee Kai Ling, Phoebe

Thailand’s move from a pity to a rights-based understanding of disability
Michelle Prayor

Transformative pedagogy: An evaluation of the use of the Learning to Live Together (LTLT) principles in higher secondary schools in Thailand
Muara Cusack
Claudine Claridad Tanvir

Education for disaster risk reduction toward change: The case of the ‘Climate Change Academy’ in Albay province, Philippines
Claudine Claridad Tanvir

Book Review Essay

Sida Sornsri